

AUTHORITARIANISM AND DEMOCRACY IN LATIN AMERICA
Social Studies Junior Tutorial
Spring 2007
Tuesday 2-4pm CGIS (1737 Cambridge St.)

Professor Steven Levitsky

Office: Weatherhead Center for International Affairs, 1737 Cambridge St. Rm N204

Phone: 495-9997

E-mail: levitsky@wcfia.harvard.edu

Office Hours: Monday and Wednesday, 3:45-5:15pm, and by appointment

The establishment and consolidation of democratic regimes has long been a difficult--and elusive--challenge in Latin America. In the twentieth century, 5 factors such as economic underdevelopment, poverty and inequality, and Cold War geopolitics contributed to regime instability and frequent periods of authoritarian rule. In the 1980s and 1990s, virtually all Latin American countries made transitions to competitive electoral regimes. Can democracy be sustained? Or will contemporary regimes give way to another cycle of authoritarianism?

This tutorial examines political regimes and regime change in Latin America in the twentieth century. The course is divided into five sections. The first section provides conceptual and theoretical tools for studying democratization. We first look at how different scholars have defined and used the term democracy. We then compare different theoretical approaches to explaining democratization, including modernization, neo-Marxist, cultural, leadership-centered, and path dependent approaches. The second section examines the breakdown of democratic regimes in the 1960s and 1970s. We analyze different explanations for the rise of authoritarianism in Argentina, Brazil, Chile, and Peru (and democratic survival in Venezuela). We then look at the political, economic, and human consequences of military rule. The third section examines the democratic transitions of the 1980s and 1990s. We compare different approaches to explaining these transitions, focusing on factors such as leadership, class, and the international context. We also examine how legacies of authoritarianism and different modes of transition shape the prospects for democratic consolidation, particularly in the area of civil-military relations. The fourth section examines challenges to democratic stability in the contemporary period, focusing on the effects of economic crisis and market reform, and of political institutions such as presidentialism and political parties and party systems. The final section looks at the prospects for “deepening” democracy in Latin America. We explore the question of how to strengthen executive accountability (checks and balances), as well as how structural problems such as state weakness, the (un)rule of law, and vast inequality affect the quality of democracy.

Course Requirements

(1) Participation in seminar (30 percent of grade)

(2) Two short (approximately 6-8 page) papers on course readings (topics to be assigned).

Due: March 9 and April 13 (each paper is 15% of grade).

(3) Final research paper of roughly 25 pages. Students must discuss their topic with me and have it approved before writing their prospectus (35% of grade). **Due: End of semester**

(4) A prospectus for the research paper (approximately 3-5 pages), which will identify the problem to be examined, cite relevant literature, frame working hypotheses, and provide an initial bibliography. **Due April 20** (5% of grade)

Late Policy: Barring an extraordinary excuse, all late papers will be marked down a third of a grade for each day following the due date.

Course Readings: All readings have been placed on reserve at Lamont library.

In addition to the texts listed below, there is a course reading packet, which is available for purchase at Gnomon Copy (1034 Mass. Ave.).

The following texts are available for purchase at the Coop.

Nancy Bermeo, *Ordinary People in Extraordinary Times: The Citizenry and the Breakdown of Democracy* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003).

Pamela Constable and Arturo Valenzuela, *A Nation of Enemies: Chile Under Pinochet* (New York, W.W. Norton, 1991)

Youssef Cohen, *Radicals, Reformers, and Reactionaries: The Prisoner's Dilemma and the Collapse of Democracy in Latin America* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994).

Robert Dahl, *Polyarchy: Participation and Opposition* (New Haven, Yale University Press, 1971)

Larry Diamond, Jonathan Hartlyn, Juan J. Linz, and Seymour Martin Lipset, eds. *Democracy in Developing Countries: Latin America* (Second ed.) (Boulder: Lynne Rienner, 1999). [Recommended]

Frances Hagopian and Scott Mainwaring, eds. *The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005)

Scott Mainwaring and Christopher Welna, *Democratic Accountability in Latin America* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003).

Guillermo O'Donnell and Philippe C. Schmitter, *Transitions from Authoritarian Rule: Tentative Conclusions about Uncertain Democracies* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1986)

Alfred Stepan, *Rethinking Military Politics* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988)

Arturo Valenzuela, *The Breakdown of Democratic Regimes: Chile* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1978)

NOTE: Diamond, Hartlyn, Linz, and Lipset (eds), *Democracy in Developing Countries: Latin America* is recommended as background reading. It provides a basic overview of each country.

For those of you without any background on the cases, I recommend reading the relevant chapters (listed below). You do not need to know the details—just get the broad strokes. For the rest of you, these chapters will be useful references throughout the course.

Carlos Waisman, “Argentina: Capitalism and Democracy”

Bolívar Lamounier, “Brazil: Inequality Against Democracy”

Arturo Valenzuela, “Chile: Origins and Consolidation of a Latin American Democracy”

Cynthia McClintock, “Peru: Precarious Regimes, Authoritarian and Democratic”

Daniel H. Levine and Brian F. Crisp, “Venezuela: The Character, Crisis, and Possible Future of Democracy”

Daniel C. Levy and Kathleen Bruhn, “Mexico: Sustained Civilian Rule and the Question of Democracy”

Week 1: What is Democracy? (February 6)

Dahl, *Polyarchy*, pp. 1-80.

David Collier and Steven Levitsky, “Democracy 'With Adjectives': Conceptual Innovation in Comparative Research.” Kellogg Institute Working Paper No. 230 (August 1996).

Samuel Huntington, “The Modest Meaning of Democracy,” in Robert Pastor, ed. *Democracy in the Americas: Stopping the Pendulum* (Holmes and Meier, 1989).

Larry Diamond, *Developing Democracy: Toward Consolidation* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 1999), pp. 1-17.

Kenneth M. Roberts, *Deepening Democracy? The Modern Left and Social Movements in Chile and Peru* (Stanford University Press, 1998), pp. 25-41.

Week 2: Theories of Democratization (February 13)

Seymour Martin Lipset, *Political Man: The Social Bases of Politics* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 1959/1981), pp. 27-63.

Adam Przeworski and Fernando Limongi, “Modernization: Theories and Facts,” *World Politics* 49 (January 1997).

Dietrich Rueschemeyer, Evelyne Huber Stephens and John D. Stephens, *Capitalist Development and Democracy* (University of Chicago Press, 1992), pp. 40-78.

Barrington Moore, *Social Origins of Dictatorship and Democracy: Lord and Peasant in the Making of the Modern World* (Beacon Press, 1966), pp. 413-452.

Glen Dealy, "The Tradition of Monistic Democracy in Latin America," In Howard Wiarda, ed. *Politics and Social Change in Latin America: Still a Distinct Tradition?* (Third Ed.) (Westview Press, 1992).

Guiseppe Di Palma, *To Craft Democracies* (University of California Press, 1990), pp. 14-32; 40-61.

James Mahoney and Richard Snyder, "Integrative Strategies for the Study of Regime Change," In Stein Ugelvik Larsen, ed. *The Challenges of Theories on Democratization* (Columbia University Press, 2000).

Week 3: The Breakdown of Democratic Regimes in the 1960s and 1970s: O'Donnell's Theory of Bureaucratic Authoritarianism and its Alternatives (February 20)

Guillermo O'Donnell, *Modernization and Bureaucratic Authoritarianism* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1973), pp. 1-8.

Guillermo O'Donnell, "Toward an Alternative Conceptualization of South American Politics," in Peter Klarén and Thomas J. Bossert, eds., *Promise of Development: Theories of Change in Latin America* (Westview Press, 1986), pp. 239-275.

David Collier, "Overview of the Bureaucratic-Authoritarian Model." In David Collier, ed. *The New Authoritarianism in Latin America* (Princeton University Press, 1979), pp. 19-32.

David Collier, "The Bureaucratic-Authoritarian Model: Synthesis and Priorities for Future Research," In David Collier, ed. *The New Authoritarianism in Latin America*, pp. 362-395.

Juan J. Linz, *The Breakdown of Democratic Regimes: Crisis, Breakdown, and Re-Equilibration* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 1978), pp. 3-5; 16-23; 27-38.

Alfred Stepan, "Political Leadership and Regime Breakdown: Brazil." In Juan Linz and Stepan, eds. *The Breakdown of Democratic Regimes: Latin America* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 1978), pp. 110-137.

Valenzuela, *The Breakdown of Democratic Regimes: Chile*, pp. 22-110.

Peter Kornbluh, *The Pinochet File: A Declassified Dossier on Atrocity and Accountability* (The New Press, 2003), Ch 1 (pp. 1-6 only); Chapter 2.

Read **one** of the following two:

Abraham F. Lowenthal, "Peru's Ambiguous Revolution." In Lowenthal, ed. *The Peruvian Experiment* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1975), pp. 3-43.

Terry Karl, "Petroleum and Political Pacts: The Transition to Democracy in Venezuela." *Latin American Research Review* XXII: 1 (1987), pp. 63-94.

Week 4: Revisiting the Bureaucratic Authoritarian Coups: Recent Approaches to Explaining Democratic Breakdown in Latin America (February 27)

Youssef Cohen, *Radicals, Reformers, and Reactionaries: The Prisoner's Dilemma and the Collapse of Democracy in Latin America*. Read Chapters 1-7

Nancy Bermeo, *Ordinary People in Extraordinary Times: The Citizenry and the Breakdown of Democracy*. Read chapters 1, 3 (Brazil), 5 (Chile), 6 (Argentina), and 7.

First Short Paper Handed Out: February 27

Week 5: Military Rule (March 6)

Hector Schamis, "Reconceptualizing Latin American Authoritarianism in the 1970s: From Bureaucratic Authoritarianism to Neoconservatism." *Comparative Politics* 23: 2 (1991).

Karen Remmer, *Military Rule in Latin America* (Unwin Hyman, 1989), pp. 3-21 and 77-110.

Patricia Weiss Fagen, "Repression and State Security," In Juan Corradi, Weiss Fagen, and Manuel A. Garreton, eds. *Fear at the Edge: State Terror and Resistance in Latin America* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992), pp. 39-71.

Constable and Valenzuela, *A Nation of Enemies*, Chapters 1, 4, and 7

Julio Cotler, "The New Mode of Political Domination in Peru." In Abraham Lowenthal, ed. *The Peruvian Experiment* (Princeton University Press, 1975).

Abraham Lowenthal, "The Peruvian Experiment Reconsidered," In Cynthia McClintock and Lowenthal, eds. *The Peruvian Experiment Reconsidered* (Princeton University Press, 1983).

--First Short Paper Due: Friday, March 9

Week 6: Explaining Democratization in the 1980s and 1990s (March 13)

Guillermo O'Donnell, "Tensions in the Bureaucratic State and the Question of Democracy," in David Collier, ed. *The New Authoritarianism in Latin America*.

Guillermo O'Donnell and Philippe Schmitter, *Transitions from Authoritarian Rule: Tentative Conclusions about Uncertain Democracies*, pp. 15-72.

Ruth Berins Collier and James Mahoney, "Adding Collective Actors to Collective Outcomes: Labor and Recent Democratization in South America and Southern Europe." *Comparative Politics* 29, no. 3 (April 1997), pp. 285-303.

Samuel Huntington, *The Third Wave* (Norman: Univ. of Oklahoma Press, 1991), pp. 31-108.

Andreas Schedler, "What is Democratic Consolidation?" *Journal of Democracy* 9, no. 2 (April 1998), pp. 91-107.

Andreas Schedler, "Measuring Democratic Consolidation." *Studies in Comparative International Development* 36: 1 (Spring): 66-92.

Week 7: Transitions, Authoritarian Legacies, and Civil-Military Relations (March 20)

Terry Lynn Karl, "Dilemmas of Democratization in Latin America." *Comparative Politics* 23: 1 (October 1990), pp. 1-21.

Frances Hagopian, "Democracy by Undemocratic Means: Elites, Political Pacts, and Regime Transition in Brazil." *Comparative Political Studies* 23, no. 2 (July 1990), pp. 147-169.

Constable and Valenzuela, *A Nation of Enemies*, Chapter 12

Gerardo L. Munck, *Authoritarianism and Democratization: Soldiers and Workers in Argentina, 1976-1983* (Pennsylvania State University Press, 1998), pp. 133-161.

Beatriz Magaloni, "The Demise of Mexico's One-Party Dominant Regime: Elite Choices and the Masses in the Establishment of Democracy," In Frances Hagopian and Scott Mainwaring, eds. *The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks*.

Alfred Stepan, *Rethinking Military Politics*, pp. 68-145.

Felipe Aguero, "Institutions, Transitions, and Bargaining: Civilians and the Military in Shaping Postauthoritarian Regimes." In David Pion-Berlin, ed. *Civil-Military Relations in Latin America: New Analytical Perspectives* (University of North Carolina Press).

Wendy Hunter, "Politicians Against Soldiers: Contesting the Military in Postauthoritarian Brazil." *Comparative Politics* 27, no. 4 (July 1995), pp. 425-443.

Wendy Hunter, "Continuity or Change? Civil-Military Relations in Democratic Argentina, Chile, and Peru." *Political Science Quarterly* 112, no. 3 (1997): 353-375.

Week 8: Spring Recess (Enjoy!)

Week 9: Economic Crisis, Market Reform, and Democracy (April 3)

Thomas Skidmore, "The Politics of Economic Stabilization in Postwar Latin America," in James Malloy, ed. *Authoritarianism and Corporatism in Latin America* (University of Pittsburgh Press, 1977).

José María Maravall, "The Myth of the Authoritarian Advantage." *Journal of Democracy* 5, No. 4 (October 1994), pp. 17-30.

Karen Remmer, "Democracy and Economic Crisis: The Latin American Experience." *World Politics* XLII, no. 3 (April 1990), pp. 315-335.

Adam Przeworski, *Democracy and the Market: Political and Economic Reforms in Eastern Europe and Latin America* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1991), pp. 136-187.

Kurt Weyland, *The Politics of Market Reform in Fragile Democracies: Argentina, Brazil, Peru, and Venezuela* (Princeton University Press, 2002), pp. 1-8, 37-70; 94-133.

Marcus Kurtz, "The Dilemmas of Democracy in the Open Economy: Lessons from Latin America." *World Politics* 56, No. 2 (January 2004).

Kurt Weyland, "Neoliberalism and Democracy in Latin America: A Mixed Record." *Latin American Politics and Society* 46, No. 1 (Spring 2004).

--Short Paper #2 handed out April 3--

Week 10: Do Institutions Matter (I)? Presidentialism, Party Systems, and Democratic Stability (April 10)

Juan Linz, "The Perils of Presidentialism," *Journal of Democracy* 1, No. 1 (Winter 1990).

Arturo Valenzuela, "Latin American Presidencies Interrupted." *Journal of Democracy* 15, No. 4 (October 2004).

Mathew Soberg Shugart and Scott Mainwaring: "Presidentialism and Democracy in Latin America: Rethinking the Terms of the Debate." In Scott Mainwaring and Mathew Soberg Shugart, eds. *Presidentialism and Democracy in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 12-54.

Scott Mainwaring, "Presidentialism, Multipartyism, and Democracy: the Difficult Combination," *Comparative Political Studies* 26, no. 2 (1993).

Scott Mainwaring and Timothy Scully, "Introduction: Party Systems in Latin America." In Scott Mainwaring and Timothy Scully (eds.), *Building Democratic Institutions: Party Systems in Latin America* (Stanford University Press, 1995).

José Antonio Cheibub, "Minority Governments, Deadlock Situations, and the Survival of Presidential Democracies," *Comparative Political Studies* 35, No. 3 (April 2002).

S.M. Lipset, "The Centrality of Political Culture," in Larry Diamond and Marc Plattner, eds. *The Global Resurgence of Democracy* (Johns Hopkins University Press), pp. 150-153.

John Carey, "The Reelection Debate in Latin America." *Latin American Politics and Society* 45, No. 1 (2003), pp. 119-133.

Steven Levitsky and María Victoria Murillo, "Variation in Institutional Strength in Latin America: Causes and Implications." Paper Presented at the International Meetings of the Latin American Studies Association, San Juan, Puerto Rico, March 15-18, 2006.

--Short Paper #2 due Friday, April 13--

Week 11: Do Institutions Matter (II)? Cases (April 17)

Read at least four of the following six cases:

(1) Argentina

Delia Ferreira Rubio and Matteo Goretti, "When the President Governs Alone: The Decretazo in Argentina, 1989-93." In John M. Carey and Mathew Soberg Shugart, eds. *Executive Decree*

Mariana Llanos and Ana Marghertis, "Why Do Presidents Fail? Political Leadership and the Argentine Crisis (1999-2001)," *Studies in Comparative international Development* 40, No. 4 (Winter 2006).

(2) Brazil

Scott Mainwaring, "Brazil: Weak Parties, Feckless Democracy." In Mainwaring and, eds. *Building Democratic Institutions: Party Systems in Latin America*.

Bolívar Lamounier, "Brazil: An Assessment of the Cardoso Administration," in Domínguez and Shifter, *Constructing Democratic Governance in Latin America* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003)

(3) Chile

Peter M. Siavelis, "Executive-Legislative Relations in Post-Pinochet Chile: A Preliminary Assessment." In Mainwaring and Shugart, eds. *Presidentialism and Democracy in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 1997).

Gerardo L. Munck and Jeffrey A. Bosworth, "Patterns of Representation and Competition: Parties and Democracy in Post-Pinochet Chile." *Party Politics* 4, No. 4 (Oct. 1998): 471-493.

(4) Mexico

Jeffrey Weldon, "Political Sources of *Presidencialismo* in Mexico." In Scott Mainwaring and Mathew Soberg Shugart, eds. *Presidentialism and Democracy in Latin America* (Cambridge University Press, 1997).

Denise Dresser, "Mexico: From PRI Predominance to Divided Democracy," in Domínguez and Shifter, *Constructing Democratic Governance in Latin America*.

(5) Peru

Maxwell A. Cameron, "Political and Economic Origins of Regime Change in Peru: The Eighteenth Brumaire of Alberto Fujimori." In Maxwell Cameron and Philip Mauceri, eds. *The Peruvian Labyrinth* (Penn State University Press, 1997).

Steven Levitsky and Maxwell Cameron, "Democracy without Parties? Political Parties and Regime Change in Fujimori's Peru." *Latin American Politics and Society* 45, No. 3 (Fall 2003).

(6) Venezuela

Michael Coppedge, *Strong Parties and Lame Ducks: Presidential Partyarchy in Venezuela* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1994), pp. 18-46.

Michael Coppedge, "Venezuela: Popular Sovereignty versus Liberal Democracy," in Jorge Domínguez and Michael Shifter, *Constructing Democratic Governance in Latin America* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003)

Prospectus Due: Friday April 20

Week 12: The Quality of Democracy: Issues of Executive Accountability (April 24)

Guillermo O'Donnell, "Delegative Democracy." *Journal of Democracy* 5, no. 1 (January 1994): 55-69.

Guillermo O'Donnell, "Horizontal Accountability in New Democracies," in Andreas Schedler, Larry Diamond, and Marc Plattner, eds. *The Self-Restraining State* (Lynne Rienner, 1999).

Gary W. Cox and Scott Morgenstern, "Latin America's Reactive Assemblies and Proactive Presidents." *Comparative Politics* 33, No. 2 (January 2001) 171-190.

Scott Mainwaring and Christopher Welna, *Democratic Accountability in Latin America*.
Read the following chapters:

Scott Mainwaring, "Introduction: Democratic Accountability in Latin America"

Erika Moreno, Brian Crisp, and Matthew Shugart, "The Accountability Deficit in Latin America" [CUT THIS?]

Scott Morgenstern and Luigi Manzetti, "Legislative Oversight: Interests and Institutions in the United States and Argentina"

Argelina Cheibub Figueiredo, "The Role of Congress as an Agency of Horizontal Accountability: Lessons from the Brazilian Experience."

ADD MAGALONI on MEX

Catalina Smulovitz and Enrique Peruzzotti, "Societal and Horizontal Controls: Two Cases of a Fruitful Relationship"

Week 13: The Quality of Democracy II: The State, Rule of Law, and Issues of Inequality (May 1)

Guillermo O'Donnell, "On the State, Democratization, and Some Conceptual Problems: A Latin American View with Some Postcommunist Countries," in O'Donnell, *Counterpoints: Selected Essays on Authoritarianism and Democratization* (University of Notre Dame Press, 1999).

Guillermo O'Donnell, "Polyarchies and the (Un)rule of Law in Latin America: A Partial Conclusion." In Juan Mendez, O'Donnell, and Paulo Sergio Pinheiro, eds. *The (Un)rule of Law and the Underprivileged in Latin America* (University of Notre Dame Press, 1999).

James Holston and Teresa P.R. Caldeira, "Democracy, Law, and Violence: Disjunctions of Brazilian Citizenship," In Felipe Aguero and Jeffrey Stark, eds. *Fault Lines of Democracy in Post-Transition Latin America* (Miami: North-South Center Press, 1998).

Scott Mainwaring, "The Crisis of Representation in the Andes," *Journal of Democracy* 17, No. 3 (July 2006).

Philip Oxhorn, "Social Inequality, Civil Society, and the Limits of Citizenship in Latin America." In Susan Eva Eckstein and Timothy P. Wickham-Crowley, eds. *What Justice? Whose Justice? Fighting for Fairness in Latin America* (University of California Press, 2003).

Evelyn Huber, Dietrich Rueschemeyer, and John D. Stephens, "The Paradoxes of Contemporary Democracy: Formal, Participatory, and Social Dimensions," *Comparative Politics* (April 1997)

Patricio Silva, "Doing Politics in a Depoliticized Society: Social Change and Political Deactivation in Chile," *Bulletin of Latin American Research* 23, No. 1 (January 2004).

Deborah Yashar, "Democracy, Indigenous Movements, and the Postliberal Challenge in Latin America," *World Politics* 52, No. 1 (October 1999), pp. 76-104.

Richard Snyder and David Samuels, "Devaluing the Vote in Latin America." *Journal of Democracy* 12, No. 1 (January): 146-159.

Week 14: Diverging Paths: Explaining Contemporary Regime Trajectories in Latin America (Time and place to be announced)

Frances Hagopian and Scott Mainwaring, eds. *The Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America: Advances and Setbacks*. Read the following chapters:

Scott Mainwaring and Aníbal Pérez Liñan, "Latin American Democratization since 1978: Democratic Transitions, Breakdowns, and Erosions."

Steven Levitsky, "Argentina: Democratic Survival Amidst Economic Failure"

Kurt Weyland, "The Growing Sustainability of Brazil's Low-Quality Democracy"

Martín Tanaka, “Peru 1980-2000: Chronicle of a Death Foretold? Determinism, Political Decisions, and Open Outcomes”

Michael Coppedge, “Explaining Democratic Deterioration in Venezuela through Nested Inference”

Frances Hagopian, “Conclusions: Government Performance, Political Representation, and Public Perceptions of Contemporary Democracy in Latin America.”

Also read:

Chappell Lawson, “Fox’s Mexico at Midterm,” *Journal of Democracy* 15, No. 1 (Jan 2004).

Final Paper due: Date TBA