

from the formal relations between commodities. For a discussion of the *Warensprache* contemporary to the period when these signs were photographed, see Faye, *Colloque de Cluny*, p. 191.

68. Cf. Ellul, *Propaganda*. Bilingual advertisements may help to teach French to the English and English to the French, but this is hardly their principal social or economic effect.

69. See, for example, the Québec Food Regulations Act of March 15, 1967.

70. See, for example, Sheppard, *Law of Languages in Canada*, who ignores interlinguistic mediation.

Chapter 4

1. Elizabeth I, *Poems*, p. 3. During the period of religious and political upheavals the greatest danger to Elizabeth's life probably occurred in 1554, when Sir Thomas Wyatt headed a rebellion in Kent and Elizabeth was summoned to London and sent to the tower for two months, after which she was sent to live at Woodstock (cf. *Letters*, p. 4).

2. Partridge's review ("Good Queen Bess") of Stanley and Vennema's *Story of Elizabeth I of England* is an example.

3. "But thou, which hast made separation of My bed, and did put thy false lovers in My place and committed fornication with them, yet, for all this, thou mayst come unto Me again, for I will not be angry against thee. Lift up thine eyes, and look up, then shalt thou see in what place thy sin had led thee, and how thou liest down in the earth" (Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 36v; in Shell, *Elizabeth's Glass*).

4. The poem also appeared in 1538 and 1539; in 1547 and 1548 it appeared as part of Marguerite's *Marguerites*.

5. For the view that Anne Boleyn entered the service of Marguerite of Navarre (then Duchess of Alençon), see Ames', introd. to Elizabeth, *Mirror*, p. 31. The two queens knew each other as early as Queen Claude's coronation in 1516; both attended a banquet in France in 1518 and the Field of Cloth of Gold in 1520 (Ives, *Anne Boleyn*, pp. 38–42).

6. Anne Boleyn and Marguerite of Navarre had a well documented correspondence in 1534–35. In October of 1535, moreover, the English were anxious to interest the French envoys in the young princess Elizabeth (Ives, *Anne Boleyn*, pp. 41, 341).

7. Ames (introd. to Elizabeth, *Mirror*, p. 31) writes that "we may conclude that the copy . . . had belonged to her mother, who may have obtained it from her former friend and mistress [Marguerite of Navarre]."

8. Salminen (*Miroir*, p. 253) says Elizabeth used the edition of December 1533 printed by Antoine Augereau in Paris; but Prescott, p. 66, "Pearl," says Elizabeth used the edition of 1539.

9. For the letter, see *Letters*, pp. 5–7. On Elizabeth's needlework, see Neale, *Elizabeth*, p. 12.

10. Elizabeth asks her stepmother to "rub out, polish, and mend (or else cause to mend) the words (or rather the order of my writing) the which I know in many places to be rude, and nothing done as it should be" (Elizabeth, letter to Catherine Parr, December 31, 1544, Folio 4r, in Shell, *Elizabeth's Glass*).

11. On Bale, the ardent reformer and nationalist scholar and playwright, see my "Bale and British Nationalism," in *Elizabeth's Glass*.

12. This portrait is ascribed by some to H. Holbein. Yet it was probably designed in 1547 by an unknown artist (Ames, introd. to Elizabeth, *Mirror*, p. 7—Holbein died in 1543 of the plague.) John N. King says that Elizabeth's kneeling before Christ with the Bible in hand suggests Protestant learning (*Tudor Royal Iconography*, pp. 209–10) and he draws our attention to Bale's *Illustrium majoris Britanniae scriptorum*, which contains a comparable woodcut

showing Edward VI as a studious king standing at a lectern (*English Reformation Literature*, p. 6); we will see that the kneeling woman's relationship to Christ is considerably more complex than that.

13. For the publication history, see my *Elizabeth's Glass*. Elizabeth also gave members of her family other holograph translations as gifts—an English translation of John Calvin's *Institution Chrétienne* to Catherine Parr (1545); Latin, French, and Italian translations from Catherine Parr's *Prayers, or Meditations* to Henry VIII (1545); and a Latin translation of Bernardino's Ochino's *De Christo Sermo* to her brother, the ten-year-old (King) Edward (1547).

14. I offer a detailed discussion of these matters in *Elizabeth's Glass*.

15. On dormition, see chapter 1, note 16.

16. Elizabeth herself suggests that "the part which I have wrought in it" was "as well spiritual as manual"; letter to Catherine Parr, December 31, 1544, Folio 3v.

17. Jenkins, in his edition of Shakespeare's *Hamlet* (3.4.6), notes that, in the Folio, Hamlet, about to enter his mother's chambers, calls out thus for her: "Mother, mother, mother." For the reference to Melville, see his *Pierre*, foreword Thompson, p. 178.

18. Deut. 25:5–6.

19. Blackmore ("Hamlet's Right to the Crown") argues that "the diriment impediment to marriage with a deceased brother's wife was part of English church doctrine since earliest times and was retained by the English secular authorities until the nineteenth century." As Jones (*Hamlet and Oedipus*, p. 68) points out, "Had the relationship [between Claudius and Gertrude] not counted as incestuous, then Queen Elizabeth would have no right to the throne; she would have been a bastard, Catherine of Aragon being alive at her birth"; on *Hamlet* and the relationship between Henry VIII and Catherine of Aragon, see also Rosenblatt, "Aspects of Incest Problems."

20. In *Henry VIII*, Shakespeare goes to extraordinary lengths to allay anxiety about Elizabeth's possibly illegitimate birth. "Ann Bullen," for example, is noticeably absent from the christening scene. Yet, towards the end of the play, the porter suggests that Ann Bullen, who had been Henry's mistress (just as her sister Mary had been), was a "fornatrix," so that the Princess Elizabeth may be a bastard. When the porter in Shakespeare's play cries out, "what a cry of fornication is at door!" (5.3.34–35) he refers in part to the crowd of common people; yet the smallest "fry" in the play is Elizabeth herself who, from the Catholic viewpoint, is born of a "fornatrix."

21. Much relevant material is included in Edward Fox's *Collectanea status copiosa*, a basis for *A Glasse of Truth* (1532). It included such treatises as Cranmer's *Determinations . . . that it is unlawful for a man to marry his brother's wife* (1531); see Ives, *Boleyn*, pp. 165, 167.

22. For Luther's marriage to the Cistercian Sister Catherine von Bora, see More, *Tindale*, pp. 48–49. For Rome's condemnation of Bale's marriage to Dorothy, see Pits, *Relationum Historicum*, pp. 53–59; cf. Harris, *Bale*, pp. 22–23. For Elizabeth's work with Ochino, see Craster, "Unknown Translation."

23. The notion that bastards, especially those born from bigamous or incestuous relations, cannot inherit the throne, gained some support from the fact that the children of Edward IV, as the offspring of a bigamous union, were unable to inherit. The issue was hotly contested in the 1540s. Upon the execution of Anne Boleyn, for example, "parliament was required to establish the succession on the new basis of Henry's new queen Jane Seymour . . . it also empowered the king to leave the crown by will if he had no legitimate issue, but the illegitimate son, the Duke of Richmond, in whose favor this provision is said to have been conceived, died shortly afterwards" (see "English History" in *Ency. Brit.* (11th ed.) 9, 522d, 531d).

24. Two other counts were the rumor that the king was impotent (Paul Friedmann, *Anne Boleyn* 2, 280, n. 1; Dewhurst, "Alleged Miscarriages of . . . Anne Boleyn") and the view that

the marriage was declared invalid *ab initio* on the ground of Anne's precontract with Lord Percy.

25. See Friedmann, *Boleyn* 2, 287, 351.

26. On the indictments of Anne for sibling incest and for an account of the trial, see Friedmann, *Boleyn* 2, 262–63, 278–81. The charge of adultery and incest with her brother, Lord Rochford, was made on May 2, 1536; Lord Rochford's wife was a principal witness for the prosecution.

27. See Friedmann, *Boleyn* 2, 262–63, 278–81.

28. The idea of Elizabeth as divine was fostered from the beginning, even as Anne Boleyn was associated with Saint Anne. There was a merging of Mary's son (Jesus Christ) and Anne's (expected or "annunciated") son in literary propaganda of the period (Ives, *Boleyn*, p. 284).

29. In 1536 an Act of Parliament ordered every man who had married his mistress's sister to separate from his wife and forbade all marriages with mistresses' sisters in the future. For Cranmer's views on the matter, see Lingard, *History of England* 5, 74; 540–42, and Friedmann, *Boleyn* 1, 43; 2, 323–27; 351–55. On the view that the "marriage was declared invalid *ab initio* . . . on the ground of the affinity established between Henry and Anne by Henry's previous relations with Mary [Boleyn]," see "Elizabeth Queen of England" in *Ency. Brit.* (11th ed.) 9:282.

30. For Henry's views of Mary's illegitimacy, see *Calendar's of Letters, Despatches, and State Papers*, 1534–35, p. 57 [*Letters and Papers . . . of Henry VIII* 7, 214], cited in Ives, *Boleyn*, p. 271.

31. Fowler, "Incest Regulations," pp. 12–13. For the Latin term, see Rabanus Maurus, *Concilium moguntium*.

32. *Jacob's Well*, ed. Brandeis, 162/15.

33. Jonas of Orleans, *De institutione laicalli*, *Patrologiae (Latina)* 106:183–84.

34. In A.D. 868, Church Councils ruled that "we will not define the number of generations within which the faithful may be joined. No Christian may accept a wife . . . if any blood relationship is recorded, known, or held in memory" (Worms, can. 32, in Mansi, ed., 15, 875). Pope Julius I specified the seventh remove as the limit of diriment impediment to marriage (*Decret.*, no. 5, *Patrologiae [Latina]* 8:969). But there were enormous practical problems of record keeping, and even where the numerical degree was both agreed upon and ascertainable, there were controversies about the correct method of counting. Thus Stephan of Tournai notes that "the counting begins with the brothers according to some and with the sons of the brothers according to others" (*Summa*, 255). Cf. C. E. Smith, *Papal Enforcement*, chap. 2.

35. Eph. 5:31–32.

36. 1 Cor. 6:16, Cf. Gen. 2:24.

37. On the kinship relationship engendered by sexual intercourse, see Gratian, *Decretum*, 35, q. 5, 10; Bandinelli, *Summa*, p. 203; Stephan of Tournai, *Summa*, 250; Balbus, *Summa*, 168; and Feije, *De impedimentis*, chap. 14.

38. Bale, "Conclusion," in Elizabeth, *Godly Medytacyon*, Folio 40r; included in my *Elizabeth's Glass*.

39. For an interpretation of Sophocles' *Antigone* in this context, see Benardete, "Reading," 5. 2, p. 11, and Hegel, *Phänomenologie, Werke* 6, chap. 6.

40. There would have been many bibliothecal sources, including a French metrical account of how Anne was brought to trial and executed, the *Histoire de Anne Boleyne Jadis Royné d'Angeterre* of 1545 and perhaps early versions of the picaresque mid-century Spanish *Crónica del Rey Enrico*, in which one "Marguerita"—maybe a figure of Marguerite of Navarre—is the bawd who procures Smeton for Queen Anne. (The *Histoire* is discussed in Ascoli, *Grande-Bretagne*; M.A.S. Hume's edition of *Crónica del Rey Enrico*, pp. 55–59 and 68–76, refers to Marguerita; cf. Ives, *Boleyn*, pp. 69–70, 375.)

41. The terms “aunt-mother” and “uncle-father” are used in *Hamlet* (ed. Jenkins, 2.2.371–72). “You are welcome,” says Hamlet to the twinlike Rosencrantz and Guildenstern, “but my uncle-father and aunt-mother are deceived.” Insofar as Hamlet’s mother, Gertrude, is married to Hamlet’s uncle, she is his aunt. Similarly, Elizabeth’s mother, Anne Boleyn, was her aunt. Henry had had sexual intercourse with Mary Boleyn, Anne’s sister; and since, by the Doctrine of Carnal Contagion, a lover is, to all intents and purposes, a wife, Anne was Elizabeth’s aunt.

42. The quotation is from *Ency. Brit.* (11th ed.) 9:282.

43. For a review of the evidence concerning the Elizabeth-Seymour liaison, see William Seymour, *Ordeal by Ambition*, pp. 215–19, 225–26. Thomas Tyrwhitt, who was sent to Hatfield to extract the truth from Elizabeth, complained that Thomas Seymour, Mistress Ashley, Thomas Ashley and Elizabeth told a story so close in so many details that they were “all in a tale” (*Letters*, p. 9; cf. Elizabeth’s letter to Edward Seymour Lord Protector, January 28, 1549). Elizabeth’s relations with Thomas Seymour was the occasion for sending a syntactically complex letter to him soon after she left the Lord Admiral’s household, in July 1548: “You needed not to send an excuse to me for I could not distrust and not fulfilling your promise to proceed for want of good will, but only that opportunity serve not. Wherefore, I shall desire you to think that a greater matter than this could not make me impute any unkindness in you, for I am a friend not won with trifles, nor lost with the light” (*Letters*, p. 8).

44. *Letters*, p. 11.

45. Duff, “Die Beziehung Elizabeth-Essex,” p. 469.

46. The centuries-old tradition of ascribing to Elizabeth various feelings about her family circumstances continues unabated. Prescott, for example, would determine “how [Elizabeth] respond[ed] to the executions of her mother, Anne Boleyn, and her stepmother, Catherine Howard” (Prescott, “Pearl,” 68). Only seers such as “Fathers Confessor” and psychoanalysts can claim to see into the heart of a person, of course, but where religious or psychological speculation arises from texts such as the “Glass,” it would seem to be particularly compelling—at least where the rhetorical quality of such speculation is recognized.

47. There is some evidence that there was a copy of the book in Henry VIII’s household (Henry VIII, *Letters and Papers* 14[1], 369). In 1544 Marguerite had not yet a great literary reputation; she was known as an author pretty much only by her *Miroir*, its companion religious poems, and a farce (Prescott, “Pearl,” p. 68).

48. Henry VIII opened negotiations to marry Marguerite of Navarre (then Duchess of Alençon) while he was entertaining the idea of divorcing Catherine of Aragon. Margaret’s reply to Henry, made through Wolsey, makes clear that she refused to marry Henry because he committed crimes against Catherine of Aragon. See “Margaret, The Pearl of Navarre” (Edinburgh, 1868); Ames, introd. to Elizabeth, *Mirror*, p. 32.

49. Ames “Introduction,” p. 33, in his edition of Elizabeth’s *Mirror*.

50. Elizabeth, “Glass,” Folio 7v, 8r, 23v.

51. Elizabeth, Letter to Catherine Parr, December 31, 1544, Folio 3r. It reads there as “mother, daughter, sister, and wife by the scriptures she proveth herself to be.” The passage from the letter is also in *Letters*, p. 6.

52. In the sixteenth century, replacing consanguinity with a sort of amatory *alliance* of friendship had, in carnival style, begun to affect many levels of society. And, in conjunction with an amatory neo-Platonic view of the Christian exhortation to love (1 John 4:11–12), it seemed to encourage spiritual libertinism. Jourda, in his edition of Rabelais, suggests that the social structure of Rabelais’ Island of Ennasin (bk. 4, chap. 9) parodies such spiritual *alliances* as that between Marot and Anne d’Alençon; the Rabelaisian “Island of Alliances” is associable with the ideas of the one-time Franciscan Tourangeau de Tours. (See Telle, “île,” p. 166, and Telle, *L’Oeuvre de Marguerite*, pp. 299–312.)

53. Chaucer, *Boece*, Bk. 2, Prosa 3, ll. 30-31, in *Riverside Chaucer*, p. 410.

54. Elizabeth I, *Englishings*, p. 54 (= Boethius, *Consolation* 3.6). The Latin reads: *Omne hominum genus in terris simili surgit ab ortu. Unus enim rerum pater est*. When the great Alfred, King of the West Saxons, translated these famous lines in the ninth century, he changed "the Father of all things" into "the father and mother of the race." Friedman comments: "Seemingly Alfred preferred the concept of a concrete biblical blood cousinry to the abstract mystical brotherhood of men, sons of a spiritual father, which his text, influenced by late Stoicism, intended" ("When Adam Delved," pp. 220-21).

55. D. Cox, "The Lord's Prayer," in Farr, ed., *Selected Poetry* 2, 503.

56. For the proverb and its corollaries in England and elsewhere, see Friedman, "'When Adam Delved.'"

57. The inability of King Edward, Elizabeth's half-brother, to disinherit his two half-sisters Princess Mary and Princess Elizabeth, hence to devise the succession to Jane Grey in 1552, would seem to prove this rule.

58. Bale, "Conclusion," esp. Folio 42v-46r.

59. With this double meaning, compare Latin *sacer*. Cf. Freud, *Totem*, p. 18.

60. *Measure for Measure*, 3.1.138-39. John Bale, in his edition of *A Godly Medytacyon*, translates the name Elizabeth as meaning *Dei mei requies*, or "the rest of my God." Bale, "Epistle Dedicatory," Folio 9r.

61. *Sponsa Christi* is a technical term used as early as Tertullian. See Jerome's theory of the virgin as the bride of Christ and of "spiritual matrimony" (letter 107, in *Epistulae* 55:298; cf. Dumm, *Virginity*, p. 74). For a modern version of the theory, see Pius XII, "Sponsa Christi." For an anthropological view of the institution of women marrying gods in Christianity and in other cultures, see Westermarck, *History of Human Marriage* 1:403-6, and M. E. Harding, *Woman's Mysteries*.

62. Millin, *Antiquités nationales*, 3.28.6, on an inscription at Ecouis; my translation.

63. Millin, *Antiquités nationales* 3.28.6. Luther retells such stories of incest in his *Tischreden*. See Montaiglon's note to the thirtieth tale in his edition of the *Heptaméron*, by Marguerite of Navarre (4, 281-83), and Saintsbury's note in his edition (3, 214-16).

64. Millin, *Antiquités nationales* 3.28.6; my translation.

65. *Pericles, Prince of Tyre*, 1.1.65-72. The vital solution in *Pericles* requires a resurrection—wife and daughter, believed dead, are reborn from their living deaths in a religious institution and a brothel. Dramatically, the solution to the riddle of Antiochus involves assigning to Pericles and Marina the roles of Antiochus and Antiochus' daughter; beyond the resurrection of the two women, the plot enacts a final rebirth, as Pericles calls it, of the father, Pericles, from the daughter, Marina ("Thou that beget'st him that did thee beget"; 5.1.197). In this atonement, Pericles foreshadows kinship relations in all the other romances.

66. Taylor, *Shakespeare's Darker Purpose*, p. 69, compares the riddle in *Pericles* with similar riddles in two of Shakespeare's sources, Gower's *Confessio Amantis*, and Twine's 1594 translation of Apollonius of Tyre, *The Patterne of Painefull Adventures*; however, *Confessio Amantis* and *The Patterne of Painefull Adventures* do not play up the spiritual nunnish-or-monkish quality of simultaneous parenthood, spousehood, and childhood in the same way that *Pericles* does. For Medrano: see Rank, *Inzest-Motiv*, pp. 334-35.

67. Rabelais, *Gargantua and Pantagruel*, bk. 4, chap. 9, p. 468.

68. Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 26v.

69. Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 43r-v. For the poet-lover in this fourfold kinship role, see also such passages as: "O my father, brother, child, and spouse" (Fol. 21r); "O what a sweet rest it is, of the mother, and the son together" (Fol. 26r); and "Now then that we are brother and sister together, I care but little for all other men" (Fol. 29r).

70. Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 13r, 19r-v.

71. Elizabeth, letter to Catharine Parr, December 31, 1544, Folio 3r.

72. The sinful soul is a fourfold traitor: the *child* who leaves the home of the father (as in Luke 15); the *parent* who fails to watch out for the child (3 Kings); the *sibling* who betrays the brother (Numbers 12); and the *spouse* who is adulterous.

73. Bale, "Conclusion," Folios 39r, 40r.

74. Salminen dismisses the fourfold kinship in Marguerite's poem as a strange mysticism: "Marguerite se perd dans un mysticisme étrange: elle décrit l'union de l'âme avec le Sauveur à l'aide des métaphores se rapportant aux relations de parenté. Elle se nomme tour à tour la soeur, la mère, l'épouse et la fille de Dieu" (Salminen, *Miroir*, p. 81).

75. Bale, "Conclusion," Folio 39r. A late instance of the Elizabethan fourfold kin topos occurs in Aemilia Lanyer's reference in *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* (1611) to a new Cynthia (i.e., Elizabeth Tudor). Of her it is said that Jesus is "Her Sonne, her Husband, Father . . ." (Travitsky, *Paradise of Women*, pp. 99, 101); see also Lewalski, "Of God and Good Women."

76. For example: the *Marguerites*, *Dialogue*, *Triomphe de l'Agneau*, the *Coche*, *Prisons*, and perhaps the *Comedies*. Such works as *The Mirror of the Sinful Soul* and *Discord Being in Man by the Contrariness of the Spirit and the Flesh and Peace [Being in Man] by the Spiritual Life*, both written in 1531, are in some measure commentary on the doctrine of liberty in Saint Paul's *Letter to the Romans*.

77. Marguerite, *Heptameron*, trans. Saintsbury, 3, 192. (All references below are to the Saintsbury translation.)

78. Marguerite, *Heptameron* 3, 200.

79. Some literary historians have sought to use the story that Marguerite of Navarre was raped in the 1520s to elucidate her tales about rape, including those where religious Brothers rape lay women and Sisters (e.g., tale 72), but they generally ignore the definition of spiritual incest as "sexual relations involving any Brother or Sister" and so they tend to overlook the relationship between the physical incest described in the *Heptameron* and the transformation of physical incest into spiritual incest depicted in *Le Miroir de l'âme pécheresse*. On the presumed rape of Marguerite by Admiral Bonnivet, see Brantôme, *Dames galantes*, pp. 422–23; cited by Cholakian, *Rape*, p. 9.

80. Marguerite, *Heptameron* 3, 201.

81. Marguerite, *Heptameron* 3, 195.

82. *Love's Labour's Lost* 1.1.13; cf. David ed., 50–51, 206–7. Shakespeare very probably knew the work of Marguerite; her influence is suggested by his depiction of academic celibacy in *Love's Labour's Lost*, whose Princess is modeled on Marguerite of Valois, her grandniece. See esp. Lefranc, *Découverte* and *Sous le Masque de Shakespeare*, and the endorsement of Lefranc's position in David's introduction, p. 39.

83. Here too there are biographical dimensions to Marguerite's concern with incest, as to Elizabeth's: for example, Marguerite's love for her brother, King Francis of France, is the subject of her greatest poetry; Saintsbury remarks that "it has been asserted that improper relations existed between the brother and the sister," though the historical evidence is not conclusive on the side of either chastity or incest (*Heptameron*, Introduction, p. 56).

84. See Ames, "Introduction" to Elizabeth, *Mirror*, p. 42.

85. Lefranc, *Idées religieuses*, p. 15; Ames, p. 42.

86. Calvin, *Contre la secte phantastique et furieuse des Libertins qui se nomment spirituels* (1545), in *Opera omnia* 7, 145–248. For the antinomian beliefs of the Libertines, see Walker, *Calvin*, pp. 293–94. Calvin's attack offended Marguerite, and he wrote an ambiguously apologetic letter to her on April 28, 1545 (*Opera omnia* 12, 65). On Marguerite and the Libertines, see also G. Schneider, *Libertin*, esp. pp. 81–84, and Dagens, "Miroir."

87. OED 2:1053b; cf. Matt. 19:21.

88. Vautrollier, *Commentarie*, p. 85, marg. (ed. 1577). Luther resented the canonical

imposition of celibacy laws, which, given the conflation of intent and act that characterizes his notion of faith, were impossible for almost all human beings—including such monks and priests as himself—to fulfill.

89. OED 7:684c.

90. Freud, *Totem*, p. 7.

91. “Anyone who has transgressed one of these prohibitions,” writes Freud, “acquires the characteristic of being prohibited” (*Totem*, p. 22; cf. p. 35). Cf. Freud, “Taboo on Virginity” and “Obsessive Acts and Religious Practices.”

92. Cf. Luke 14:26.

93. Marguerite, *Miroir*, 11. 267–68. A translation of Matthew 12:50: “Quicumque enim fecerit voluntatem Patris mei . . . ipse meus frater, et soror et mater est.” Elizabeth’s translation of this reads: “Those that shall do the will of My father, they are my brethren and my mother” (“Glass,” Folio 17r).

94. For a monk or nun it is official Church doctrine and law that concubinage or marriage to anyone is incest. See chap. 1, note 69.

95. Murray, introduction to Melville, *Pierre*, p. 55.

96. Freud, *Civilization*, pp. 48–49.

97. “Il Canto di Frate Sole,” in St. Francis, *Scritti*, p. 168; trans. as “The Canticle of Brother Sun,” in St. Francis, *Omnibus of Sources*, ed. Habig, 130–31.

98. Bonaventure, *The Soul’s Journey into God* (thirteenth century), p. 93. Franciscans generally regarded Bonaventure, the “Seraphic [or Franciscan] Doctor,” as the principal theological and philosophical spokesperson for their order.

99. See also Harney, *Brother and Sister Saints*, for a useful discussion of sibling saints mentioned in that work.

100. *Ency. Brit.* (11th ed.) 18:691. See also Athanasius, *Vita Antonii*.

101. *Ency. Brit.* (11th ed.) 18:691.

102. Three days later, Scholastica died; in the course of time, Benedict joined her in a single grave. See St. Gregory the Great, *Vita S. Benedicti*.

103. Hartmann von Aue, *Gregorius*.

104. St. Leander, *Regula*, 5, 331–32, *Patrologiae* (Latina) 72:874–94.

105. St. Leander, *Regula*, quoted from Montalembert, *Monks* 2:188.

106. St. Damasus, *Epigrammata*, trans. Joseph F. M. Marique, cited in Harney, *Brother and Sister Saints*, p. 20.

107. Lioba the Sister, seeking to serve her cousin Saint Boniface, wrote him thus: “God grant, unworthy as I am, that I might have the honor of having you for my brother.” She closed the letter with the following suggestive verse: “May the Almighty judge, who made the earth / And glorious in His kingdom reigns, / Preserve your chaste fire warm as at its birth, / Till time for you shall lose its rights and pains” (Harney, *Brother and Sister Saints*, p. 93; see also Willibald of Mainz, *Vita S. Bonifacii*). Saint Boniface asked that at her death Saint Lioba be buried in his grave, but the monks of Fulda did not carry out his request.

108. Cited in Harney, *Brother and Sister Saints*, p. 114.

109. Bernard’s *Sermones in Cantica Canticones* demonstrate “la dernière libération de l’âme” [the ultimate liberation of the soul] of which Paul preaches (Viller, *Dictionnaire de spiritualité* 1:1475; cf. Bugge, *Virginitas*, p. 90).

110. Curtius, *European Literature*, p. 122.

111. Victoria Lincoln, *Teresa*, pp. xxv, 10. Cf. Egido, “Historical Setting.”

112. Teresa, *Life*, IV, in *Complete Works*.

113. Teresa, *Way of Perfection*, IV, in *Complete Works* 2, 17; cf. VIII, 2, 39.

114. *Complete Works* 2, 415; and (from *Way of Perfection*, XXXVII) 2, 161.

115. John of the Cross, *Precautions* V, in his *Collected Works*, trans. Kavanaugh and Rodriguez, p. 656.

116. Victoria Lincoln, *Teresa*, p. 24; cf. *Teresa, Life*, II, in *Complete Works*, and *Book of her Life*, 2.6, and *Rules for a Brotherhood*. To the list of saintly siblings mentioned in this chapter might be added Heloise and Abelard. They lived together, first in spiritual incest of a physical kind (he a Brother, she a laywoman), then as secret husband and wife. After Abelard was castrated at the command of Heloise's uncle, she became a Sister and they lived as "brother and sister"—to quote the letters between them (Leclerq, *Monks and Love*, esp. p. 119).

117. Knowles and Hadcock, *Medieval Religious Houses*, esp. pp. 104–5, 194–95, 202.

118. The oldest manuscript of Marguerite Porete's powerful *Mirror of Simple Souls* (the Chantilly manuscript; see Dagens, "Miroir," p. 288, and Hauser, *Études sur la réforme française*) was found at Fontevault. Porete's Antinomian influence on Marguerite of Navarre and the Siblings, or Brethren, of the Free Spirit will be discussed in a later section.

119. Marguerite of Navarre, *Heptameron*, 3rd day, tale 30, 3, 202. Robert d'Arbissel, the founder of the abbey of Fontevault, was himself accused of sleeping in the same bed with nuns; see Bayle, *Dictionnaire* 6, 508–10.

120. *Ency. Brit.* (11th ed.) 18:691.

121. On Ochino and his stay in England from 1547 to 1553, see Benrath, *Ochino*, pp. 172–99. On Elizabeth's 1547 translation, see Craster, "Unknown Translation," p. 723. The autograph manuscript is at the Bodleian Library (Swaim, "New Year's Gift," pp. 261–65).

122. For Bale's defense of his marriage, see *Scriptorium illus. Brit.*, p. 702; for Rome's condemnation, see Pits, *Relationum Historicum*, pp. 53–59.

123. Bale, *Image of Both Churches*, p. 537.

124. "Rabelais's [bastard] children were granted the unusual privilege of an official legitimization by the Pope Himself" (Screech, *Rabelaisian Marriage*, pp. 19–20; cf. Lesellier, "Deux Enfants naturels").

125. For Luther's critique of religious celibacy, see his "Exhortation to All Clergy," esp. pp. 40–52, and "Exhortation to the Knights."

126. "Love needs no laws," said Luther, sweeping away "those stupid barriers due to spiritual fatherhood, motherhood, brotherhood, sisterhood, and childhood"—or so Brain, *Friends and Lovers*, p. 94, has it. (Cf. Luther, "Persons . . . Forbidden to Marry," in *Works* 45, 8, and "Estate of Marriage," *Works* 45, 24.) Luther did not sweep away all barriers to marriage, however. He stressed the distinction between figure and letter, or spirit and body, and thus redefined the incest taboo in terms of a literal, or corporeal, principle.

127. *Ancrene Riwe* 106/21; as quoted, from the Corpus Christi College (Cambridge) manuscript, by Kurath and Reidy, eds., *Middle English Dictionary*, s.v. "Incest," from the *Dictionary's* photostatic copy of the manuscript in Ann Arbor, Michigan.

128. Rolle, *Form*, 413.

129. [Lacy], *Ten Commandments*, 4068.

130. 2, 4068–71. See also W.H. Black, ed., *The Life and Martyrdom of Thomas Beket*, line 757.

131. Chaucer, *Parson's Tale*, l. 908, in *Works*, p. 258.

132. On the Benedictine orders and the idealist policies that More promulgates in *Utopia*, see Chambers, *More*, p. 136; More, *Utopia*, pp. 281–82. Although More generally admired the Catholic orders and their doctrines (Hexter, *More's Utopia*, pp. 85–90), he was not a monk or friar but a husband and legitimate father.

133. *Ency. Brit.* (11th ed.) 5:603.

134. More, *Tindale*, pp. 48–49. Cf. Luther's references to the "incestuous celibacy" of the papists in *Tischreden* 2, 138–391.

135. Matt. 23:8. Christianity proposes a universalist doctrine that both incorporates and transcends ordinary kinship with an extraordinary unifamilial kinship. Cf. Gal. 3:26–28: "For in Christ Jesus you are all sons of God . . . There is neither Jew nor Greek . . . for ye are

all one in Christ Jesus." Church Fathers who urge Christians to obey to follow out the implications of Matt. 23:8 in such a way as to call all men their "brothers" and to call *no one* by the name "father" include: Ignatius of Antioch, "To the Ephesians," 10.3; Clement of Alexandria, *Stromata*, 7.14.5; Justinian, *Dialogue with Tryphon*, 96; and Tertullian, *Apologeticus*, 39.8–9.

136. 1 Cor. 5:1.

137. Adela Collins, "Excommunication," p. 253.

138. 1 Cor. 10:23; and Lev. 18:8. For this position on Corinthians, see Allo, "Saint Paul," p. 121; and Conzelmann, *1 Corinthians*, p. 97.

139. Rabelais' chapter entitled "Pantagruel reaches the Island of Ennasin [cf. "Essene"], and of the strange Relationships there" is bk. 4, chap. 9.

140. For a general account of the Brethren see Cohn, "Cult." In Italy St. Bernardine of Siena was affected by the Brethren. (See Bernardine of Siena, *Opera omnia*, 1:34, 536; 3:109; 4:544; 6:248). In Germany the Brethren influenced the philosophical Meister Eckhardt and the polygamist Anabaptists of Münster. (Telle, "Île," p. 169; and see *Ency. Brit.* (11th ed.) 8:886). The sixteenth-century Belgian David Joris, a prominent member of a local sect influenced by the Free Spirit, had an effect on Bosch, whose painting, "The Garden of Earthly Delights," is said to depict the Free Spirit's "incestuous orgies" (Fraenger, *Millennium*, p. 42).

141. This was the motto of the Libertine Brethren (Telle, *Marguerite*, p. 297).

142. 2 Cor. 3:17.

143. Women were especially prominent as the theorists of the Brethren of the Free Spirit. Thus the poet Bloemardinne (or Hadewijch) of Brussels wrote much of the spirit of liberty and supposedly impious sexual love. The "Homines Intelligentes" of Brussels were a local sect of the Free Spirit; their leaders, Giles Cantor and William Hilderniss, were condemned by Pierre Ailly, bishop of Cambrai, in 1411. See Pomerius, *De origine monasterii Viridivalli*, p. 286, and McDonnell, *Beguines and Beghards*, p. 502.

144. Similarities between the literary work of Marguerite of Navarre and Marguerite Porete include verbal parallels, as in the use of the term "Distant Close" or *loingpres* (see Dagens, "Le 'Miroir des simples ames' et Marguerite de Navarre") and historical connections (see Bédier, "La tradition manuscrite," Eekhoud, *Les Libertins d'Anvers*, and Frederichs, "Luthérien français").

145. The relation between Lutheran doctrine and Spiritual Liberty as they converge in the court of Navarre is the subject of Frederichs, "Luthérien français," and Eekhoud, *Libertins d'Anvers*.

146. See Perrens, *Libertins*.

147. See Doiron, "Middle English Translation."

148. Champneys, *Harvest*.

149. Gardiner (*Great Civil War* 3, 380) writes of the Levelers that "they have given themselves a new name, Viz. Levelers, for they intend to set all things straight and raise a parody and community in the kingdom." Cromwell attacked the Levelers in his speech to parliament in September 1654, quoted by Carlyle in his *Cromwell's Letters and Speeches*, Speech number 2: "Did not that Leveling principle tend to the reducing of all to an inequality." On the Ranters, see below.

150. Parrington, *The Romantic Revolution*, pp. 335–36, suggests that the basis for American Perfectionism lies not so much in French Romanticism or German Idealism as in a medieval utopian past that extends to the religious utopianism of the 1650s and to Roger Williams and beyond, and that Noyes and his Perfectionists were at one with the Diggers and Levelers of Commonwealth times.

151. The sociologist Lewis Yablonsky describes a ritual (now called "the funeral of the

hippie movement”) involving San Francisco hippies. Their “explicit idea was to bury the hippie image, as they put it, produced by the mass media, and to signal the birth of *The Free Man*” (Yablonsky, *Hippie Trip*, p. 290). The Love Children wanted to be Brethren of the Free Spirit.

152. In the 1520s Lollards and other groups tracing their origin to Wycliffe came together with Lutherans and thus became a sect to be contended with (*Ency. Brit.* [11th ed.] 8:529).

153. *Ency. Brit.* (11th ed.) 1:905, referring to an event of 12 April 1549.

154. Athanasian Christian Church doctrine claims that the Virgin Mary had no biological part in the making of her baby. In the first half of the ninth century, Theosterikos said the following about the iconoclast emperor Constantine V: “Taking in his hand a purse full of gold and showing it to all he asked, What is it worth? They replied that it had great value. He then emptied out the gold and asked, What is it worth now? They said, Nothing. So, said he, Mary (for the atheist would not call her Theotokos), while she carried Christ within was to be honoured, but after she was delivered she differed in no way from other women” (*Vitae Nicetae*, in *Acta Sanct.*, Ap. I, app. 23; cited in Edward Martin, *History*, p. 62).

155. Telle, “île,” p. 169.

156. Regarding the view that Ann Askew may have been one of Catherine Parr’s ladies in waiting, see *Writings of Ed[ward] VI*, p. 238.

157. Cited in McDonnell, *Beguines and Beghards*, p. 497.

158. See Hartmann’s interrogation at Erfurt by Walter Kerling, recounted in von Dollinger, *Sektengeschichte* 2, 386.

159. Leff, *Heresy* 1, 378–79.

160. Leff, *Heresy* 1, 378–79.

161. “Amye, amez et faites ce que tu vouldrez” (Marguerite Porete, *Miroir*, ed. Guarnieri, Folio 26v).

162. Porete, St. John’s manuscript, Folio 15v–29r.

163. Porete, St. John’s manuscript, Folio 5. The Council of Vienne of 1311–12 condemned this statement in its French version, *congé des vertues* being treated by the council as *licentiat a se virtutes*.

164. Porete, St. John’s manuscript, Folio 10r. This statement was also condemned at Vienne.

165. In 1650 in England, Abiezer Coppe, a member of the Ranter sect, promulgated the Brethren’s view that “God dwelt inside them, as an inner light whose authority was above all laws. . . . Sin was thus made to disappear. The consequence was, for some Ranters, sexual license” (Carey, Foreword, in Nigel Smith, ed., *Ranter Writings*, p. 7). Coppe described the state beyond “good” and “evil” in terms of “the mother Eternity, Almightyness, who is universal love” and to whose child dress and undress, incest and chastity, are alike—he knows no evil (quoted in Cohn, “Cult of the Free Spirit,” p. 68).

166. Quoted in Cohn, “Cult of the Free Spirit,” p. 59.

167. Quoted in Cohn, “Cult of the Free Spirit,” p. 56.

168. Elizabeth, “Glass,” Folio 62v.

169. “Fay ce que voudras” (*Gargantua*, ii, chap. 57). The liberty of Rabelais’ abbey is often interpreted as mere “Epicurean” (i.e., gluttonous) intemperance or desire for a heaven on earth (see, e.g., Kennard, *Friar in Fiction*, p. 58), but it also has a serious libertine aspect. Bakhtin, *Rabelais*, p. 412, compares Thélème to the medieval parody *The Rules of Blessed Libertine*.

170. “Telles âmes roynes, filles de roy, seurs de roy, et espouses de roy” (Marguerite Porete, *Miroir*, ed. Guarnieri, Folio 26v).

171. Elizabeth, “Glass,” Folio 43r.

172. See the A.D. 1309 charges against Marguerite Porete listed in *Grands Chroniques* 5, 188.

173. English devotional works similarly depict Jesus as a female lover or as both a male lover and a female parent taken together. Among such works are the Middle English translation of Aelred of Rievaulx's *De vita eremitica* (p. 329), Juliana of Norwich's *Revelationes* (pp. 58–60), and *Ureisun of Ure Louerde* (Thompson, p. 2). A basic biblical text here, of interest to Marguerite of Navarre and Queen Elizabeth, is St. Paul's Letter to the Galatians. Paul writes that we become "one [heis] in Christ, neither man nor woman" (Gal 3:28)—though "one" [heis] is here masculine (as in Eph. 2:15, 4:13), not neuter (as in Eph. 2:14). Franciscan theologians often portray maleness and femaleness joined together, not in what we normally assume to be the closest union (marriage), but in roles that would normally be impediments to that union (namely, mother and son, or brother and sister). (Cousins, *Bonaventure*, p. 20.)

174. Porete, St. John's manuscript Folio 13r–13v. Elizabeth, in her "Glass," asks, "For what thing is a man (as for his own strength) before he hath received the gift of faith" (Folio 5r). Bale, in his "Epistle Dedicatory," refers to "the barren doctrine and the works without faith" (Folio 7v). Marguerite of Navarre, in Queen Elizabeth's translation, writes of the "thing a man cannot understand unless he hath a true faith" (Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 14r); "If we have Him through faith then have we a greater treasure than any man can tell" (Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 62v).

175. One example of the mockery of "erotic communism" is Jean de Meun's contribution (ca. 1275) to Guillaume de Lorris' *The Romance of the Rose*, esp: "Toutes pour touz e touz pour toutes." Here "the goddess Natura has become the servant of rank promiscuity" (cited in Curtius, *European Literature*, p. 6). Bakhtin discusses *The Rules of Blessed Libertine*, a parody of monastic laws similarly built upon sanctifying that which is forbidden, in *Rabelais*, p. 412.

176. Von Dollinger, *Sektengeschichte* 2, p. 664. See also Schneider, *Libertin*, p. 60.

177. In his *Articles of Visitation*, Melanchthon claims, for example, that Luther's doctrine of the "freedom of a Christian" was interpreted by some Protestant reformers as a charter for moral laxity; Melanchthon argues for the preaching of the Ten Commandments as a guide to the good works that are to follow true faith (Franklin Sherman, Introduction to Luther, "Against the Antinomians"). For a study of the relationship between the Brethren of the Free Spirit and French Protestantism, see Frederichs, "Lutherien français," and for a general discussion of the role of the doctrines of the free spirit in the Reformation, see Guarnieri, "Il movimento del libero spirito dalle origini al secolo xvi" and "Appendici" (in Guarnieri, *Il movimento del libero spirito*, pp. 114–49, 336–58). On the *Miroir* as Protestant in the reformist tradition of Guillaume Briçonnet and Simon du Bois, see Salminen in her edition of the text, pp. 40ff., 62ff., as well as Lefranc, *Les Idées religieuses*; on its Protestant mystical aspects, see Skommodau, *Die religiösen Dichtungen*.

178. See Cooper, "Incest Prohibitions," p. 2.

179. Elyot, *Image of Governauce*, 34; Chapman, *Iliad*, 16.501.

180. Wilkinson, *Supplication*, p. 34.

181. Wilkinson, *Supplication*, p. 19.

182. Rogers, *Displaying*, sig. 15r.

183. *The Family of Love*, a comic play probably written by Thomas Middleton and performed by the Children of the Revels, contains a trial scene in which the Family's sexual freedom is institutionalized in law. See Shepherd's introduction to his edition of the *Family*, p. iii; Cherry, *Most Unvaluedst Purchase*; and Halley, "English Family of Love."

184. *Monk* means "alone" (from Greek *monachos*). However, not all monks were *ancho-rites* living in solitude. Some were *coenobites* (from *koinos*, "common," and *bios*, "life").

