

NOTES

Chapter 1

1. See Pitt-Rivers, "Pseudo-kinship."

2. Montaigne discusses societies supposed not to have ordinary incest taboos (*Essais*, in *Oeuvres*, ed. Thibaudet and Rat, bk. 1, chap. 23, p. 113). Charron agrees the incest taboo is a "mere custom" that "mastereth our souls, our beliefs, our judgements, with a most unjust and tyrannical authority" (*Of Wisdome*, p. 310). Cf. Sánchez, *Quod Nihil Scitur* (1581), ed. Comparot, p. 78.

3. Bachofen, in his *Mutterrecht*, made the absolute certainty of the mother-child link the basis of a social anthropology that survives to this day. On the "Fiktions-bedeutung der Paternität," see Bachofen, *Mutterrecht*, in *Werke* 2:57 p. 57. Bachofen also writes that "der Vater ist stets eine juristische Fiktion, die Mutter dagegen eine physische Tatsache: (*mater*) *semper certa est, etiamsi vulgo conceperit, patero vero is tantum [sic], quem nuptiae demonstrant* [citing Julius Paulus, *Dig.* 2, 4, 5]" and that "die Mutter is nun stets sicher . . ." (*Mutterrecht*, in *Werke*, 2:102, 118 pp. 102, 118). Engels, *Origin of the Family* (1884), intro. Barrett, p. 71, writes that "in all forms of group family, it is uncertain who is the father of a child; but it is certain who its mother is" and attributes this view to Bachofen. This view of female descent Engels emphasizes also in the preface to the fourth edition (1891). I would take issue here with the traditional view, summarized in the gist of Alan Grossman's scholium on the terms *mother* and *father*, namely, that "you know who is the mother. You do not know who is the father" (Grossman, "Primer," §42, pp. 119–21).

4. The debate involving politics (Orestes) and family (Clytemnestra) in Aeschylus' *Oresteia* is ended by the argument of the virgin goddess Athena (born from the head of Zeus), who proclaims that since "no mother gave me birth, only the male of the human species is the begetter" (*Eumenides*, 736). In an Orphic hymn (31.10) Athena is called both male and female, and in a Homeric hymn (9.3) she is called a virgin divinity (W. Smith, *Dictionary* [1967] s.v. "Athena"). Athena's argument was backed by Aristotle's view that in human reproduction "the male provides the form and the principle of the movement; the female provides the body, in other words the material" (*Generation*, 1.2 729a). See also Plato's similar view of the male Eros of begetting (*Timaeus*, 73, 90–91) and related evidence collected by Onians (*Origin of European Thought*, pp. 108–9). In Anaxagoras the mother is merely the "breeding ground" and the father is "the seed"; in Diogenes of Apollonia the father, not the mother, provides the offspring (Freeman, *Pre-Socratic Philosophers*, pp. 272, 282). Compare Jesus' claim that only (the male) God is His only parent. In Malinowski's view "the most important moral and legal rule concerning the physiological state of kinship is that no child should be brought into this world without a man—and one man at that—assuming the role

of sociological father, that is, guardian and protector, the male link between the child and the rest of the community. I think that this generalization amounts to a universal sociological law" ("Parenthood," pp. 137–38). Vico states that "with the first human, which is to say chaste and religious, couplings, [humanoid creatures] gave a beginning to matrimony. Thereby they became certain fathers of certain children by certain women" (*New Science*, 1098).

5. On "nominal" incest generally see Crawley, *Mystic Rose*. For a discussion of the purchase of family names in relation to incest, see B. Thomas, "Writer's Procreative Urge in *Pierre*." For incest and kinship by adoption, see chapter 6. On kinship "in law," see chapter 5. One might also include in the list of kinds of pseudokinship or kinship by extension that can make for a diriment impediment to marriage the relationship between trading partners, between feudal lords and their servants, between brothers-in-arms, and so on.

6. Shakespeare, *Hamlet*, 1.2.107–8. For the view that in *Hamlet* there is no one either kin or nonkin but thinking makes him so (cf. *Hamlet*, 2.2.256), see chapter 5.

7. See Matt. 23:8. Christianity's universalist doctrine both incorporates and transcends ordinary kinship by means of an extraordinary unifamilial kinship. Cf. Gal. 3:26–28: "For in Christ Jesus you are all sons [or children] of God. . . . There is neither Jew nor Greek. . . . for ye are all one in Christ Jesus." Church Fathers who urge Christians to obey the implications of Matt. 23:8 in such a way as to call all men their "brothers" and to call no one by the name "father" include Ignatius of Antioch ("To the Ephesians," 10.3); Clement of Alexandria (*Stromata*, 7.14.5); Justinian (*Dialogue with Tryphon*, 96); and Tertullian (*Apologeticus*, 39.8–9).

8. Heraclitus, frag. 93.

9. *Notes and Queries* 5:493, series 7 (1888).

10. For the voice, see Makkot 23b; for Judah bar Ilai, see *Jewish Ency.* 11:439. In a strikingly christological misprision of the Judgment of Solomon, René Girard even fails to notice the tale's literal significance: "The woman who cries, 'Give her the living child and by no means slay it,'" says Girard, "is presented to us as the true mother in the biological sense, which resolves the matter within a family context" (*Things Hidden*, p. 242). Girard says that he has read "the commentaries and that Solomon's judgment is "a possible solution to the dilemma," but, as we have seen, it is not a solution and the commentators say as much. It is worth adding that not only Solomon but also neither of the women could really have known for sure which of them was related consanguineously to the living child.

11. For Hegelian *Aufhebung* (sublation), see esp. chapter 6, the section entitled "Roman Sublation and Christian Oblation," in this volume.

12. One sect practiced gazing at navels as a means of inducing hypnotic reverie. Vaughn (*Hours with the Mystics* 1,272) writes that "they call these devotees Navel-contemplators." For the Holy Umbilical Cord, see Collin de Plancy, *Dictionnaire* 2,45.

13. Browne, *Pseudodoxia Epidemica* 5.5.240.

14. Bryant, *Analysis of Ancient Mythology* 1,245.

15. For the background to this relationship, see chapter 4.

16. *Dormition*, or *koimémsis*, refers to the specific "dying" of the Virgin Mary: she passes from being the mature Mother of God (the infant Son) to being the infant daughter of God (the mature Father), as discussed in the body of church literature called the *Transitus Mariae* (see Lampe, ed., *Patristic Greek Lexicon*). Cf. Warner, *Alone of All Her Sex*, pp. 88–89. The dormition of the Virgin Mary, though generally considered a doctrine of the Eastern Church, is depicted prominently in such public buildings of Western Christendom as La Martorana in Palermo, Sicily, where Jesus gives new life to Mary's infant soul, which resembles a baby in his arms. It is also depicted in such manuscripts as the (probably) British "Winchester

Psalter" of the twelfth century (British Museum Cotton Manuscripts, Nero CIV, folio 29; see Saxl and Wittkower, *British Art and the Mediterranean*, 24.6,7).

Julia Kristeva, citing Dante's well-known line "Vergine Madre, figlia del tuo Figlio," says that "not only is Mary her son's mother and his daughter [as in dormition], she is also his wife. Thus she passes through all three women's stages in the most restricted of all possible kinship systems" ("Stabat Mater," p. 105). But, as we shall see, Mary is also the sister of God the Brother, and it is this Sisterhood which makes equal siblings of all mankind and reaches even beyond the restriction that Kristeva notes.

17. *New York Herald*, August 31, 1868; emphasis mine. For this and other references, see Gillman, *Dark Twins*, esp. pp. 53-73.

18. Wallace, *The Two*.

19. On the freak show, see Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, pp. 45-46, 232, 295.

20. According to Schweitzer (*Herakles*, p. 19) Kteatos and Eurytos, the twin sons of Molione, were originally Siamese twins. For the view that they were originally regular twins, see Farnell, *Greek Hero-Cults*; Farnell argues that the Siamese-twin version of the legend is Hesiodic and hence comparatively late. In Homer, the twins are normal and mortal (*Iliad* 11.750), though sons of Poseidon; they marry and have sons (*Iliad* 2.621). See Smyth, *Greek Melic Poets*, p. 278.

21. The medical anatomist Serres, in his *Theory of Organic Formation and Deformation, Applied to . . . Duplicate Monsters* (1833), which was influenced by Montaigne's "Of a Monstrous Child" (Montaigne, *Essais*, bk. 2, chap. 30; written during the French civil war), says of a set of Siamese twins with four legs and a single head that "there is a perfect unity produced by two distinct individualities. There are sense organs and cerebral hemispheres for a single individual, adapted to the service of two, since it is evident that there are two me's in this single head" (quoted in S.J. Gould, "Living with Connections," p. 75; see also Gillman, *Dark Twins*, p. 61).

22. Mankowicz and Haggart, *Pottery and Porcelain*, p. 202. The Chalkhurst twins died in 1734.

23. For example, see "Tocci Twins," p. 374.

24. For the term "conglomerate," see Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 213.

25. Clemens, *Those Extraordinary Twins*, p. 123.

26. The "Duplicates" in *The Mysterious Stranger* say, "Although we had been born together, at the same moment and of the same womb, there was no spiritual kinship between us" (*Mysterious Stranger*, p. 334). Twain writes of the identical twins in *Pudd'nhead Wilson* that "one was a little fairer than the other, but otherwise they were exact duplicates" (Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 43).

27. It is worth noting that Twain performed the part of one of a pair of Siamese twins at a private dinner party at his home in 1906 (see Gillman, *Dark Twins*, p. 181) and that he died in 1910 murmuring inchoately about the "duplicates" Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde (see Fiedler, *Freaks*, p. 270). Twain discussed the female Siamese twins Millie and Christine—a "wonderful two-headed girl"—in his "People and Things" column in the *Buffalo Express*, Sept. 2, 1869; for other references to Siamese twins in Twain's journalistic writings, see note 127.

28. Twain writes that he "took those [Siamese] twins [of *Those Extraordinary Twins*] apart and made two separate men of them [the identical twins or changelings of *Pudd'nhead Wilson*]." In *Pudd'nhead Wilson*, moreover, the identical twins become Siamese (*Pudd'nhead*, pp. 212, 295, 245). For the boundaries of nation and race, see Clemens, *Those Extraordinary Twins*, pp. 216-17.

29. Anthropological studies at once phonetic and sociological might focus on the sig-

44. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 12.

45. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 12.

46. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 13.

47. There are those who would say, though, that Jocasta did recognize Oedipus early on; see Vellacott, "Guilt of Oedipus."

48. In other places—imperial Rome, medieval Christendom, and eighteenth century France, for example—the number of foundlings raised as foster children was sometimes more than one quarter of the child population. See chapter 5.

49. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 21.

50. See Gillman, *Dark Twins*, p. 74.

51. In *Pudd'nhead Wilson*, alcohol and tea join blood and milk as consubstantial liquids that confer familial identity: Rowena loves the teetotaler Angelo, but she will not marry him because his identical twin brother Luigi drinks to excess and makes Angelo drunk (Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 292).

52. Abraham Lincoln said that "there is a natural disgust in the minds of nearly all white people, to the idea of indiscriminate amalgamation of the white and black races" (in a speech on the Dred Scott decision at Springfield, Illinois, on June 26, 1857; see Lincoln, *Speeches and Writings*, p. 397). One folk etymology of Lincoln's key term *amalgamation* links it with *ama* ("together") and *gamos* ("marriage").

53. On lactation and kinship: Crawley, *Mystic Rose* 2,230; Koran, ch. 4 ("Women"), p. 75; and chapters 5 and 7 below. For the racist argument that blacks are non-human, see section 3. For collactation by goats and other animals: Montaigne, *Essais*, in *Oeuvres*, ed. Thibaudet and Rat, bk. 2, chap. 8, pp. 379–80.

54. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, pp. 266–67.

55. Hanging Luigi means ending the history of "those extraordinary twins" (*Pudd'nhead*, p. 294). Says Luigi: "If I had let the man kill [Angelo], wouldn't he have killed me too. I save my own life, you see" (*Pudd'nhead*, pp. 91–92).

56. Joyce, *Ulysses*, p. 404.

57. The following story is told in the midrashic Tosafot, or gloss, to the Talmudic tractate Menahot (37a): "At King Solomon's court one day an evil spirit Asmodeus presented the great judge with a difficult case. A two-headed man had married a woman who had borne him seven sons. Six of them resembled the mother; but *one* resembled the father in having two heads. After the father's death, the two-headed son claimed two shares of the inheritance. He argued that he was two men. His brothers, however, contended that the two-headed son was entitled to one share only. Solomon, in his wisdom, ruled that the son with two heads was only one man. He rendered judgment in favor of the six brothers." (See Jelinek, *Beit ha-Midrash*, pp. 151–52, and *Jewish Ency.* 11:439, s.v. "Solomon.") There is also the Twain-like case of the slave who claimed he was his master's son (Jelinek, *Beit ha-Midrash*, pp. 145–46).

58. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 6.

59. Galton admitted that fingerprints do not reveal racial grouping (Galton, *Finger Prints*, pp. 1–2, 26).

60. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 193; *Extraordinary Twins*, pp. 150–51.

61. Cf. Gillman, *Dark Twins*, p. 6.

62. Hooper, in a recent *Wall Street Journal* article, "Identification by DNA Said to Be Better" (p. 1), reports that "the British scientist [Alec Jeffreys] credited with devising 'DNA fingerprinting,' a way to identify individuals from their genetic materials, has come up with an alternative method that he says should cause less controversy in courtrooms [than the earlier method devised in 1985]."

63. T.V. Smith and E.C. Lindeman, *Democratic Way*, p. 19.

