riage. The end of the play thus vacillates between the polar opposites of marriage and Sisterhood—or between parentarchy and liberty. The most discomforting aspect of *Measure for Measure* for liberal ideologies ought to be, not its depiction of the oppression of one sex by another (which would appear to be remediable), but its expression of the irremediable oppression of all political beings. *Measure for Measure* delineates how any doctrine of liberation must first erase belief both in an essential distinction between chastity and unchastity (or between marriage and incest) and in an essential difference between the genders. The transcendence that some liberals seek can be figured in the play only by the unfruitful Franciscan Sisters of Saint Clare.


Conclusion

3. Some critics believe that *Measure for Measure* ends with the marriage of Isabella and Vincentio and the reunion of Isabella and Claudio; they believe that this marriage and reunion present a definite solution to the problems that the play shows. Thus Murry claims that the Duke and Isabella marry and that this is a case of "generation redeemed"—which he sees as a wholly comfortable and chaste state of affairs ("Redemption of Generation").
5. In an essay entitled "Il n'y a d'amour qu'incestueux donc impossible" (There is only incestuous love, hence love is impossible), Remond similarly argues that, according to the systems of kinship relations set out in Chateaubriand's *Renen*, "Il n'y a d'amour qu'incestueux et l'inceste est present, mis en scene par l'auteur comme pour expliquer definitivement une total impossibilite de communication entre les deux sexes."
7. Plato, *Republic*, 524; *Theaetetus*, 185; *Hippias Major*, 300.
9. Giraudoux writes (Racine, pp. 44–45) that "all Racine's theatre is a theatre of incest." See also Hesse-Fink, *Thème de l'inceste*, chap. 1. Many of Racine's protagonists have been in love since birth, or even since conception; examples include the rivalry in the womb between the brothers in *Thebaide* (4.1), the brother-sister love in *Bajazet* (their love is "formed from infancy" [5.5; ch. 1.4, 5.6]), and the brother-sister love in *Mithridate* (they have loved "since almost forever" [1.1, 1.2, 3.5]). In *Britannicus* (1.2), Agrippina calls herself "the daughter, wife, sister, and mother of your masters." The result is a dramatic clausturation in which all men who count are kin to one another. "In Racine," says Giraudoux (Racine, pp. 42–43), "the stage is nothing other than the sanctuary of the family, or the central cage." The dramatic content of incest in Racine thus verges on formal unity, or atonement.
13. See, for an extreme example, Jaffa, "Chastity as a Political Principle."

14. Narcissism and solipsism are the themes of James D. Wilson, "Incest and American Romantic Fiction." For exclusivity, see the discussion of the myth of "inbreeding Jews," in Erlich, "Race and Incest in Mann's 'Blood of the Walsungs.'" Thomas ("Writer's Procreative Urge in Pierre," p. 422) argues that "artistic procreation is incestuous. The metaphor of incest accounts for both the difference necessary for the creative act and the continual reduplication of personality (repetition) that no artist can avoid, for in incest we make love to someone of the opposite sex in whom we see ourselves mirrored." Cirlot (Symbols, p. 150) claims that incest symbolizes the longing for union with the essence of one's own self, or for "individuation." For Jung on incest and individuation, see his "Psychology of the Transference," esp. pp. 217-30.

15. For psychoanalysis, the standard work is Rank's Inzest-Motiv. Rubin and Byerly (Incest, sec. 7) provide a short annotated bibliography of selected literary articles about incest. For anthropology, see, e.g., Ehrmann's allegorical analyses in "Structures of Exchange in Cinna."

16. The anthologies include Masters and Webster, Violation of Taboo, and parts of Masters, Patterns of Incest.

17. One treatment of incest in erotic literature is H. Miles, Forbidden Fruit.

19. For Aristotle's formulation, see Rhetoric, 1386-87, and Ethics, 1155. For Rymer's criticism, see Works, pp. 48, 49. Cf. Roper, introduction to Ford, 'Tis Pity, p. 33; and Sherman, introduction to 'Tis Pity, pp. 45-53.

20. Leach, "Virgin Birth," looks into the question of Virgin Birth in the Christian tradition; but see the critique in Spiro, "Virgin and Birth" and "Virgin Birth, Parthenogenesis, and Physiological Paternity."

21. Even such exceptional studies as Séguy, "Sociologie," and Campbell-Jones, In Habit, pass over the orders' concern with incest transcendent. There is a group of works written by ex-nuns, constituting a virtual subgenre, that attempts to explain female monastic life, for example: Ebaugh, Out of the Cloister; Griffin, Courage to Choose; Baldwin, I Leap over the Wall; and the movie Out of Order (1982), which Diane Christian made with Bruce Jackson.

22. For the statement of this principle, see Malinowski, "Parenthood," pp. 137-38.


24. Lévi-Strauss, on the last page of his monumental Elementary Structures, uses these phrases to describe the Andaman myth of the future life. On Lévi-Strauss's own conceptual hankering after a state both without exchange and with incest, see Simonis, Lévi-Strauss.

25. Pitt-Rivers ("Kith and the Kin," p. 100) remarks that "such abstract generosity finds little place in the simple bounded societies studied by most anthropologists." Cf. Freud's and Stephen's dismissive critique of universal love. (For Freud, see the Introduction and chapter 2, above; for Stephen, see his Liberty, Equality, and Fraternity, esp. p. 238.)

26. Barthes, Sade, pp. 137-38. On the incest taboo and language, or on kinship systems and grammar, see also Steiner, After Babel, p. 39; and Ceccarelli, Tabu dell' incesto. For the view that merely being called "sister" makes one a sister, see also the rikkub principle of the Jewish Karaites (Epstein, Marriage Laws, pp. 266-67). On the rikkub principle in general, see also
27. Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, pp. 136–37. Lévi-Strauss (*Elementary Structures*, p. 396) writes that "the emergence of symbolic thought must have required that women, like words, should be things that were exchanged." The analogy between language and persons (here, women) suggests that literary analysis, the study of the metaphorical exchanges of meaning, is able to discover the "secret" of incest. Cf. Jacques Lacan's discussion of how "it is essentially on sexual relations—by ordering them according to the law of preferential marriage alliances and forbidden relations—that the first combinatory for the exchanges of women between nominal lineages is based, in order to develop in an exchange of gifts and in exchange of master-words the fundamental commerce and concrete discourse on which human societies are based" (quoted in Kellman, *Self-Begetting Novel*, p. 6). For Lévi-Strauss on his own analysis of women as speaking objects, see his "Language and the Analysis of Social Laws," esp. p. 61. On the political implications of Lévi-Strauss's claim that women are exchanged by men, not vice versa, see Sacks, *Sisters and Wives*, pp. 55–57, and Delaney, *Jewel-Hinged Jaw*, pp. 64–69.

28. Cf. Norman O. Brown's view that "the way of silence is not only death but incest" (*Love's Body*, p. 264).

29. Freud, *Civilization and Its Discontents*, pp. 49, 56, cf. p. 59. Cf. Freud's argument that "a democratic strain runs through the Church, for the very reason that before Christ everyone is equal. It is not without a deep reason... that believers call themselves brothers in Christ" (Freud, "Two Artificial Groups," pp. 93–94).


31. For Freud on repression and religious celibacy, see chapter 4, above. For later psychoanalytical articles on religious celibacy, see Steffen, "Das Zolibat"; Levi-Bianchini, "La neurosi antifallica"; Hitschmann, "Uber Nerven- und Geisteskrankheiten"; Pilcz, "Uber Nerven- und Geisteskrankheiten"; and Gilberg, "Ecumenical Movement."

32. See, e.g., Cohn, "Cult of the Free Spirit."


34. On the psychoanalytic treatment of neurotic priests, see Lemercier, "Freud in the Cloister," and Layard, "Incest Taboo."


43. See, e.g., Cyprian, Epistolae, 53, in Opera omnia and CSEL, 3 (1871), p. 620.
44. Exod. 20: 12, “Honor thy father and thy mother.”
45. See Preisendanz, ed. and trans., Papyri graecae magicae, 4: l135ff. Cf. CIL, vol. 6, nn. 406, 727, 2233. For additional evidence, see Henzen et al., Inscriptiones, nos. 406, 727, 2233.
46. Cyprian, Epistolae, 53, in Opera omnia and CSEL, 3 (1871), p. 620.
49. In the same way, the injunction to love all equally as brothers can turn into an injunction to treat all equally as others. Consider how Saint John of the Cross makes the transition from brother to other: “You should have an equal love for or an equal forgetfulness of all persons, whether relatives or not, and withdraw your heart from relatives as much as from others.” “Regard all as strangers.” (John of the Cross, Collected Works, pp. 656–57.)
50. See, e.g., Stade, Geschichte des Volkes Israel, 1: 510.
51. Genesis Rabba, 39.
52. Hillel, in Avot 1.12 (cf. Hillel, Shabbath, 31a); Meir, in Avot 6.1; Aaron ibn Hayyim, Korban Aharon. (Aaron, of Morocco, was a member of the bet din, or court of justice, at Fez.) The Encyclopedia Judaica (s.v. “Mercy”) points out that in accordance with the tradition of the imitation of God—“as he is merciful so be you merciful” (Shabbath, 133b)—mercy transcends familial bonds to encompass the entire range of human relationships. (See Eccles. 18: 13; Genesis Rabba, 33.1.) For the doctrine of universal human love in more modern Judaism, see Hirsch, Horeb; Cohen, Religion der Vernunft; Buber, I and Thou; Borowitz, “Love”; and the ruling of the synod at Leipzig held in 1869 and the German-Israelitsche Union of Congregations in 1885. On the injunction to love even outlaws and criminals, see Sanhedrin 45a. For Shabbath and Sanhedrin, see I. Epstein, ed., Talmud.
53. Thus phrater, which yields our “brother” (frater), denoted not a brother in the usual sense but a fellow member of the religio-political phratry to which a boy was admitted at the Apa touria, where the phrateres were at once “brothers and sons of the same fathers.” On the ancient Greek phratries and the Apatouria, see Jeanmaire, Couroi et Courêtes, pp. 133–44, 379–83; Thomson, Aeschylus and Athens, p. 28; and Kretschmer, “Benennung des Bruders,” in his Einleitung, 2: 210.
54. McWilliams, Fraternity, p. 4.
56. Beethoven’s music for Schiller’s ode was first conceived in 1812, when Percy Bysshe Shelley was also making “the earth one brotherhood” (“Prometheus Unbound,” 2: 95).
57. De Vaux, Israel, p. 197. I am indebted to Mark Koch for this reference. See also Koschaker, “Fratriarchat,” and Gordan, “Fratriarchy.”
58. The former is Speiser’s view (“Wife-Sister Motif,” pp. 15–18); the latter is Seters’s (Abraham, pp. 72–75). Hurrian marriage may have resembled the Chinese practice of “minor marriage,” in which a daughter-in-law is adopted into the family at an early age and raised by her mother-in-law as a sibling to her spouse on the grounds that this will preserve exogamy yet minimize the threat to the extended family posed by a disruptive spouse brought in from

59. For Abraham, see Gen. 20:2, 5, 12, 13. For Isaac, see Gen. 26:6. The rikkub principle in the logical system of a group of Karaites, the Ba'ale ha-Rikkub, includes the rule of "nominalism," whereby a stepsister, for example, has the status of a sister if she is called a sister by the Bible. (See Epstein, *Marriage Laws*, pp. 266-67.) For a consideration of the wife-sister motif in the Bible, see also Sanhedrin 58a-b, in I. Epstein, ed., *Talmud*.

60. Blood brotherhood implies an equality not obtainable within ordinary kinship structure. Brain (*Friends and Lovers*, p. 85) writes, "Blood brothers are friends and not kin because their relationship is one of absolute equality; between kinsmen there is always superordination and subordination." In the medieval ceremony of blood brotherhood, the Catholic priest "witnessed the declaration of a solemn oath between the two friends, who kissed and then scratched each other's arms, mixing a few drops with the wine, which they drank" (ibid., p. 91). Insofar as blood brotherhood tends to replace natal consanguinity, it constitutes the same kind of threat to "normal" family relations as the eucharistic *sang real*—the "real blood"—of Jesus, who tells his followers to leave their families and become children of adoption to God. The institution of blood brotherhood was outlawed by the Church at about the time that the institution of gossipred became widespread.


62. Old Norse fraënde, Swedish frände, Danish fraenh, and, in some dialects, High German freund mean only kinsperson.

63. *Ordinary of Crysten Men*, 2.8.4.

64. Hutter, *Politics as Friendship*, p. 34; cf. pp. 49-51, 126, 455.

65. *Lysis*, 221e6; see Bolotin, *Plato's Dialogue on Friendship*, esp. chap. 8, "Kindred as Friends." Friendship (or hospitality) as mediator between family and politics has played a part in the development of modern, as well as ancient, political theory.


69. In Eisendstadt, "Ritualized Personal Relations."

70. Cf. the British "kissing kind," which the O.E.D. defines as "kind enough to kiss," or "on affectionate terms."


72. The term, like others that indicate the different kinds of incestuous lovers, is omitted from most other dictionaries, and even from such standard American kinship studies as Schneider, *American Kinship*.

73. For Peter, see 1 Pet. 5:14; for Paul, see Rom. 16:16, 1 Cor. 16:20, and 1 Thess. 5:26. See also Crawley, *Mystic Rose*, p. 344ff, and Perella, *Kiss*, esp. pp. 12-50, 229-30.


75. Frazer (*Golden Bough*, 11:291n) refers to various historical and literary counterparts to this kiss (including Washington Irving's "Christmas Eve") in his discussion of Christmastime Saturnalian license. In his essay on the Ro-
man Carnival, or Saturnalia, Goethe claims that "though it postponed the festival of the Saturnalia with its liberties for a few weeks, the birth of Christ (Christmas) did not succeed in abolishing it" ("Roman Carnival," p. 446).

76. Tertullian, _Ad uxorem_, 2:4.

77. Du Cange, _Glossarium_, s.v. "Osculum"; quoted by Crawley, _Mystic Rose_, 1:349. Kissing, say the Fathers, is _initium consummationis nuptiarum_.

78. In _Kissin' Cousins_, a movie starring Elvis Presley, when the U.S. Air Force wants to build a missile base on Smokey Mountain, the "public relations" man (Presley) discovers that one of the hillbillies (also Presley) is his double.


81. "The earliest American fictionalists," speculates Dalke ("'Had I known,'" p. 88), "unconsciously used the incest theme to express their deepest anxieties about class upheavals." (Cf. Wagenknecht's remark, _American Novel_, p. 2, that, "judged by their fiction, the Founding Fathers might appear primarily devoted to incest.") For a Marxist condemnation of incest in literature as "a neurotic practice of the decadent upper class," see Zelnick, "Incest Theme." For the American passion for literature about incest in the late eighteenth century, see Wagenknecht, _American Novel_, p. 2.

82. Shell, _Economy of Literature_, chap. 3.

83. Sophocles, _Oedipus the King_, ll. 1077–79.

84. See Thompson, "Double Monasteries."

85. Paul, _Tibetan Symbolic World_.

86. For Coleridge on the theory that "there is a sex in our souls" and that he who "never truly loved a sister . . . is not capable even of loving a Wife as she deserves to be loved," see Coleridge, _Friend_, no. 16, in _Satyrane's Letters_, December 7, 1809. For Hegel, see _Phänomenologie des Geistes_, Werke 6:327–42.

87. For relevant Renaissance texts, see Nohrnberg, _Analogy_, chap. 4, esp. pp. 599–604.

88. Paul uses _heis_ for "one," despite the fact that _heis_ is masculine. Elsewhere in the New Testament the neuter pronoun is used in similar contexts.

89. In the Gospel according to the Egyptians, for example, it is written: "When Salome inquired when the things concerning which she asked should be known, the Lord said: 'When ye have trampled on the garment of shame, and when the two become one and the male with the female neither male nor female.'" Another version of the Egyptian Gospel goes: "For the Lord himself being asked by someone when his kingdom should come said: 'When the two should be one, and the outside (that which is without) as the inside (that which is within) and the male with the female neither male nor female'" (James, ed., _Apocryphal New Testament_, p. 11; cf. Knight, _Christian Renaissance_, p. 11, and Heilbrun, _Androgyny_, pp. 20, 179). On Rabelais's Island of Ennasin gender roles are thus confused in much the same way as kinship roles. He writes of those who live on the island that "they were so related and intermarried with one another that we found none of them who was a mother, or a father, an uncle, or an aunt, a cousin or a nephew, a son-in-law or a daughter-in-law, a god-father or a god-mother, to any other; except indeed for one tall noseless man whom I heard calling a little girl of three or four, Father, while the little
Notes to Pages 196–97

girl called him Daughter” (Rabelais, *Gargantua and Pantagruel*, book 4, chap. 9; italics mine). (Rabelais’s French term “Ennasin” suggests “Essene” and is sometimes taken to mean “noseless.”)


91. Noyes’s Perfectionists, for example, held that the godhead was both male and female; Eldred Anna, a Shaker, says that her community “is the only society in the world, so far as we know, where women have absolutely the same freedom and power as men in every respect” (Evans, *Shaker*, p. 268). Ann Lee, founder of the Shaker sect, regarded herself as “the female element that supplemented Jesus and thus completed the revelation to the world of a father-and-mother God” (Andrews, *Shakers*, pp. 96–97; cf. Young, *Testimony*). On incest and androgyny, and on incest as androgyny, in literature, see Furness, “Andrognous Ideal.”


93. See his *Sexualité*.

94. Recently published anti-incest books include: Renvoize, *Incest*, which attacks the “pro-incest” lobby in Sweden, England, and elsewhere; Armstrong, *Kiss Daddy Goodnight*, which focuses on the fact of “the object’s [i.e., the daughter’s] continuing fear, shame, and powerlessness” before the father (p. 242); and Herman, with Hirschman, *Father-Daughter Incest*, which presents the viewpoints of a psychiatrist and a social worker. See also Justice, *Broken Taboo*, and Forward, *Betrayal of Innocence*.

95. For the argument for the positive effects of incest and for examples of propaganda published by the pro-incest political lobbies, see Sawyer, “Lifting the Veil”; Leo, “Cradle-to-Grave”; Cohen, “Disappearance”; J. Greenberg, “Incest”; “Attacking the Last Taboo”; Ramey, “Dealing with the Last Taboo.” Against the proincest lobby and the argument for the positive effects of incest, see Yudkin, “Breaking the Incest Taboo.”

96. Hall (Breaking the Tabu, p. 99) writes that “if the incest tabu is authority’s lynchpin, once this tabu is ignored we may look forward to truly self-directing communities made up of free families and ultimately to a larger society without bosses.” Cf. doctrines of the London-based Guyon Society as expressed in Guyon, *Sex Life*. The turn toward incest as other than a taboo act finds a comedic and idealist expression in Vladimir Nabokov’s *Ada*, in which Nabokov would appear to reject “the Freudian myth”: “Let the credulous and the vulgar continue to believe that all mortal woes can be cured by the daily application of old Greek myths to their private parts. I really do not care.” (Nabokov, *Strong Opinions*, p. 66.)

97. Certain legal scholars argue that intergenerational sex in the family would be punished more effectively and beneficially if it were treated not as the crime of incest but as that of the sexual abuse of authority. Slovenko (“Incest,” pp. 4–5), for example, suggests that “incest laws be replaced by a law of ‘sexual abuse of authority.’ This law would include teachers and others who regulate children.”

98. Just as focusing myopically on the aspect of incest that involves rape,
molestation, and child abuse can blind us to possibly more fundamental aspects of what incest is, so too can focusing myopically on homosexual incest or on homosexuality and incest. For that reason I have touched directly on the theme of homosexuality only once (in Chapter 1). There are interesting arguments that homosexuality and incest are always linked, however. What better way is there to avoid sexual intercourse with one’s parent of the opposite sex or with the figure of that parent? (See Hamilton, “Homosexuality”; Silverman et al., “Male Homosexuality”; Raybin, “Homosexual Incest”; Kaslow et al., “Homosexual Incest”; and Awad, “Single Case Study.” Any discussion of androgyny can be turned into a discussion of a unisexuality transcending both female and male sexuality. Are not hermaphrodites in this sense asexual, or transcendentally homosexual?

99. Herman, Father-Daughter Incest, pp. 1–2, takes Dymphna as the typological figure of incest. For other contemporary works that concentrate on the bad effects of father-daughter incest for the daughters, see Rofsky, “Father-Daughter Incest.”

100. Fiedler (Love and Death, p. 112) writes: “The threat of the father to the daughter . . . [came] to stand for the tyranny of the past, the blighting restraint exercised by authority, while the joining of brother and sister . . . against the corrupt parent became the very symbol of justified revolution.” Sibling incest does not oppose the generations, however; rather, it breaks down the distinction between parents and children and thus erases, or incorporates and transcends, the simple opposition of parental tyranny to liberal revolution, making us all Siblings of a kind.


102. For autochthony and the Theban tale, see Plato, Laws, 663e. Other tales include Odysseus’ stories among the Phaeacians. (See Bloom’s remarks in his edition of the Republic, p. 455.) Plato’s Lysis proposes to unify the state by guaranteeing a person’s right to the land on which he dwells, thus turning autochthony into ideology: “Born of the earth herself, they possessed the same land as motherland and fatherland” (Lysis 2.17). “Ma mère, c’est la République,” says a character in Victor Hugo’s Les Misérables (quoted in N. O. Brown, Love’s Body, p. 34).


105. Plato, Republic, 414d–e; cf. Menexenus, 239a. Tyrrel, Amazons, p. 117, says that Plato’s Menexenus (esp. 235b–c) involves a rejection of maternity. However, the Platonic theory of autochthony eventually rejects all human parenthood, both male and female.

106. Plato, Republic, 461a. See also Bloom’s edition of the Republic, p. 141, n. 21. In “La Marseillaise,” the anthem of the French Revolution, fighters for liberty are called “children of the fatherland” [enfants de la patrie]. When these fighters fall in battle “the earth produces new ones” [la terre en produit ne nouveau]. For the age-old hypothesis of abiogenesis (the hypothesis that living things sometimes arise without parents from such “lifeless” matter as earth), see Nigrelli, ed., “Modern Ideas on Spontaneous Generation.”

107. Plato, Republic, 463c.

108. Cornford, in a series of interesting notes to his translation of the Republic,
public (pp. 161–63), suggests that "Plato did not regard the . . . connections of brothers and sisters as incestuous."

109. Plato, Republic, 414d.
110. Ibid., 460c–d.
111. Ibid., 461e. Plato quotes Aristophanes’ Assembly of Women, ll. 634–38.