issue with Schlegel's position that the pardons are free but would agree that
the official purpose of the Duke is not accomplished. Tennenhouse writes
("Representing Power," p. 146) that "the duke does not and cannot change
the law that equates the crime of Mistress Overdone with that of Claudio, nor
can he alter the law that condemns Claudio to death."


56. Traversi (Approach, p. 112), e.g., writes that the central issue of the play
is "to find for the law a necessary sanction in experience without depriving it
of the firmness and impartiality upon which its maintenance depends." But
why should Shakespeare choose this particular law? The law against fornication
not only represents the others as part to whole but is also the foundation
of all law.


58. Aquinas, *Summa*, q. 154, art. 9 (p. 1823). For "antonomasia," see idem,
p. 1824.

59. The discrepancy between the two numbers (see 1.3.21 and 1.2.157)
leaves a mythic vagueness to the action.

60. John Gower's *Confessio Amantis* (8.67–74), a source for Shakespeare's
*Pericles of Tyre*, considers the fratricide Cain's incestuous relations with his sis-
ter Calmana. On the pair, see also Sanhedrin 58b, in I. Epstein, ed., *Talmud*.

61. We should not take Pompey's remark too lightly. In eighteenth-century
Russia, the Skoptsy sect's distrust of the body extended to the logical extreme
of castration. "After an orgiastic farewell to the genitals the Skoptsy castrated
themselves" (Peterkiewicz, *Third Adam*, p. 129). The Church Father Origen
castrated himself, though he later regretted having done so (Eusebius, *History
of the Church*, VI, 8, p. 247). Some people interpret castration to be the signifi-
cance of circumcision, or fear castration the result of circumcision (Reik, *Frag-
ments*, p. 336; Cavell, *Claim of Reason*, p. 480); for them, Saint Paul's argument
that people should substitute for the old Jewish commandment to circumcize
the penis the new Christian injunction to circumcize the soul—"circumcision
is that of the heart, in the spirit, and not in the letter" (Rom. 2:29)—would
amount to an injunction to become religious celibates.

62. Dumm, *Theological Basis*, p. 21; and Jerome, *Adversus Jovinianum*, 1.16,
in PL, 23:246.

**Chapter Two**

1. Bale, Epistle Dedicatory to Elizabeth's *Godly Medytacon*.

Reimer, *Begriff der Gnade*; Chambers, *Jacobean Shakespeare and MM*; and
Knight, *Wheel of Fire*. Even Sister Maura (Shakespeare's Catholicism) and Father
Milward (Shakespeare's Religious Background) fail to recognize in what ways the
play is about religious celibacy.

3. Miles, *Problem of MM*, p. 174, writes, "It can't be claimed that the friar
disguise is essential to the plot of *Measure for Measure* as a whole"; she dis-

tusses Elizabethan dismissal of the friar disguise on pp. 171–72. For the rarity
of the device, see Freeburg, *Disguise Plots*. As for possible sources, writing in
1541, Elyot (*Image of Governaunce*, sig. M3r–v) describes the Roman Emperor
Alexander Severus as disguising himself "someyme in the habite of a scholer
of philosophie... oftentimes like a marchaunt," and in 1592 Riche (*Adven-
Notes to Pages 49–51

tures of Brusanus, chap. 7) describes King Leonarchus in the disguise of a merchant. Similarly, King James disguised himself as a merchant in order to pay secret visits to the London Exchange (Dugdale, *Time Triumphant*, sig. B2).


5. For examples of the satires to which *MM* has been compared, see those by Henry Bullinger, George Buchanan, and Erasmus. The extensive pre-Reformation tradition of anti-monachal satire can be amply documented from such familiar works as *The Romance of the Rose* or the writings of Chaucer and Boccaccio. See also Gless, *MM, the Law, and the Convent*, pp. 67–70. For Buchanan's satirical assault on the Franciscan friars, see especially his poems "Sonnium," "Palinodia," and "Franciscanus & Fratres." Both Milward, S.J., *Shakespeare's Catholicism*, and Sister Maura, *Shakespeare's Religious Background*, do not recognize that *Measure for Measure* is largely about religious celibacy.

6. For a recent summary of the arguments for Shakespeare's Catholicism, see Honigmann, *Shakespeare*, chap. 10. Honigmann notes, as I do, that *Measure for Measure* views Catholicism from the inside.


8. Chambrun, *Shakespeare*, p. 374, argues that this Joan Shakespeare—to be distinguished from William's sister Joan (b. 1558)—was his aunt; that position is criticized by Groot, *Shakespeare and the Old Faith*, pp. 103–4. For Isabella Shakespeare, see Albrecht, *Neue Untersuchungen*, appendix 1, p. 294; Elze, *Shakespeare*, p. 12; and Milward, *Shakespeare's Religious Background*. Mutschmann and Wentersdorf, *Shakespeare and Catholicism*, p. 291, suggest that Isabella Shakespeare may have been "a relative of the poet's grandfather." Her religious community, the Guild of St. Anne, was Benedictine; Saint Clare served with the Benedictines before founding the Franciscan Clares.


12. With the double meaning of "taboo" as both "unclean" and "holy," compare Latin *sacer*. For other such terms, see Freud, *Totem*, p. 18.

13. "Elizabeth," from the name of Elisha, the wife of Aaron the priest (Exod. 6:23; a later Elizabeth appears in Luke 1:5), has been interpreted as "God is fullness," "God of the oath," "God's oath," "God is an oath [by which one swears]," and "consecrated to God." In his Epistle Dedicatory to Elizabeth's *Godly Metytacion* (fol. 8B), John Bale puts forward "consecrated to God" as the definitive translation of "Elizabeth." Cf. Gesenius, *Hebrew and English Lexicon*, p. 45.

14. See Freud, "Taboo on Virginity."


Notes to Pages 51–56

18. For adoption as an impediment to marriage, see Justinian, Digest, 1.23, tit. 2, lex 17; Gratian, Decretum, caus. 30, q. 3, c. 6; and Ivo Carnotensis, Decretum, PL, 161:657. See also G. Oesterlé, "Incestus," in Naz, ed., Dictionnaire, 5:1297–314. C. E. Smith, Papal Enforcement, p. 6, shows that "adoption has the same effect in precluding marriage as does kinship by blood." Fowler, Incest Regulations, p. 40, suggests, however, that this view has been contested frequently since the fall of Rome. On adoption as an impediment to marriage in Shakespeare, see Bertram’s reluctance to marry Helena in All’s Well That Ends Well.


20. In the Phaedrus Plato explores the similar doctrine that "the lover forgets mothers and brothers . . . all alike" (Phaedrus, 239e–240a, cf. 252a). To leave the West for a moment: "In one of the Chinese secret societies in Singapore the oath was, 'I swear that I shall know neither father nor mother, nor brother nor sister, nor wife nor child, but the brotherhood alone" (Heckethorn, Secret Societies, 2:132; cf. Brown, Love’s Body, pp. 32–33).

21. Transcripts and letters from the trial for canonization, which took place in 1253–54, are included in Garonne, Sainte Claire, p. 23. Isabella is about to join Saint Clare’s order.

22. For Antigone in this context, see Benardete, “Reading,” pt. 2, p. 11, and Hegel, Phänomenologie, Werke, vol. 6, chap. 6.

23. See, e.g., Council of Rome (A.D. 402), can. 1 and 2, in Hefele, Concilienbuch, 2:87; Pope Gelasius I (A.D. 494), letter to the bishops of Lucania, c. 20, in Decretum Gratiani, causa 27, q. 1, c. 14; and Council of Macon (A.D. 585), can. 12, in Hefele, Concilienbuch, 3:37. In England the legal and literary tradition that for religious celibates all sexual intercourse constituted incest was widespread. In [Lacy], Treatise on the Ten Commandments, for example, it is written that "incestus is he that doth with nonne, with kowsyn, or with maydon, be which is called defloracio"; and in Lydgate, Fall of Princes (?a1493; Hr1. 1766, 2.4068), it is written that “incestus is trespassing with kyn or with blood, or froward medlyng with hir that is a nunne.”

24. Courtly love may be a similar way to love one’s sibling in extremis without violating the taboo against physical incest. Indeed, “in the middle ages a sister was not infrequently the object of courtly love, partly, it appears, because the presence of the incest barrier served to reinforce the knight errant’s resolution to adhere to the ideal of chastity” (Murray, introduction to Melville, Pierre, p. 55).

25. Bollandists, Acta sanctorum. See Harney, Brother and Sister Saints, for a useful discussion of sibling saints mentioned in that work.


29. Hartmann von Aue, Gregorius. For a modern version of the medieval Gregory legend, see Thomas Mann’s Der Erwählte (lit., The Chosen One), translated as The Holy Sinner, with its monkish narrator.

30. St. Leander, Regula, sive liber de institutione virginum et contemptu mundi, ad Florentinam sororem (late seventh century), quoted from Montalembert, Monks, 2:188.
31. Ibid., 5:331–32.
33. Harney, *Brother and Sister Saints*, p. 93. See also Willibald of Mainz, *Vita S. Bonifacii*. Saint Boniface asked that at her death Saint Lioba be buried in his grave, but the monks of Fulda did not carry out his request.
43. See Marguerite of Navarre, *Heptameron*, 3d day, tale 30, 3:202. Robert d'Arbisse, the founder of the abbey of Fontevrault, was himself accused of sleeping in the same bed with nuns; see Bayle, *Dictionnaire*, ed. Desoer, 6:508–19, art. “Fontevraud.”
44. *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, 11th ed., s.v. “Monasticism.” To the list of saintly siblings mentioned in this chapter might be added Heloise and Abelard. They lived together, first in spiritual incest of a physical kind (he a Brother, she a laywoman), then as secret husband and wife. After Abelard was castrated at the command of Heloise’s uncle, she became a Sister and they lived as “brother and sister” (to quote the letters between them). See Leclerq, *Monks and Love*, esp. p. 119.
45. Muir, *Shakespeare’s Sources*, p. 108, esp. no. 3.
46. Gless, *MM, the Law, and the Convent*, p. 259.
47. For Bernard of Vienne (France), see his Letter to Ludovico. For Bernardine of Siena on incest with one’s father as a less offensive act than “unnatural” acts with one’s husband, see Noonan, *Contraception*, pp. 260ff. Bernardino Ochino was an instructor of Princess Elizabeth.
50. See, e.g., Gless, *MM, the Law, and the Convent*, pp. 262–63.
52. Lemp, “Anfänge des Klarissenordens.”
Notes to Pages 59–63

Claire, p. 91. On Saint Clare and the privilege of poverty, see Fiege, Princess of Poverty, pp. 80–89; Lazzeri, "Il 'Privilegium Pauperitatis';" Sabatier, "Privilege de la pauvrete'; and Garonne, Claire, p. 161.

55. O.E.D., s.v. "Privilege."

56. Dhont, Claire, p. 163.

57. On Isabella and the Order of Ransom, see Desplandres, L'Ordre des Trinitaires.

58. Harney, Brother and Sister Saints, p. 119.

59. On this rumor, see Jacquemet, ed., Catholicisme, and Schmitt, "Isabelle."

60. Thus Little, Religious Poverty, p. 204, writes of Margaret, daughter of Raymond Berenger, count of Provence, that "Louis's wife founded a convent of Poor Clares outside of Paris." Cf. Récueil des historiens, 23: 426.

61. Cf. Friar Francis in Much Ado About Nothing, the name of Sister Franc-esca in the trial for the canonization of Saint Clare (Garonne, Claire, p. 80), and the bungling Friar Francis in Romeo and Juliet.


63. Freud, Civilization, pp. 48–49.

64. In this poem, variants of the name "Clare" signify both Sister Clare and divine radiance: "Laudato si', mi Signore, per sora luna e le stelle / il celo l'ai formate clarite et pretiose et belle" (All praise be yours, my Lord, through Sister Moon and Stars; / In the heavens you have made them, bright / And precious and fair; "Il Cantico di Frate Sole," in St. Francis, Scritti, p. 168; trans. as "The Canticle of Brother Sun," in St. Francis, Omnibus of Sources, ed. Habig, 190–31).

65. For some of the genealogies, see Garonne, Claire, p. 151. See also Abate, "Casa paterna," esp. pp. 78–81, 151–60.

66. Cousins, Bonaventure, p. 20. For this and the following reference I am indebted to Susan M. Glaeser.


68. Pater, Appreciations, p. 184.

69. Quoted in Telle, Marguerite, p. 297.

70. Quoted in McDonnell, Beguines and Beghards, p. 497. For an account of the Brethren, see Cohn, "Cult of the Free Spirit."

71. Carey, Foreword, in Nigel Smith, ed., Rantier Writings, p. 7. On Coppe as an adept of the Brethren, see Cohn, Millennium, p. 68; for Coppe's writings, see Nigel Smith, ed., Rantier Writings, pp. 39–158; for a bibliographic consideration of the influence in England of the Brethren's principal text, Marguerite Porete's work, see S. M. Doirion, "Middle English Translation."

72. Quoted in Cohn, "Cult of the Free Spirit," p. 68.

73. Ibid., p. 59.

74. Ibid., p. 56.

75. "Fay ce que voudras" (Gargantua, chap. 57). The liberty of Rabelais's abbey is often interpreted as mere Epicurean intemperance or desire for a heaven on earth (see, e.g., Kennard, Friar in Fiction, p. 58), but it also has a serious libertine aspect. Bakhtin, Rabelais, p. 412, compares Thélème to the medieval parody "The Rules of Blessed Liberte."
76. "Am ye, amez et faites ce que tu vouldrez." Porete, Le Mirouer des simples ames (ca. 1300), f. 20r–v or p. 20. Porete's work is unique; other reports about the Brethren are for the most part transcripts of trials in which they were found guilty of various antinomian heresies.

77. Leff, Heresy, 1:310.

78. Nigg, Heretics, p. 235.

79. Leff, Heresy, 1:325, summarizing Trithemius, Annales Hirsaugiensis, 2:140.


81. Leff, Heresy, 1:378–79.


84. For this position, see Allo, Saint Paul, p. 121; and Conzelmann, 1 Corinthians, p. 97.

85. Pomerius, De origene monasterii Viridisvallis, p. 286. On the Men and Women, for whom the virtue of chastity was replaced by the Freedom of the Spirit, see McDonnell, Beguines and Beghards, p. 502. The Homines Intelligiatae of Brussels were a local sect that shared their principal doctrines with the Brethren of the Free Spirit; their leaders Giles Cantor and William Hilderniss were condemned by Pierre Ailly, bishop of Cambrai, in 1411. Bloemardinne (or Hadewich) was a great poetess of Brussels.

86. On the Adamites and Bohemia (the native home of Barnadine in Measure for Measure), see Heymann, George of Bohemia, John Zizka, and "Hussite and Utraquist Church." A nineteenth- and twentieth-century counterpart to the Brethren can be found among the Mariavites of Poland, in whose cloisters Sisters and Brothers enjoyed sexual intercourse in "mystical marriages" and raised their offspring as children without original sin. On the Mariavites, see Peterkiewicz, Third Adam.

87. Quoted as the epigraph to Nigg, Heretics.

88. Von Döllinger, Sektengeschichte, pt. 2, p. 664. See also G. Schneider, Libertin, p. 60.

89. Thomas More, for example, said that the monk Martin Luther—who married a nun—not only promulgated an incestuous doctrine but also practiced incest itself (More, Confutaycon, pp. 48–49). Luther, of course, had held that many Romish priests practiced incest.

90. In his Articles of Visitation Melanchthon claims, for example, that Luther's doctrine of the "freedom of a Christian" was interpreted by some Protestant reformers as a charter for moral laxity; Melanchthon argues for the preaching of the Ten Commandments as a guide to the good works that are to follow true faith (Franklin Sherman, introduction to Luther, "Against the Antinomians"). Luther resented the canonical imposition of celibacy laws, which, given the conflation of intent and act that characterizes his notion of faith, were impossible for almost all human beings—including such monks and priests as himself—to fulfill. For a historical study of the relationship between the Brethren of the Free Spirit and one branch of French Protestantism, see

91. Wilkinson, Supplication, p. 34.

92. Ibid., p. 19.

93. Rogers, Displaying, sig. 15r.

94. See Shepherd’s introduction to his edition of Family of Love, p. iii; and Cherry, Most Unvaluedst Purchase. On the Family of Love generally, see Halley, “English Family of Love.”

95. Millin, Antiquités nationales, 3.28.6; my translation. On this and similar riddles conflating kin roles—including some dating back to the Spanish writer Julian Medrano, born in Navarre about 1540—see Rank, Inzest-Motiv, pp. 334–35.

96. Millin, Antiquités nationales, 3.28.6.

97. Luther Tischreden. For Luther and others, see Montaiglon’s note to the thirtieth tale in his edition of the Heptameron, by Marguerite of Navarre, 4:281–83, and Saintsbury’s note in his edition, 3:214–16. The same topos influenced such writers as William Blake (perhaps by way of the English Ranter). Consider, for example, this passage from Blake’s “The Gates of Paradise”: “Thou’rt my Mother from the Womb, / Wife, Sister, Daughter, to the Tomb.”

98. Taylor, Shakespeare’s Darker Purpose, p. 69, compares the riddle in Pericles with similar riddles in two of Shakespeare’s sources, Gower’s Confessio Amantis and Twine’s 1594 translation of Apollonius of Tyre, The Pattern of Painfull Adventures; however, Confessio Amantis and The Pattern of Painfull Adventures do not play up the spiritual—the nunnish or monkish—quality of simultaneous parenthood, spousehood, and childhood in the same way as Pericles does.

99. Dagens, “‘Miroir.’”

100. Contre la secte phantastique et furieuse des Libertins qui se nomment spirituels (1545). For the antinomian beliefs of the Libertins, see Walker, Calvin, pp. 293–94. Calvin’s attack on the Libertins offended Marguerite, and he wrote an ambiguously apologetic letter to her on April 28, 1545 (Opera, 12:65). On Marguerite and the Libertins, see G. Schneider, Libertin, esp. pp. 81–84, and Dagens, “‘Miroir.’”

101. See Perrens, Libertins.

102. Champneys, Harvest.

103. See esp. Lefranc, Découverte and Masque, and the endorsement of Lefranc’s position in David’s introduction to l.u.l., p. 39.

104. Le Miroir de l’âme pecheresse (1531). A good recent edition is that of Allaire. The Heptameron was published in 1558 under the title Les Amants fortunés (The Fortunate Lovers).

105. The tale is entitled “A Tale of Incest” in Valency, Palace.


108. Ibid., 3:201.


110. Saintsbury, introduction to Heptameron, p. 56.

111. Marguerite, Miroir, ll. 267–68.
112. Elizabeth, Glasse, folios 49, 50.
113. The charge of adultery and incest with her brother, Lord Rochford, was made on May 2, 1536. Lord Rochford's wife was a principal witness for the prosecution. Anne was beheaded on May 19.
114. Elizabeth, Glasse (1544), folios 13 and 19.
115. "Spouse of Christ" (sponsa Christi) is a technical term used as early as Tertullian; it eventually became a byword of the Catholic tradition. See Jerome's relevant theory of the virgin as the bride of Christ and of "spiritual matrimony": (Jerome, Letter 107, in CSEL, 55:298; cf. Dumm, Virginity, pp. 74–100. For a modern version of the theory, see Pius XII, "Sponsa Christi."
116. Cf. Norman O. Brown's argument that "sonship, or brotherhood, freed from its secret bondage to the father principle . . . would be free from the principle of private property" (Love's Body, p. 7).
118. Bugge, Virginitatis, p. 73. See Matt. 23:19, "Call no man father"; and pp. 185–86, below.
122. For the Elizabethan conjunction of "unrestrained violence and sexual licentiousness," see Saffady, "Fears of Sexual License."
123. Letters, p. 279.
124. Mutschmann and Wintersdorff, Shakespeare and Catholicism, pp. 43, 15.
125. On the Archpriest Controversy in relation to Measure for Measure in particular, see Kaula, Shakespeare and the Archpriest Controversy, esp. p. 71.
126. Kelly, Thorns, p. 3.
127. See Leff, Heresy, 1:64–68.
128. Relevant sixteenth- and early-seventeenth-century works on the begging orders in England include Awdelay's Fraternity of Vacabondes (1561); various works mentioned by John Bale in his Epistle Dedicatory to Princess Elizabeth's Godly Medytacion; and a printing of Wycliffe's Two Treatises Against the Orders of the Begging Friars (1608).
129. O.E.D., s.v. "Beg."
130. Erbstösser and Werner, Ideologische Probleme.
132. Stone contends, in Crisis of the Aristocracy (quoted in Staves, Players' Scepters, p. 114), that in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries "the most remarkable change inside the family was the shift away from paternal authority" and that "it was slowly recognized that limits should be set not merely to the powers of kings . . . but also those of parents and husbands."
133. See Perrens, Libertins.
134. Quoted in Morison, History of the American People, p. 205. We may also note the role of the "Sons of Liberty" in the American Revolution (Morison, pp. 192–98).
Notes to Pages 74–86

137. Murry’s anti-Catholic analysis of *Measure for Measure* is entitled “Shakespeare: The Redemption of Generation.”

Chapter Three

3. Some interpreters argue that in this passage, which is said to be a late addition to the Gospel, Jesus writes down the sins of those who have accused the adulteress. Others claim that he distinguishes between judging (*krinein*) and sentencing (*katakrinein*), or between verdict and punishment. (For these views, see R. E. Brown, *John*, commentary on John 8:6.) If Jesus were merely distinguishing between judging and sentencing, he could not be charged with making sin more palatable insofar as, according to his doctrine, a guilty person might go unpunished. However, it seems to me that the distinction between judging and sentencing relies on the distinction between intent or thought and act, which Jesus casts into doubt in the Sermon on the Mount.
4. Schlegel, *Lectures on Dramatic Art*, p. 386. Even psychoanalytical and anthropological critics of *Measure for Measure*, who might be expected to notice the informing significance of incest in the play, have been misled by Schlegel to consider only the theme of justice versus mercy. The psychoanalyst Ernest Jones, for example, unquestioningly accepts Masson’s Schlegelian thesis that *Measure for Measure* is mainly about “mutual forgiveness and mercy” (Masson, *Shakespeare Personally*, p. 133): he discusses incest in *Hamlet* and *Julius Caesar* but fails even to mark the incest theme in *Measure for Measure*, although he notes that the plays were probably written in sequence (Jones, *Hamlet and Oedipus*, p. 121).
5. About the time *Measure for Measure* was being written, the name of Shakespeare’s troupe was changed to “The King’s Players.”
6. Does it makes a difference that Angelo’s teacher and initiator is a woman rather than a man, say, Escalus? Dom Gregoire Lemercier, Prior of the Monastery of Sainte-Marie-de-la-Resurrection, thinks that a woman doctor can make a special contribution to the psychoanalysis of celibate males: “Freud” central vision traces all life and love back to their sexual origins, rediscovering the great Biblical intuitions from Genesis through the Prophets to the Song of Songs. This made it imperative for us not to be influenced by considerations of prudery in sexual matters. This was a particularly difficult endeavor for monks, whose religious commitment takes the precise form of a rejection of the biological realities of sex. For this reason, we chose a woman analyst for the initial period of analysis of new recruits, thus putting them, from the outset, face to face with their unknown.” (Lemercier, “Freud in the Cloister,” p. 34.)
8. M. Evdokimov, a Russian Orthodox author, writes, “The asceticism of the desert Fathers was an immense psychoanalysis, followed by a psycho-synthesis of the universal human spirit” (quoted in Lemercier, “Freud in the Cloister,” p. 34).