

NOTES

Chapter 1

1. See Pitt-Rivers, "Pseudo-kinship."

2. Montaigne discusses societies supposed not to have ordinary incest taboos (*Essais*, in *Oeuvres*, ed. Thibaudet and Rat, bk. 1, chap. 23, p. 113). Charron agrees the incest taboo is a "mere custom" that "mastereth our souls, our beliefs, our judgements, with a most unjust and tyrannical authority" (*Of Wisdome*, p. 310). Cf. Sánchez, *Quod Nihil Scitur* (1581), ed. Comparot, p. 78.

3. Bachofen, in his *Mutterrecht*, made the absolute certainty of the mother-child link the basis of a social anthropology that survives to this day. On the "Fiktions-bedeutung der Paternität," see Bachofen, *Mutterrecht*, in *Werke* 2:57 p. 57. Bachofen also writes that "der Vater ist stets eine juristische Fiktion, die Mutter dagegen eine physische Tatsache: (*mater*) *semper certa est, etiamsi vulgo conceperit, patero vero is tantum [sic], quem nuptiae demonstrant* [citing Julius Paulus, *Dig.* 2, 4, 5]" and that "die Mutter is nun stets sicher . . ." (*Mutterrecht*, in *Werke*, 2:102, 118 pp. 102, 118). Engels, *Origin of the Family* (1884), intro. Barrett, p. 71, writes that "in all forms of group family, it is uncertain who is the father of a child; but it is certain who its mother is" and attributes this view to Bachofen. This view of female descent Engels emphasizes also in the preface to the fourth edition (1891). I would take issue here with the traditional view, summarized in the gist of Alan Grossman's scholium on the terms *mother* and *father*, namely, that "you know who is the mother. You do not know who is the father" (Grossman, "Primer," §42, pp. 119–21).

4. The debate involving politics (Orestes) and family (Clytemnestra) in Aeschylus' *Oresteia* is ended by the argument of the virgin goddess Athena (born from the head of Zeus), who proclaims that since "no mother gave me birth, only the male of the human species is the begetter" (*Eumenides*, 736). In an Orphic hymn (31.10) Athena is called both male and female, and in a Homeric hymn (9.3) she is called a virgin divinity (W. Smith, *Dictionary* [1967] s.v. "Athena"). Athena's argument was backed by Aristotle's view that in human reproduction "the male provides the form and the principle of the movement; the female provides the body, in other words the material" (*Generation*, 1.2 729a). See also Plato's similar view of the male Eros of begetting (*Timaeus*, 73, 90–91) and related evidence collected by Onians (*Origin of European Thought*, pp. 108–9). In Anaxagoras the mother is merely the "breeding ground" and the father is "the seed"; in Diogenes of Apollonia the father, not the mother, provides the offspring (Freeman, *Pre-Socratic Philosophers*, pp. 272, 282). Compare Jesus' claim that only (the male) God is His only parent. In Malinowski's view "the most important moral and legal rule concerning the physiological state of kinship is that no child should be brought into this world without a man—and one man at that—assuming the role

of sociological father, that is, guardian and protector, the male link between the child and the rest of the community. I think that this generalization amounts to a universal sociological law" ("Parenthood," pp. 137–38). Vico states that "with the first human, which is to say chaste and religious, couplings, [humanoid creatures] gave a beginning to matrimony. Thereby they became certain fathers of certain children by certain women" (*New Science*, 1098).

5. On "nominal" incest generally see Crawley, *Mystic Rose*. For a discussion of the purchase of family names in relation to incest, see B. Thomas, "Writer's Procreative Urge in *Pierre*." For incest and kinship by adoption, see chapter 6. On kinship "in law," see chapter 5. One might also include in the list of kinds of pseudokinship or kinship by extension that can make for a diriment impediment to marriage the relationship between trading partners, between feudal lords and their servants, between brothers-in-arms, and so on.

6. Shakespeare, *Hamlet*, 1.2.107–8. For the view that in *Hamlet* there is no one either kin or nonkin but thinking makes him so (cf. *Hamlet*, 2.2.256), see chapter 5.

7. See Matt. 23:8. Christianity's universalist doctrine both incorporates and transcends ordinary kinship by means of an extraordinary unifamilial kinship. Cf. Gal. 3:26–28: "For in Christ Jesus you are all sons [or children] of God. . . . There is neither Jew nor Greek. . . . for ye are all one in Christ Jesus." Church Fathers who urge Christians to obey the implications of Matt. 23:8 in such a way as to call all men their "brothers" and to call no one by the name "father" include Ignatius of Antioch ("To the Ephesians," 10.3); Clement of Alexandria (*Stromata*, 7.14.5); Justinian (*Dialogue with Tryphon*, 96); and Tertullian (*Apologeticus*, 39.8–9).

8. Heraclitus, frag. 93.

9. *Notes and Queries* 5:493, series 7 (1888).

10. For the voice, see Makkot 23b; for Judah bar Ilai, see *Jewish Ency.* 11:439. In a strikingly christological misprision of the Judgment of Solomon, René Girard even fails to notice the tale's literal significance: "The woman who cries, 'Give her the living child and by no means slay it,'" says Girard, "is presented to us as the true mother in the biological sense, which resolves the matter within a family context" (*Things Hidden*, p. 242). Girard says that he has read "the commentaries and that Solomon's judgment is "a possible solution to the dilemma," but, as we have seen, it is not a solution and the commentators say as much. It is worth adding that not only Solomon but also neither of the women could really have known for sure which of them was related consanguineously to the living child.

11. For Hegelian *Aufhebung* (sublation), see esp. chapter 6, the section entitled "Roman Sublation and Christian Oblation," in this volume.

12. One sect practiced gazing at navels as a means of inducing hypnotic reverie. Vaughn (*Hours with the Mystics* 1,272) writes that "they call these devotees Navel-contemplators." For the Holy Umbilical Cord, see Collin de Plancy, *Dictionnaire* 2,45.

13. Browne, *Pseudodoxia Epidemica* 5.5.240.

14. Bryant, *Analysis of Ancient Mythology* 1,245.

15. For the background to this relationship, see chapter 4.

16. *Dormition*, or *koimémsis*, refers to the specific "dying" of the Virgin Mary: she passes from being the mature Mother of God (the infant Son) to being the infant daughter of God (the mature Father), as discussed in the body of church literature called the *Transitus Mariae* (see Lampe, ed., *Patristic Greek Lexicon*). Cf. Warner, *Alone of All Her Sex*, pp. 88–89. The dormition of the Virgin Mary, though generally considered a doctrine of the Eastern Church, is depicted prominently in such public buildings of Western Christendom as La Martorana in Palermo, Sicily, where Jesus gives new life to Mary's infant soul, which resembles a baby in his arms. It is also depicted in such manuscripts as the (probably) British "Winchester

Psalter" of the twelfth century (British Museum Cotton Manuscripts, Nero CIV, folio 29; see Saxl and Wittkower, *British Art and the Mediterranean*, 24.6,7).

Julia Kristeva, citing Dante's well-known line "Vergine Madre, figlia del tuo Figlio," says that "not only is Mary her son's mother and his daughter [as in dormition], she is also his wife. Thus she passes through all three women's stages in the most restricted of all possible kinship systems" ("Stabat Mater," p. 105). But, as we shall see, Mary is also the sister of God the Brother, and it is this Sisterhood which makes equal siblings of all mankind and reaches even beyond the restriction that Kristeva notes.

17. *New York Herald*, August 31, 1868; emphasis mine. For this and other references, see Gillman, *Dark Twins*, esp. pp. 53-73.

18. Wallace, *The Two*.

19. On the freak show, see Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, pp. 45-46, 232, 295.

20. According to Schweitzer (*Herakles*, p. 19) Kteatos and Eurytos, the twin sons of Molione, were originally Siamese twins. For the view that they were originally regular twins, see Farnell, *Greek Hero-Cults*; Farnell argues that the Siamese-twin version of the legend is Hesiodic and hence comparatively late. In Homer, the twins are normal and mortal (*Iliad* 11.750), though sons of Poseidon; they marry and have sons (*Iliad* 2.621). See Smyth, *Greek Melic Poets*, p. 278.

21. The medical anatomist Serres, in his *Theory of Organic Formation and Deformation, Applied to . . . Duplicate Monsters* (1833), which was influenced by Montaigne's "Of a Monstrous Child" (Montaigne, *Essais*, bk. 2, chap. 30; written during the French civil war), says of a set of Siamese twins with four legs and a single head that "there is a perfect unity produced by two distinct individualities. There are sense organs and cerebral hemispheres for a single individual, adapted to the service of two, since it is evident that there are two me's in this single head" (quoted in S.J. Gould, "Living with Connections," p. 75; see also Gillman, *Dark Twins*, p. 61).

22. Mankowicz and Haggart, *Pottery and Porcelain*, p. 202. The Chalkhurst twins died in 1734.

23. For example, see "Tocci Twins," p. 374.

24. For the term "conglomerate," see Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 213.

25. Clemens, *Those Extraordinary Twins*, p. 123.

26. The "Duplicates" in *The Mysterious Stranger* say, "Although we had been born together, at the same moment and of the same womb, there was no spiritual kinship between us" (*Mysterious Stranger*, p. 334). Twain writes of the identical twins in *Pudd'nhead Wilson* that "one was a little fairer than the other, but otherwise they were exact duplicates" (Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 43).

27. It is worth noting that Twain performed the part of one of a pair of Siamese twins at a private dinner party at his home in 1906 (see Gillman, *Dark Twins*, p. 181) and that he died in 1910 murmuring inchoately about the "duplicates" Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde (see Fiedler, *Freaks*, p. 270). Twain discussed the female Siamese twins Millie and Christine—a "wonderful two-headed girl"—in his "People and Things" column in the *Buffalo Express*, Sept. 2, 1869; for other references to Siamese twins in Twain's journalistic writings, see note 127.

28. Twain writes that he "took those [Siamese] twins [of *Those Extraordinary Twins*] apart and made two separate men of them [the identical twins or changelings of *Pudd'nhead Wilson*]." In *Pudd'nhead Wilson*, moreover, the identical twins become Siamese (*Pudd'nhead*, pp. 212, 295, 245). For the boundaries of nation and race, see Clemens, *Those Extraordinary Twins*, pp. 216-17.

29. Anthropological studies at once phonetic and sociological might focus on the sig-

44. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 12.

45. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 12.

46. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 13.

47. There are those who would say, though, that Jocasta did recognize Oedipus early on; see Vellacott, "Guilt of Oedipus."

48. In other places—imperial Rome, medieval Christendom, and eighteenth century France, for example—the number of foundlings raised as foster children was sometimes more than one quarter of the child population. See chapter 5.

49. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 21.

50. See Gillman, *Dark Twins*, p. 74.

51. In *Pudd'nhead Wilson*, alcohol and tea join blood and milk as consubstantial liquids that confer familial identity: Rowena loves the teetotaler Angelo, but she will not marry him because his identical twin brother Luigi drinks to excess and makes Angelo drunk (Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 292).

52. Abraham Lincoln said that "there is a natural disgust in the minds of nearly all white people, to the idea of indiscriminate amalgamation of the white and black races" (in a speech on the Dred Scott decision at Springfield, Illinois, on June 26, 1857; see Lincoln, *Speeches and Writings*, p. 397). One folk etymology of Lincoln's key term *amalgamation* links it with *ama* ("together") and *gamos* ("marriage").

53. On lactation and kinship: Crawley, *Mystic Rose* 2,230; Koran, ch. 4 ("Women"), p. 75; and chapters 5 and 7 below. For the racialist argument that blacks are non-human, see section 3. For collactation by goats and other animals: Montaigne, *Essais*, in *Oeuvres*, ed. Thibaudet and Rat, bk. 2, chap. 8, pp. 379–80.

54. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, pp. 266–67.

55. Hanging Luigi means ending the history of "those extraordinary twins" (*Pudd'nhead*, p. 294). Says Luigi: "If I had let the man kill [Angelo], wouldn't he have killed me too. I save my own life, you see" (*Pudd'nhead*, pp. 91–92).

56. Joyce, *Ulysses*, p. 404.

57. The following story is told in the midrashic Tosafot, or gloss, to the Talmudic tractate Menahot (37a): "At King Solomon's court one day an evil spirit Asmodeus presented the great judge with a difficult case. A two-headed man had married a woman who had borne him seven sons. Six of them resembled the mother; but *one* resembled the father in having two heads. After the father's death, the two-headed son claimed two shares of the inheritance. He argued that he was two men. His brothers, however, contended that the two-headed son was entitled to one share only. Solomon, in his wisdom, ruled that the son with two heads was only one man. He rendered judgment in favor of the six brothers." (See Jelinek, *Beit ha-Midrash*, pp. 151–52, and *Jewish Ency.* 11:439, s.v. "Solomon.") There is also the Twain-like case of the slave who claimed he was his master's son (Jelinek, *Beit ha-Midrash*, pp. 145–46).

58. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 6.

59. Galton admitted that fingerprints do not reveal racial grouping (Galton, *Finger Prints*, pp. 1–2, 26).

60. Clemens, *Pudd'nhead*, p. 193; *Extraordinary Twins*, pp. 150–51.

61. Cf. Gillman, *Dark Twins*, p. 6.

62. Hooper, in a recent *Wall Street Journal* article, "Identification by DNA Said to Be Better" (p. 1), reports that "the British scientist [Alec Jeffreys] credited with devising 'DNA fingerprinting,' a way to identify individuals from their genetic materials, has come up with an alternative method that he says should cause less controversy in courtrooms [than the earlier method devised in 1985]."

63. T.V. Smith and E.C. Lindeman, *Democratic Way*, p. 19.

64. Paine, *Writings* 2, 304–5.

65. The *Oxford Latin Dictionary*, s.v. “Liberi,” defines the word as “sons and daughters, children in connection w[ith] their parents.”

66. For “noble lie”: Plato, *Republic* 414c–415d. For autochthony and the Theban tale: Plato, *Laws*, 663e; Odysseus’ stories among the Phaeacians. Thebes is the birthplace of Sophocles’ Oedipus. Plato’s *Menexenus* proposes to unify the people of the state by turning autochthony into an ideology of real estate: “Their ancestors were not strangers, nor are these their descendants sojourners only, whose fathers have come from another country but they are the children of the soil, dwelling and living in their own land. And the country which brought them up is not like other countries, a stepmother to her children, her their own true mother” (Plato, *Menexenus*, 237b in *Collected Dialogues*, ed. Hamilton and Cairns; trans. Jowett). See also, “Are we not told that men of that former age were earthborn and not born of human parents?” (Plato, *Statesman*, 269b in *Collected Dialogues*, ed. Hamilton and Cairns; trans. Skemp; cf. 271a–272b). In the Bible, of course, *Adam* means something like “of the earth.”

67. “With everyone he happens to meet, he will hold that he’s meeting a brother, or a sister, or a father, or a mother, or a son, or a daughter, or their descendants or ancestors” (*Republic* 463). Cornford, in a note to his edition of the *Republic* (pp. 161–63), argues that “Plato did not regard the . . . connections of brothers and sisters as incestuous.” Cf. *Republic* 414d. The Platonic argument that incest is politically necessary to a liberal republic runs counter to other arguments; since Gibbon’s *Decline and Fall* one common view has been that incest was actually the cause of republican decline in Rome (Fowler, esp. chap. 3, “Incest Regulations”).

68. The Marquis de Sade, in the wake of the republican French Revolution, argues like Plato that for a people to become a genuine republic where all people think of and treat other people as equal citizens they must refuse to recognize any difference between consanguineous and nonconsanguineous kin, thus practicing either incest or celibacy. See Sade, “Français, encore un effort si vous voulez être républicains,” in *Philosophie*, esp. pp. 221–22.

69. For the history and theology of the legal definition of “spiritual incest” as a Brother or Sister having sexual intercourse with anyone at all, see such documents as Council of Rome (A.D. 402), can. 1,2, in Hefele, *Conciliengeschichte* 2,87; Pope Gelasius I (A.D. 494), letter to the bishops of Lucania, c. 20, in Gratian, *Decretum*, causa 27, q. 1, c. 14; Council of Macon (A.D. 585) can. 12, in Hefele, *Conciliengeschichte* 3,37; Gratian, *Decretum*, causa 30, q. 1, c. 5.10; and Oesterlé, “Inceste,” in *Dictionnaire de droit canonique*, ed. Naz, 5:1298–1314; and [Joseph]-Eugène Manguenot, “Inceste,” in *Dictionnaire de théologie catholique*, ed. Vacant et al., 7:1539–56.

70. Among English writers in Christendom it is the practice to capitalize kinship terms when they refer to affiliations that directly involve the Holy Family (Father and Son), the associations of friars or nuns (Brotherhood or Sisterhood), and the radical siblinghood of humankind that this family and these associations imply. Thus “Child” or “Son” is capitalized when referring to Christ as the offspring of God the Father but not when referring to him as the child of Joseph. Likewise, “Sister” is capitalized when referring, for example, to Shakespeare’s Ophelia as a would-be nun—her new family would be modeled upon God’s relationship to Mary as her Father, Brother, Son, and Spouse—but not when referring to Ophelia as the consanguineous sister of Laertes. Where we take for granted the usual Christian distinction between holy and profane or between spiritual and literal, the traditional practice of capitalizing essentially Christian kinship terms is helpful in clarifying whether a term is being used one way or the other. But difficulties arise in writing about apparently non-Christian or purportedly secularist universalist siblinghoods. These siblinghoods sometimes ignore the usual Christian distinction, or they reflect that distinction so transparently

as to become the brunt of Christian critiques, as did the fraternalist ideology of the French Revolution.

71. On the incestuous relationship between Jesus and Mary: Heuser, *Psychiatric Study*, p. 207. On the Athanasian doctrine that Father and Son are not literally the same, so that the Son is the Father of Himself: the Council of Nicea in A.D. 325. For Tamar: Matt. 1:3 and Gen. 38:26-30. Rahab, a harlot, and Bathsheba, an adulteress, are included among the human ancestors of Jesus, whose mother was a kind of harlot, since His conception was extramarital. On the genealogy of Jesus: Santiago, *Children of Oedipus*, p. 50, and Layard, "Incest Taboo," pp. 301-2. For the magi: Rankin, "Catullus," p. 119, and Moulton, *Early Zoroastrians*, esp. pp. 204, 249-50. For the Persians: Antisthenes of Athens, *Fragmenta*, cited in Rankin, "Catullus," p. 120, and Sidler, *Inzesttabu*. See Nietzsche's remark that "an ancient belief, especially strong in Persia, holds that a wise magus must be incestuously begotten" (*Die Geburt der Tragödie*, sec. 9, in *Werke* 1:56-57; trans. Gollfing, pp. 60-61). For further discussion of fourfold kinship within the Holy Family, see chapter 4.

72. The father in Stendhal's *Cenci*, Francesco Cenci, "taught [his daughter Beatrice] a frightful heresy, which I scarcely dare repeat . . . that when a father has carnal knowledge of his own daughter, the children born of the union are of necessity saints, and that all the greatest saints whom the Church venerates were born in this manner" (Stendhal, *Cenci*, pp. 181-2). For Saint Albanus, see Rank, *Inzest-Motiv*. For Saint Julian, see Bart and Cook, *Flaubert's Saint Julian*, and Berg et al., *Saint Oedipus*. For the story of Gregory, see Hartmann von Aue, *Gregorius*. On the motif in general, see Harney, *Brother and Sister Saints*.

73. See chapters 2 and 4.

74. The alliance between Clément Marot and Anne d'Alençon, parodied by Rabelais in his chapter entitled "The Island of Ennasin" in *Pantagruel* (bk. 4, chap. 9), is a good example of kinship by *alliance*.

75. In Goethe's *Elective Affinities*, Otilie expresses "a strong belief in the existence of some law of male and female friendship and kinship higher than our actual marriage would in every case now imply." Goethe's Lotte says that "it seems to me that these things are related to each other not in the blood, so to speak, so much as in the spirit" (cited in Dixon, *Spiritual Wives*, pp. 361, 365). "Blood Relations of Choice" or "Chosen Kin" is how Brodsky translates "*Wahlverwandschaften*" (*Imposition of Form*, pp. 88-89). However, since we do not know who *are* our blood kin, electing who we *call* blood kin is the usual situation for human beings.

76. For the phrase "cult of fraternity," see Sandell, "A very poetic circumstance," ch. 2. See also Durbach, "Geschwister-Komplex," pp. 61-63; Rank, *Inzest-Motiv*; Praz, *Romantic Agony*, pp. 111-12; and Schelly, "A Like Unlike." For Byron, see his "Manfred" (1817), "The Bride of Abydos" (1813), and "Cain" (1821), esp. 1.1.187-89, 1.1.380; and Van Der Beets, "Note." Engels reports Marx's view from Marx's letter to him about Richard Wagner; Engels himself writes that "not only were brother and sister originally man and wife, sexual intercourse between parents and children is still permitted among many peoples today" (Engels, *Origin of the Family*, p. 100; cf. p. 102). For Vico, before the establishment of specifically human "institutions," men lived in what might be called a "nefarious promiscuity of things and women" in which "sons often lay with mothers and fathers with daughters" (*New Science*, paras. 16, 17).

77. For Paul, see 1 Cor. 6:12. For Noyes, see his letter of January 15, 1837 to David Harrison (quoted in Dixon, *Spiritual Wives* 2, 55-56).

78. *Bible Communism*, p. 27. Noyes continues: "The sons and daughters of God, must have even a stronger sense of blood-relationship than ordinary brothers and sisters. They live as children with their Father forever, and the paramount affection of the household is . . . brotherly love. . . . A brother may love ten sisters, or a sister ten brothers, according to

the customs of the world. The exclusiveness of marriage does not enter the family circle. But heaven is a family circle; and . . . brotherly love . . . takes the place of supremacy which the matrimonial affection occupies in this world" (*Bible Communism*; quoted in Dalke, "Incest in Nineteenth Century American Fiction," p. 88).

79. Ellis, *Free Love*, pp. 187–88. Noyes counters the usual objection to "amative intercourse between near relations"—that "'breeding in and in' deteriorates offspring"—with his own genetic theories. Cf. Noyes' monograph on eugenics, "An Essay on Scientific Propagation." For other references to Noyes' writings, see Kern, *Ordered Love*; on the doctrine of free love in nineteenth century America, see Spurlock, *Free Love*.

80. Morison, *Oxford History of the American People*, pp. 524–25.

81. See Emerson's discussion of those Americans who "adopt the word *l'humanité* from [Pierre] Le Roux [follower of the Christian socialist Saint-Simon] and go for '*the race*' [of humankind]." Emerson, who has in mind people such as Orestes Brownson, Christopher A. Greene, Elizabeth Palmer Peabody, and George Bancroft, writes that "the world is waking up to the idea of Union and already we have Communities, Phalanxes, and Aesthetic Families, & Pestalozzian institutions" (Emerson, *Journals*, 8:251; cf. Bercovitch, "Emerson," pp. 3–6). Here Emerson is referring to the schools for waifs, strays, and orphans pioneered by the Swiss Rousseauist Johann Heinrich Pestalozzi. For the term *familism* see also *Tait's Magazine* 15 (1848): 705, where the author remarks that there was a strong "propensity to group" that "embraces love, friendship, ambition, and a fourth passion, called familism." On the American feminist Fourierist Margaret Fuller, who in 1844 published her *Women in the Nineteenth Century* in the tradition of Mary Wollstonecraft, see chapter 8.

82. Fiedler, introduction to *Quaker City*, p. xxx; cf. p. vii. Fiedler writes that what "sets Lippard's book apart from those on which he modelled it is a peculiar emphasis, somehow characteristic of America, on the sanctity in a world otherwise profane of the brother-sister relationship." The booksellers sold 60,000 copies in 1844.

83. Lippard, preface to *Quaker City*, p. 2. On the Brotherhood of Union, see Fiedler, introduction to *Quaker City*, p. viii.

84. See Easton, *Hegel's First American Followers*; Webber, *Escape to Utopia*.

85. The Quakers were directly associated with the doctrine of Familism; see, e.g., Haljwell's *Familism as it is revised by the Quakers* (1673). On the theme of brother and sister in *The Philadelphia Story* see Cavell's remarkable *Pursuits of Happiness*.

86. For the romantic topos, see B. Thomas, "Writers' Procreative Urge." Damon, "Pierre the Ambiguous," puts *Pierre* squarely in the group of literary works about incest; Mogan, "Pierre and Manfred," p. 231, discusses the incestuous crime of Byron's Magian hero in relation to *Pierre*. The topos was already an important theme in American letters, including W. H. Brown's *The Power of Sympathy*, and such works as Hawthorne's *Marble Faun* (1860), where Miriam and her mysterious follower are likely Astarte and Manfred revisited, and his "Alice Doane's Appeal," which tells the story of Leonard Doane's love for his sister. Consider also Anna Lewis's poem "Child of the Sea" (1848), in which it is revealed that the affair is not after all incestuous. See also Dryden, "Entangled Text," and F. G. See, "Kinship of Metaphor."

At first the ordinary romantic topos was not quite recognized by the critics. Damon, "Pierre," p. 110, writes that "the nineteenth century literally did not know enough even to guess what the book was about." Some early readers could think of *Pierre* only as a hoax (note in Melville, *Pierre*, ed. Hayford et al., p. 393).

87. The conjunction of the Catholic *sponsa* with incestuous urges is not uncommon in American literature. Irwin (*Doubling*, pp. 129–30) focuses on Christian mother-son incest in the writings of William Faulkner: "The fecundation of Mary by God is a supplanting of

Joseph . . . and since Jesus, the son, is himself that God, then he is, in a sense, the son who has impregnated his mother, and Jesus' birth, as befits the birth of a god, is incestuous."

88. Melville, *Pierre*, ed. Murray, foreword Thompson, p. 37. Subsequent notes refer to this edition unless otherwise noted.

89. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 58.

90. In Disraeli's *Alroy* (1833), as Murray points out, the hero does not know any love, "save that pure affection which doth subsist between me and this girl, an orphan and my sister" (introd. to *Pierre*, p. lxvi).

91. See Brodsky, *Imposition of Form*, p. 244.

92. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 391. The portrait of Beatrice Cenci also appears in Hawthorne's *Marble Faun*.

93. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 109; emphasis mine. Shakespeare, *Hamlet*, ed. Jenkins, 1.5.9.

94. Melville, *Pierre*, pp. 232 and 141.

95. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 116. Melville's Billy Budd is "a foundling" who, when asked "Who was your father?," has to answer, "God knows, Sir" (Melville, *Billy Budd*, p. 298). Budd's "entire family was practically invested in himself" (*Billy Budd*, p. 297).

96. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 310.

97. For a nineteenth-century American view of bundling, see Stiles, *Bundling*. On Dutch aspects of American bundling, see Irving, *History of New York, by Knickerbocker*, p. 211. On bundling among the Indians, see Stiles, *Bundling*, pp. 50–63. On bundling in the Catholic religious orders, see Bayle, *Dictionnaire*, ed. Desoer, 6:508–10, art. "Fontevrault"; and see chapter 4, section on "Social Anthropology of Universalist Orders." *Webster's [Dictionary]* is quoted by Stiles, *Bundling*, p. 13. Stiles, *Bundling*, p. 15, quotes Caesar from the American edition of Logan's *Scottish Gael*, p. 472. The attack of current British sleeping practices is quoted from *Reviewers Reviewed*, pp. 34–35.

98. Isabel, in describing her relationship with Pierre, says: "I am called woman, and thou, man, Pierre; but there is neither man nor woman about it. Why should I not speak out to thee? There is no sex in our immaculateness" (Melville, *Pierre*, p. 178).

99. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 171.

100. This community would be a political utopia that perfects the communities of Mettingen in Brown's *Wieland* (which has only four people, a pair of sibling-pairs) and at Saddlemeadows. Cf. Wilson, "Incest," p. 7.

101. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 304.

102. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 305.

103. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 57.

104. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 318.

105. Gesenius, *Lexicon*, p. 45.

106. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 310.

107. Melville, *Pierre*, p. 342. On the abiogenetic hypothesis that living things sometimes arise from such "lifeless" matter as the earth—without either human or divine parents—see Nigrelli, ed., "Modern Ideas on Spontaneous Generation"; Thomas Huxley, in his *Address to the British Association for the Advancement of Science* (1870), wrote that "to save circumlocution, I shall call . . . the doctrine that living matter may be produced by not living matter—the hypothesis of *Abiogenesis*" (Huxley, "Spontaneous Generation," p. 356).

108. Nationalists in France, whence came Isabel, refer to "enfants de la patrie" [children of the fatherland] who die and are reborn or regenerated from the earth. In "La Marseillaise" fighters for liberty are "produced from the earth": *la terre en produit de nouveau*.

109. Lucy becomes convinced that she has been called "to do a wonderful office" toward Pierre (Melville, *Pierre*, p. 350), and, thinking him to be the complete incarnation of

all her family—her “brother and mother . . . and all the universe to me” (Melville, *Pierre*, p. 351), Lucy “nun-like” (Melville, *Pierre*, p. 350) comes to the Church of the Apostles to serve Pierre as a kind of nun just as Isabel serves him as a kind of Sister.

110. In his *Dictionary*, Bayle reports that Mohammed, though he forbade incest for his followers, allowed it to himself by a special privilege.

111. Isabel says to her brother, Pierre, the Brother of all men, “Were all men like to thee, then were there no men at all,—mankind extinct in seraphim!” (Melville, *Pierre*, p. 186).

112. The universalist viewpoint I am pursuing militates against assuming the importance of the subject’s place in a consanguineous family, an importance that the narrative structure of biography often assumes (see chapter 6). However, much could be said about Melville’s relationship to his mother, sister, grandfather, and so on. Among the facts: Melville “purposed to write his spiritual biography in the form of a novel.” “Melville used the name of his mother [Mary], not that of his wife, on the birth certificate of his son.” Melville’s “vigorous and pious” sister Augusta, presumably a model for Isabel in *Pierre*, copied his manuscripts. Melville longed for the prenuptial state after his marriage. Isabel is also modeled on Melville’s cousin. Pierre’s grandfather is like Melville’s (Melville, *Pierre*, pp. xxiv, xxxvii, xxxviii, 430; ed. Hayford et al., pp. 339, 397, 399; Mumford, *Melville*).

113. One hero of American-German socialists of mid-century America, the cosmopolitan Stoic Epictetus, says that the common origin of all human beings rules out essential class differences: “Slave, do you not want to help your *adelphos*, who has Zeus for father, who is born of the same germs as you and is of the same heavenly descent?” (Epictetus, *Discourses*, cited in Zeller, *Philosophie der Griechen*, pp. 299–303). Epictetus agrees with the gist of Christian monachism. (For sociological treatments of interclass equality within the orders, see Campbell-Jones, *In Habit*, esp. pp. 196–99, and Séguy, “Sociologie,” p. 347.) Paul too held that “there is neither bond nor free, for ye are all one in Christ” (Gal. 3:28).

114. “The earliest American fictionalists,” speculates Dalke, “unconsciously used the incest theme to express their deepest anxieties about class upheavals” (“*Had I known*,” p. 88). Cf. Wagenknecht’s remark that, “judged by their fiction, the Founding Fathers might appear primarily devoted to incest” (*American Novel*, p. 2). For a Marxist condemnation of incest in American literature as “a neurotic practice of the decadent upper class,” see Zelnick, “Incest Theme.”

115. In Sophocles’ drama, which is partly about class upheaval during the period of egalitarian democratization under the Greek tyrants, Oedipus ascribes Jocasta’s outburst at learning he is not the biological son of Polybus and Merope (*Oedipus*, 1077–79, trans. Grene) to her fear that he may have been born from the lower classes. It is thus in an egalitarian and democratic spirit that Oedipus speaks the words I quote.

116. Pierre marries outside his aristocratic class, earning his mother’s ire, and inside his family, committing incest. (“But you, Pierre, are going to be married before long, I trust, not to a Capulet, but one of our own Montagues; and so Romeo’s evil fortune will hardly be yours. You will be happy” [Melville, *Pierre*, p. 39].)

117. For this term, sometimes translated as *scission* or *diremption* in American descriptions of Hegelian *Aufhebung*, see the nineteenth-century American translation of Hegel’s *Logic* by Lt. Governor Henry C. Brokmeyer (Missouri), a frequent contributor to *The Journal of Speculative Philosophy* and writer about the Civil War.

118. I here use the term *brotherhood* and the term *fraternal kinship* immediately below as near synonyms for *siblinghood*.

119. *Documentary Source Book of American History*, doc. 50; emphasis mine.

120. *Documentary Source Book of American History*, doc. 47.

121. *Documentary Source Book of American History*, doc. 43; emphasis mine.

122. Quoted in Decker, *The Declaration of Independence*, p. 149; emphasis mine.

123. Durham, *Report* 2:16. In “O Canada,” the anthem of my birthplace, Canada is called the “home and native land” of all citizens, English- and French-speaking, whether they are indigenous or foreign-born. Whether such genuine “natives” as the Mohawk Indians of Québec should call Canada their homeland remains ambiguous. See chapter 3.

124. Decker, *Declaration of Independence*, p. 160.

125. Elizabeth, *Letters*, ed. Harrison, p. 47.

126. Gentili, *De jure belli libri tres* (1598), bk. 3, chap. 18, trans. Rolfe, pp. 387–88; cited in Nelson, *Usury*, p. 156.

127. Mark Twain, in his “People and Things” column in the *Buffalo Express* (Sept. 2, 1869) and in an 1869 article in *Packard’s Monthly* (August 1869) entitled “Personal Habits of the Siamese Twins,” takes up the question of Siamese twinning and civil war: “During the war they . . . both fought gallantly—Eng on the Union side and Chang on the Confederate.” Siamese twins come to stand for the interdependencies of masters and slaves, say, or the Northern pole and the Southern. One pundit, considering the case of the Siamese twins Chang and Eng, wonders “what General [William Tecumseh] Sherman would do if one [of the twins] were disloyal and had to be sent South, while the other remained loyal.” (*Alta* [1864]: 1). Another pundit notes that “whether the Chang part was for the North, or the Eng part for the South, or *vice versa*, is not yet made public” (*Downieville Mountain Messenger* [April 28, 1866]; see Gillman, *Dark Twins*, pp. 57–58). Montaigne, in his “Of a Monstrous Child,” speaks of the one-headed multilimbed Siamese twin [“ce double corps et ces membres divers, se rapportans à une seule teste”] in terms of the French civil war (Montaigne, *Essais*, in *Oeuvres*, ed. Thibaudet and Rat, bk. 2, chap. 30, p. 691).

128. Delany, *Condition*, pp. 12–20, 209; cited in Sollors, *Beyond Ethnicity*, p. 48.

129. Clermont-Tonnerre, *Opinion relativement aux persécutions qui menacent les juifs d’Alsace*. Cardoso, *Excelencias*, translated in Yerushalmi, *From Spanish Court*, pp. 469–470. See chapter 2.

130. See, for example, Calhoun’s speech on the Reception of Abolitionist Petitions (delivered in the U.S. Senate, February 6, 1837); in Levy, ed., *Political Thought*, pp. 307–10.

131. Fitzhugh’s *Cannibals All!* is cited in Morison, *Oxford History of the American People*, p. 512. Cartwright, *Prognathous Species*, follows Nott, *Types of Mankind*, in arguing that natural history and the bible “prove . . . the existence of three distinct species of the genus man,” including the “white” and the “black” (cited in *Ency. Phil.* 7:60).

132. Cited in Sollors, *Beyond Ethnicity*, p. 38. In *Mardi* (2, 224), the inscription is to be found over the arch of the “tutelary deity of Vivenza.”

133. Lincoln, *Speeches and Writings 1832–58*, pp. 396, 402.

134. Sewell, *Selling of Joseph* (1700), argues “that all Men, as they are the Sons of Adam, are Coheirs; and have equal Rights unto Liberty” (in Ruchames, ed., *Racial Thought*, 47). Martin Luther King, in his speech delivered before 200,000 people at the March on Washington (August 28, 1963), accented the traditional church focus on “all of God’s children” and argued that racism ends in the familial unity of humankind: “I have dreamt that one day . . . the sons of former slaves and the sons of former slave owners will be able to sit down together at the table of brotherhood. . . . I have a dream that one day . . . little black boys and black girls will be able to join hands with little white boys and white girls and walk together as sisters and brothers” (quoted by Oates, *Let the Trumpet Sound*, p. 261).

135. Acts 17:26; cf. John 3:16. The passage from Acts was often quoted by black American preachers. It can also be found in numerous other texts: Frederick Douglass’ “The Meaning of July Fourth for the Negro” delivered in Corinthian Hall, Rochester, on July 5, 1852 (Foner, *Douglass*, pp. 199–200); Delany’s *Condition, Elevation, Emigration, and Destiny of the Coloured People of the United States*; and William Wells Brown’s *Clotel; or The President’s Daughter*, a novel of 1853 about the children that Jefferson fathered with the slave woman

Sally Hemings. Not surprisingly, the text sometimes became the occasion for discussing the evolutionary connection between men and animals, as in the anonymous 1833 essay entitled "Are the Human Race All of One Blood?" (pp. 361–62). W. E. B. DuBois uses Acts prominently at the beginning of *Darkwater* (1920) when he writes "I believe in God, who made of one blood all nations that on earth do dwell." See Timothy Smith, "Slavery and Theology," and, for the references to Delany and to Brown, Sollors, *Beyond Ethnicity*, pp. 58–65.

136. Young, "The Mother of Us All," p. 408. Cf. Hubbell, "Smith-Pocahontas Story," and Sollors, *Beyond Ethnicity*, esp. p. 264, n.7.

137. Sollors, *Beyond Ethnicity*, pp. 85 ff., discusses the analogy between Americanization and Christian rebirth.

138. See chapter 8.

139. Hawthorne, *Passages* 2, 24.

140. Lincoln said that "we have besides these men—descended by blood from our ancestors—among us half our people who are not descendants at all of these men, they are men who have come from Europe—German, Irish, French, and Scandinavian—men that have come from Europe themselves, or whose ancestors have come hither and settled here, finding themselves our equals in all things. If they look back through this history to trace their connection with those days by blood, they find they have none, they cannot carry themselves back into that glorious epoch and make themselves feel that they are part of us, but when they look throughout that old Declaration of Independence they find that those old men say that 'We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal,' and then they feel that that moral sentiment taught in that day evidences their relation to those men, that it is the father of all moral principle in them, and that they have a right to claim it as though they were blood of the blood, and flesh of the flesh of the men who wrote that Declaration, (loud and long continued applause) and so they are. That is the *electric cord* in that Declaration that links the hearts of patriotic and liberty-loving men together, that will link those patriotic hearts as long as the love of freedom exists in the minds of men throughout the world" (speech at Chicago, Illinois, delivered on July 10, 1858, in Lincoln, *Speeches and Writings*, 1832–58, p. 456; emphasis mine).

141. Concerning sexual history: The universalist doctrine that all human beings are siblings, insofar as it requires that people who want to avoid incest must either become celibate or commit bestiality, would encourage some white Americans to think of blacks as somehow animals. On celibacy, see chapter 3; on bestiality, see chapter 7.

142. See Fiedler, *American Novel*.

143. This motto was approved for the seal of the British and Foreign Anti-Slavery Society on October 16, 1787.

144. Montgomery, "The Rainbow," in *Works* 2, 361; capitalization and italicization are from this edition.

145. For "man and brotherism," see *Pall Mall Gazette*, March 27, 1865, p. 3.

146. Quoted by Williamson, *New People*, p. 66.

147. W. D. Jordan, *White Over Black*, p. 178.

148. See Dominguez, *White By Definition*.

149. In the West Indies, for example, there were mulattos (half whites), sambos (one quarter whites), quadroons (three quarters whites), and mestizos (seven eighths whites). Analogously, in bilingual and biracial Canada, there were not only English Protestants and French Catholics but also *métis*. Such nonuniversalist, intermediating terms and the gradations of political rights that they seem to require are disconcerting to those who would insist, in unmediated and idealist fashion, on the equal creation of all men. But these terms can have certain practical benefits. As they force recognition of the reality of racial miscegenation

