from the formal relations between commodities. For a discussion of the Warenspräche contemporary to the period when these signs were photographed, see Faye, *Colloque de Cluny*, p. 191.

68. Cf. Ellul, *Propaganda*. Bilingual advertisements may help to teach French to the English and English to the French, but this is hardly their principal social or economic effect.

69. See, for example, the Québec Food Regulations Act of March 15, 1967.

70. See, for example, Sheppard, *Law of Languages in Canada*, who ignores interlinguistic mediation.

**Chapter 4**

1. Elizabeth I, *Poems*, p. 3. During the period of religious and political upheavals the greatest danger to Elizabeth's life probably occurred in 1554, when Sir Thomas Wyatt headed a rebellion in Kent and Elizabeth was summoned to London and sent to the tower for two months, after which she was sent to live at Woodstock (cf. *Letters*, p. 4).

2. Partridge's review ("Good Queen Bess") of Stanley and Vennema's *Story of Elizabeth I of England* is an example.

3. "But thou, which hast made separation of My bed, and did put thy false lovers in My place and committed fornication with them, yet, for all this, thou mayst come unto Me again, for I will not be angry against thee. Lift up thine eyes, and look up, then shalt thou see in what place thy sin had led thee, and how thou liest down in the earth" (Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 36v; in *Shell, Elizabeth's Glass*).

4. The poem also appeared in 1538 and 1539, in 1547 and 1548 it appeared as part of Marguerite's *Marguerites*.

5. For the view that Anne Boleyn entered the service of Marguerite of Navarre (then Duchess of Alençon), see Ames', *introd. to Elizabeth, Mirror*, p. 31. The two queens knew each other as early as Queen Claude's coronation in 1516; both attended a banquet in France in 1518 and the Field of Cloth of Gold in 1520 (*Ives, Anne Boleyn*, pp. 38–42).

6. Anne Boleyn and Marguerite of Navarre had a well documented correspondence in 1534–35. In October of 1535, moreover, the English were anxious to interest the French envoys in the young princess Elizabeth (*Ives, Anne Boleyn*, pp. 41, 341).

7. Ames (introd. to Elizabeth, *Mirror*, p. 31) writes that "we may conclude that the copy . . . had belonged to her mother, who may have obtained it from her former friend and mistress [Marguerite of Navarre]."


10. Elizabeth asks her stepmother to "rub out, polish, and mend (or else cause to mend) the words (or rather the order of my writing) the which I know in many places to be rude, and nothing done as it should be" (Elizabeth, letter to Catherine Parr, December 31, 1544, Folio 4r, in *Shell, Elizabeth's Glass*).

11. On Bale, the ardent reformer and nationalist scholar and playwright, see my "Bale and British Nationalism," in *Elizabeth's Glass*.

12. This portrait is ascribed by some to H. Holbein. Yet it was probably designed in 1547 by an unknown artist (*Ames, introd. to Elizabeth, Mirror*, p. 7—Holbein died in 1543 of the plague.) John N. King says that Elizabeth's kneeling before Christ with the Bible in hand suggests Protestant learning (*Tudor Royal Iconography*, pp. 209–10) and he draws our attention to Bale's *Illustrium majoris Britanniae scriptorum*, which contains a comparable woodcut
showing Edward VI as a studious king standing at a lectern (English Reformation Literature, p. 6); we will see that the kneeling woman’s relationship to Christ is considerably more complex than that.

13. For the publication history, see my Elizabeth’s Glass. Elizabeth also gave members of her family other holograph translations as gifts—an English translation of John Calvin’s Institution Chrétienne to Catherine Parr (1549); Latin, French, and Italian translations from Catherine Parr’s Prayers, or Meditations to Henry VIII (1545); and a Latin translation of Bernardino’s De Christo Sermo to her brother, the ten-year-old (King) Edward (1547).

14. I offer a detailed discussion of these matters in Elizabeth’s Glass.

15. On dormition, see chapter 1, note 16.

16. Elizabeth herself suggests that “the part which I have wrought in it” was “as well spiritual as manual”; letter to Catherine Parr, December 31, 1544, Folio 3v.

17. Jenkins, in his edition of Shakespeare’s Hamlet (3.4.6), notes that, in the Folio, Hamlet, about to enter his mother’s chambers, calls out thus for her: “Mother, mother, mother.” For the reference to Melville, see his Pierre, foreword Thompson, p. 178.


19. Blackmore (“Hamlet’s Right to the Crown”) argues that “the diriment impediment to marriage with a deceased brother’s wife was part of English church doctrine since earliest times and was retained by the English secular authorities until the nineteenth century.” As Jones (Hamlet and Oedipus, p. 68) points out, “Had the relationship [between Claudius and Gertrude] not counted as incestuous, then Queen Elizabeth would have no right to the throne; she would have been a bastard, Catherine of Aragon being alive at her birth”; on Hamlet and the relationship between Henry VIII and Catherine of Aragon, see also Rosenblatt, “Aspects of Incest Problems.”

20. In Henry VIII, Shakespeare goes to extraordinary lengths to allay anxiety about Elizabeth’s possibly illegitimate birth. “Ann Bullen,” for example, is noticeably absent from the christening scene. Yet, towards the end of the play, the porter suggests that Ann Bullen, who had been Henry’s mistress (just as her sister Mary had been), was a “fornatrix,” so that the Princess Elizabeth may be a bastard. When the porter in Shakespeare’s play cries out, “what a cry of fornication is at door!” (5.3.34–35) he refers in part to the crowd of common people; yet the smallest “fry” in the play is Elizabeth herself who, from the Catholic viewpoint, is born of a “fornatrix.”

21. Much relevant material is included in Edward Fox’s Collectanea statis copiosa, a basis for A Glasse of Truth (1532). It included such treatises as Cranmer’s Determinations . . . that it is unlawful for a man to marry his brother’s wife (1531); see Ives, Boleyn, pp. 165, 167.

22. For Luther’s marriage to the Cistercian Sister Catherine von Bora, see More, Tindale, pp. 48-49. For Rome’s condemnation of Bale’s marriage to Dorothy, see Pits, Relationum Historicum, pp. 53–59; cf. Harris, Bale, pp. 22–23. For Elizabeth’s work with Ochino, see Craster, “Unknown Translation.”

23. The notion that bastards, especially those born from bigamous or incestuous relations, cannot inherit the throne, gained some support from the fact that the children of Edward IV, as the offspring of a bigamous union, were unable to inherit. The issue was hotly contested in the 1540s. Upon the execution of Anne Boleyn, for example, “parliament was required to establish the succession on the new basis of Henry’s new queen Jane Seymour . . . it also empowered the king to leave the crown by will if he had no legitimate issue, but the illegitimate son, the Duke of Richmond, in whose favor this provision is said to have been conceived, died shortly afterwards” (see “English History” in Ency. Brit. (11th ed.) 9, 522d, 531d).

24. Two other counts were the rumor that the king was impotent (Paul Friedmann, Anne Boleyn 2, 280, n. 1; Dewhurst, “Alleged Miscarriages of . . . Anne Boleyn”) and the view that
the marriage was declared invalid ab initio on the ground of Anne’s precontract with Lord Percy.

25. See Friedmann, Boleyn 2, 287, 351.

26. On the indictments of Anne for sibling incest and for an account of the trial, see Friedmann, Boleyn 2, 262–63, 278–81. The charge of adultery and incest with her brother, Lord Rochford, was made on May 2, 1536; Lord Rochford’s wife was a principal witness for the prosecution.

27. See Friedmann, Boleyn 2, 262–63, 278–81.

28. The idea of Elizabeth as divine was fostered from the beginning, even as Anne Boleyn was associated with Saint Anne. There was a merging of Mary’s son (Jesus Christ) and Anne’s (expected or “annunciated”) son in literary propaganda of the period (Ives, Boleyn, p. 284).

29. In 1536 an Act of Parliament ordered every man who had married his mistress’ sister to separate from his wife and forbad all marriages with mistresses’ sisters in the future. For Cranmer’s views on the matter, see Lingard, History of England 5, 74; 540–42, and Friedmann, Boleyn 1, 43, 2, 323–27; 351–55. On the view that the “marriage was declared invalid ab initio... on the ground of the affinity established between Henry and Anne by Henry’s previous relations with Mary [Boleyn],” see “Elizabeth Queen of England” in Ency. Brit. (11th ed.) 9:282.

30. For Henry’s views of Mary’s illegitimacy, see Calendars of Letters, Despatches, and State Papers, 1534–35, p. 57 [Letters and Papers... of Henry VIII 7, 214], cited in Ives, Boleyn, p. 271.


34. In A.D. 868, Church Councils ruled that “we will not define the number of generations within which the faithful may be joined. No Christian may accept a wife... if any blood relationship is recorded, known, or held in memory” (Worms, can. 32, in Mansi, ed., 15, 875). Pope Julius I specified the seventh remove as the limit of diriment impediment to marriage (Decret., no. 5, Patrologiae [Latina] 8:969). But there were enormous practical problems of record keeping, and even where the numerical degree was both agreed upon and ascertainable, there were controversies about the correct method of counting. Thus Stephan of Tournai notes that “the counting begins with the brothers according to some and with the sons of the brothers according to others” (Summa, 255). Cf. C. E. Smith, Papal Enforcement, chap. 2.

35. Eph. 5:31–32.

36. 1 Cor. 6:16, Cf. Gen. 2:24.

37. On the kinship relationship engendered by sexual intercourse, see Gratian, Decretum, 35, q. 5, 10; Bandinelli, Summa, p. 203; Stephan of Tournai, Summa, 250; Balbus, Summa, 168; and Feije, De impedimentis, chap. 14.

38. Bale, “Conclusion,” in Elizabeth, Godly Medytacion, Folio 40r; included in my Elizabeth’s Glass.

39. For an interpretation of Sophocles’ Antigone in this context, see Benardete, “Reading,” 5. 2, p. 11, and Hegel, Phänomenologie, Werke 6, chap. 6.

40. There would have been many bibliothecal sources, including a French metrical account of how Anne was brought to trial and executed, the Histoire de Anne Boleyn et des événements de l’anniversaire de sa mort, in which one “Marguerita”—maybe a figure of Marguerite of Navarre—is the bawd who procures Smeton for Queen Anne. (The Histoire is discussed in Ascoli, Grande-Bretagne; M.A.S. Hume’s edition of Crónica del Rey Enrico, pp. 55–59 and 68–76, refers to Marguerita; cf. Ives, Boleyn, pp. 69–70, 375.)
41. The terms "aunt-mother" and "uncle-father" are used in *Hamlet* (ed. Jenkins, 2.2.371-72). "You are welcome," says Hamlet to the twinnlike Rosencrantz and Guildenstern, "but my uncle-father and aunt-mother are deceived." Insofar as Hamlet's mother, Gertrude, is married to Hamlet's uncle, she is his aunt. Similarly, Elizabeth's mother, Anne Boleyn, was her aunt. Henry had had sexual intercourse with Mary Boleyn, Anne's sister; and since, by the Doctrine of Carnal Contagion, a lover is, to all intents and purposes, a wife, Anne was Elizabeth's aunt.

42. The quotation is from *Ency. Brit.* (11th ed.) 9:282.

43. For a review of the evidence concerning the Elizabeth-Seymour liaison, see William Seymour, *Ordeal by Ambition*, pp. 215-19, 225-26. Thomas Tyrwhitt, who was sent to Hatfield to extract the truth from Elizabeth, complained that Thomas Seymour, Mistress Ashley, Thomas Ashley and Elizabeth told a story so close in so many details that they were "all in a tale" (Letters, p. 9; cf. Elizabeth's letter to Edward Seymour Lord Protector, January 28, 1549). Elizabeth's relations with Thomas Seymour was the occasion for sending a syntactically complex letter to him soon after she left the Lord Admiral's household, in July 1548: "You needed not to send an excuse to me for I could not distrust and not fulfilling your promise to proceed for want of good will, but only that opportunity serve not. Wherefore, I shall desire you to think that a greater matter than this could not make me impute any unkindness in you, for I am a friend not won with trifles, nor lost with the light" (Letters, p. 8).

44. Letters, p. 11.


46. The centuries-old tradition of ascribing to Elizabeth various feelings about her family circumstances continues unabated. Prescott, for example, would determine "how [Elizabeth] respond[ed] to the executions of her mother, Anne Boleyn, and her stepmother, Catherine Howard" (Prescott, "Pearl," 68). Only seers such as "Fathers Confessor" and psychoanalysts can claim to see into the heart of a person, of course, but where religious or psychological speculation arises from texts such as the "Glass," it would seem to be particularly compelling—at least where the rhetorical quality of such speculation is recognized.

47. There is some evidence that there was a copy of the book in Henry VIII's household (Henry VIII, *Letters and Papers* 14[1], 369). In 1544 Marguerite had not yet a great literary reputation; she was known as an author pretty much only by her *Miroir*, its companion religious poems, and a farce (Prescott, "Pearl," p. 68).

48. Henry VIII opened negotiations to marry Marguerite of Navarre (then Duchess of Alençon) while he was entertaining the idea of divorcing Catherine of Aragon. Margaret's reply to Henry, made through Wolsey, makes clear that she refused to marry Henry because he committed crimes against Catherine of Aragon. See "Margaret, The Pearl of Navarre" (Edinburgh, 1868); Ames, introd. to Elizabeth, *Mirror*, p. 32.


50. Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 7v, 8r, 23v.

51. Elizabeth, Letter to Catherine Parr, December 31, 1544, Folio 3r. It reads there as "mother, daughter, sister, and wife by the scriptures she proveth herself to be." The passage from the letter is also in *Letters*, p. 6.

52. In the sixteenth century, replacing consanguinity with a sort of amatory alliance of friendship had, in carnival style, begun to affect many levels of society. And, in conjunction with an amatory neo-Platonic view of the Christian exhortation to love (1 John 4:11-12), it seemed to encourage spiritual libertinism. Jourda, in his edition of Rabelais, suggests that the social structure of Rabelais' Island of Ennasin (bk. 4, chap. 9) parodies such spiritual alliances as that between Marot and Anne d'Alençon; the Rabelaisian "Island of Alliances" is associateable with the ideas of the one-time Franciscan Tourangeau de Tours. (See Telle, "Ille," p. 166, and Telle, *L'Oeuvre de Marguerite*, pp. 299-312.)
54. Elizabeth I, Englishings, p. 54 (= Boethius, Consolation 3.6). The Latin reads: Omne hominum genus in terris simili surgit ab ortu. Unus enim rerum pater est. When the great Alfred, King of the West Saxons, translated these famous lines in the ninth century, he changed "the Father of all things" into "the father and mother of the race." Friedman comments: "Seemingly Alfred preferred the concept of a concrete biblical blood cousiny to the abstract mystical brotherhood of men, sons of a spiritual father, which his text, influenced by late Stoicism, intended" ("When Adam Delved," pp. 220–21).
56. For the proverb and its corollaries in England and elsewhere, see Friedman, "When Adam Delved."
57. The inability of King Edward, Elizabeth's half-brother, to disinherit his two half-sisters Princess Mary and Princess Elizabeth, hence to devise the succession to Jane Grey in 1552, would seem to prove this rule.
61. Sponsa Christi is a technical term used as early as Tertullian. See Jerome's theory of the virgin as the bride of Christ and of "spiritual matrimony" (letter 107, in Epistulae 55:298; cf. Dunn, Virginity, p. 74). For a modern version of the theory, see Pius XII, "Sponsa Christi." For an anthropological view of the institution of women marrying gods in Christianity and in other cultures, see Westermarck, History of Human Marriage 1:403–6, and M. E. Harding, Woman's Mysteries.
62. Millin, Antiquités nationales, 3.28.6, on an inscription at Ecous; my translation.
64. Millin, Antiquités nationales 3.28.6; my translation.
65. Pericles, Prince of Tyre, 1.1.65–72. The vital solution in Pericles requires a resurrection—wife and daughter, believed dead, are reborn from their living deaths in a religious institution and a brothel. Dramatically, the solution to the riddle of Antiochus involves assigning to Pericles and Marina the roles of Antiochus and Antiochus' daughter; beyond the resurrection of the two women, the plot enacts a final rebirth, as Pericles calls it, of the father, Pericles, from the daughter, Marina ("Thou that beget'st him that did thee beget"; 5.1.197). In this atonement, Pericles foreshadows kinship relations in all the other romances.
66. Taylor, Shakespeare's Darker Purpose, p. 69, compares the riddle in Pericles with similar riddles in two of Shakespeare's sources, Gower's Confessio Amantis, and Twine's 1594 translation of Apollonius of Tyre, The Patterne of Painfulfull Adventures; however, Confessio Amantis and The Patterne of Painfulfull Adventures do not play up the spiritual nunnish-monkish quality of simultaneous parenthood, spousehood, and childhood in the same way that Pericles does. For Medrano: see Rank, Inzest-Motiv, pp. 334–35.
67. Rabelais, Gargantua and Pantagruel, bk. 4, chap. 9, p. 468.
68. Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 26v.
69. Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 43r–v. For the poet-lover in this fourfold kinship role, see also such passages as: "O my father, brother, child, and spouse" (Fol. 21r); "O what a sweet rest it is, of the mother, and the son together" (Fol. 26r); and "Now then that we are brother and sister together, I care but little for all other men" (Fol. 29r).
70. Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 13r, 19r–v.
71. Elizabeth, letter to Catharine Parr, December 31, 1544, Folio 3r.
72. The sinful soul is a fourfold traitor: the child who leaves the home of the father (as in Luke 15); the parent who fails to watch out for the child (3 Kings); the sibling who betrays the brother (Numbers 12); and the spouse who is adulterous.
73. Bale, “Conclusion,” Folio 39r, 40r.
74. Salminen dismisses the fourfold kinship in Marguerite’s poem as a strange mysticism: “Marguerite se perd dans un mysticisme étrange: elle décrit l’union de l’âme avec le Sauveur à l’aide des métaphores se rapportant aux relations de parenté. Elle se nomme tour à tour la sœur, la mère, l’épouse et la fille de Dieu” (Salminen, Miroir, p. 81).
75. Bale, “Conclusion,” Folio 39r. A late instance of the Elizabethan fourfold kin topos occurs in Aemilia Lanyer’s reference in Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum (1611) to a new Cynthia (i.e., Elizabeth Tudor). Of her it is said that Jesus is “Her Sonne, her Husband, Father . . .” (Travitsky, Paradise of Women, pp. 99, 101); see also Lewalski, “Of God and Good Women.”
76. For example: the Marguerites, Dialogue, Triomphede l’Agneau, the Coche, Prisons, and perhaps the Comedies. Such works as The Mirror of the Sinful Soul and Discord Being in Man by the Contrariness of the Spirit and the Flesh and Peace [Being in Man] by the Spiritual Life, both written in 1531, are in some measure commentary on the doctrine of liberty in Saint Paul’s Letter to the Romans.
77. Marguerite, Heptameron, trans. Saintsbury, 3, 192. (All references below are to the Saintsbury translation.)
78. Marguerite, Heptameron 3, 200.
79. Some literary historians have sought to use the story that Marguerite of Navarre was raped in the 1520s to elucidate her tales about rape, including those where religious Brothers rape lay women and Sisters (e.g., tale 72), but they generally ignore the definition of spiritual incest as “sexual relations involving any Brother or Sister” and so they tend to overlook the relationship between the physical incest described in the Heptameron and the transformation of physical incest into spiritual incest depicted in Le Miroir de l’âme pécheresse. On the presumed rape of Marguerite by Admiral Bonnivet, see Brantome, Dames galantes, pp. 422–23; cited by Cholakian, Rape, p. 9.
80. Marguerite, Heptameron 3, 201.
82. Love’s Labour’s Lost 1.1.13; cf. David ed., 50–51, 206–7. Shakespeare very probably knew the work of Marguerite; her influence is suggested by his depiction of academic celibacy in Love’s Labour’s Lost, whose Princess is modeled on Marguerite of Valois, her grand-niece. See esp. Lefranc, Découverte et Sous le Masque de Shakespeare, and the endorsement of Lefranc’s position in David’s introduction, p. 39.
83. Here too there are biographical dimensions to Marguerite’s concern with incest, as to Elizabeth’s: for example, Marguerite’s love for her brother, King Francis of France, is the subject of her greatest poetry; Saintsbury remarks that “it has been asserted that improper relations existed between the brother and the sister,” though the historical evidence is not conclusive on the side of either chastity or incest (Heptameron, Introduction, p.56).
84. See Ames, “Introduction” to Elizabeth, Mirror, p. 42.
85. Lefranc, Idées religieuses, p. 15; Ames, p. 42.
86. Calvin, Contre la secte phantastique et furieuse des Libertins qui se nomment spirituels (1545), in Opera omnia 7, 145–248. For the antinomian beliefs of the Libertines, see Walker, Calvin, pp. 293–94. Calvin’s attack offended Marguerite, and he wrote an ambiguously apologetic letter to her on April 28, 1545 (Opera omnia 12, 65). On Marguerite and the Libertines, see also G. Schneider, Libertia, esp. pp. 81–84, and Dagens, “Miroir.”
88. Vautrollier, Commentarie, p. 85, marg. (ed. 1577). Luther resented the canonical
imposition of celibacy laws, which, given the conflation of intent and act that characterizes his notion of faith, were impossible for almost all human beings—including such monks and priests as himself—to fulfill.

89. OED 7:684c.
90. Freud, Totem, p. 7.
94. For a monk or nun it is official Church doctrine and law that concubinage or marriage to anyone is incest. See chap. 1, note 69.
96. Freud, Civilization, pp. 48–49.
99. See also Harney, Brother and Sister Saints, for a useful discussion of sibling saints mentioned in that work.
102. Three days later, Scholastica died; in the course of time, Benedict joined her in a single grave. See St. Gregory the Great, Vita S. Benedicti.
103. Hartmann von Aue, Gregorius.
105. St. Leander, Regula, quoted from Montalembert, Monks 2:188.
107. Lioba the Sister, seeking to serve her cousin Saint Boniface, wrote him thus: "God grant, unworthy as I am, that I might have the honor of having you for my brother." She closed the letter with the following suggestive verse: "May the Almighty judge, who made the earth / And glorious in His kingdom reigns, / Preserve your chaste fire warm as at its birth, / Till time for you shall lose its rights and pains" (Harney, Brother and Sister Saints, p. 93; see also Willibald of Mainz, Vita S. Bonifaci). Saint Boniface asked that at her death Saint Lioba be buried in his grave, but the monks of Fulda did not carry out his request.
110. Curtius, European Literature, p. 122.
112. Teresa, Life, IV, in Complete Works.
114. Complete Works 2, 415; and (from Way of Perfection, XXXVII) 2, 161.
116. Victoria Lincoln, Teresa, p. 24; cf. Teresa, Life, II, in Complete Works, and Book of her Life, 2.6, and Rules for a Brotherhood. To the list of saintly siblings mentioned in this chapter might be added Heloise and Abelard. They lived together, first in spiritual incest of a physical kind (he a Brother, she a laywoman), then as secret husband and wife. After Abelard was castrated at the command of Heloise's uncle, she became a Sister and they lived as "brother and sister"—to quote the letters between them (Leclerq, Monks and Love, esp. p. 119).


118. The oldest manuscript of Marguerite Porete's powerful Mirror of Simple Souls (the Chantilly manuscript; see Dagens, "Miroir," p. 288, and Hauser, Études sur la réforme française) was found at Fontevrault. Porete's Antinomian influence on Marguerite of Navarre and the Siblings, or Brethren, of the Free Spirit will be discussed in a later section.

119. Marguerite of Navarre, Heptameron, 3rd day, tale 30, 3, 202. Robert d'Arbissel, the founder of the abbey of Fontevrault, was himself accused of sleeping in the same bed with nuns; see Bayle, Dictionnaire 6, 508–10.


121. On Ochino and his stay in England from 1547 to 1553, see Benrath, Ochino, pp. 172–99. On Elizabeth's 1547 translation, see Craster, "Unknown Translation," p. 723. The autograph manuscript is at the Bodleian Library (Swaim, "New Year's Gift," pp. 261–65).

122. For Bale's defense of his marriage, see Scriptorum illus. Brit., p. 702; for Rome's condemnation, see Pits, Relationurn Historicum, pp. 53–59.


124. "Rabelais's [bastard] children were granted the unusual privilege of an official legitimation by the Pope Himself" (Screech, Rabelaisian Marriage, pp. 19–20; cf. Lesellier, "Deux Enfants naturels").

125. For Luther's critique of religious celibacy, see his "Exhortation to All Clergy," esp. pp. 40–52, and "Exhortation to the Knights."

126. "Love needs no laws," said Luther, sweeping away "those stupid barriers due to spiritual fatherhood, motherhood, brotherhood, sisterhood, and childhood"—or so Brain, Friends and Lovers, p. 94, has it. (Cf. Luther, "Persons . . . Forbidden to Marry," in Works 45, 8, and "Estate of Marriage," Works 45, 24.) Luther did not sweep away all barriers to marriage, however. He stressed the distinction between figure and letter, or spirit and body, and thus redefined the incest taboo in terms of a literal, or corporeal, principle.

127. Ancrene Riwle 106/21; as quoted, from the Corpus Christi College (Cambridge) manuscript, by Kurath and Reidy, eds., Middle English Dictionary, s.v. "Incest," from the Dictionary's photostatic copy of the manuscript in Ann Arbor, Michigan.

128. Rolle, Form, 413.

129. [Lacy], Ten Commandments, 4068.

130. 2, 4068–71. See also W. H. Black, ed., The Life and Martyrdom of Thomas Beket, line 757.


132. On the Benedictine orders and the idealist policies that More promulgates in Utopia, see Chambers, More, p. 136; More, Utopia, pp. 281–82. Although More generally admired the Catholic orders and their doctrines (Hexter, More's Utopia, pp. 85–90), he was not a monk or friar but a husband and legitimate father.


135. Matt. 23:8. Christianity proposes a universalist doctrine that both incorporates and transcends ordinary kinship with an extraordinary unifamilial kinship. Cf. Gal. 3:26–28: "For in Christ Jesus you are all sons of God . . . There is neither Jew nor Greek . . . for ye are
all one in Christ Jesus." Church Fathers who urge Christians to obey to follow out the implications of Matt. 23:8 in such a way as to call all men their "brothers" and to call no one by the name "father" include: Ignatius of Antioch, "To the Ephesians," 10.3; Clement of Alexandria, Stromata, 7.14.5; Justinian, Dialogue with Tryphon, 96; and Tertullian, Apologeticus, 39.8-9.

136. 1 Cor. 5:1.
138. 1 Cor. 10:23; and Lev. 18:8. For this position on Corinthians, see Allo, "Saint Paul," p. 121; and Conzelmann, 1 Corinthians, p. 97.
139. Rabelais' chapter entitled "Pantagruel reaches the Island of Ennasin [cf. "Essene"], and of the strange Relationships there" is bk. 4, chap. 9.
140. For a general account of the Brethren see Cohn, "Cult." In Italy St. Bernardine of Siena was affected by the Brethren. (See Bernardine of Siena, Opera omnia, 1:34, 536; 3:109; 4:544; 6:248). In Germany the Brethren influenced the philosophical Meister Eckhart and the polygamist Anabaptists of Münster. (Telle, "Ille," p. 169; and see Ency. Brit. (11th ed.) 8:886). The sixteenth-century Belgian David Joris, a prominent member of a local sect influenced by the Free Spirit, had an effect on Bosch, whose painting, "The Garden of Earthly Delights," is said to depict the Free Spirit's "incestuous orgies" (Fraenger, Millennium, p. 42).
141. This was the motto of the Libertine Brethren (Telle, Marguerite, p. 297).
142. 2 Cor. 3:17.
143. Women were especially prominent as the theorists of the Brethren of the Free Spirit. Thus the poet Bloemardinne (or Hadewijch) of Brussels wrote much of the spirit of liberty and supposedly impious sexual love. The "Homines Intelligentes" of Brussels were a local sect of the Free Spirit; their leaders, Giles Cantor and William Hilderniss, were condemned by Pierre Ailly, bishop of Cambrai, in 1411. See Pomerius, De origine monasterii Viridivalli, p. 286, and McDonnell, Beguines and Beghards, p. 502.
144. Similarities between the literary work of Marguerite of Navarre and Marguerite Porete include verbal parallels, as in the use of the term "Distant Close" or loingpres (see Dagens, "Le 'Miroir des simples ames' et Marguerite de Navarre") and historical connections (see Bédier, "La tradition manuscrite," Eekhoud, Les Libertins d'Anvers, and Frederichs, "Luthérien français").
145. The relation between Lutheran doctrine and Spiritual Liberty as they converge in the court of Navarre is the subject of Frederichs, "Luthérien français," and Eekhoud, Libertins d'Anvers.
146. See Perrens, Libertins.
147. See Doiron, "Middle English Translation."
148. Champneys, Harvest.
149. Gardiner (Great Civil War 3, 380) writes of the Levelers that "they have given themselves a new name, Viz. Levelers, for they intend to set all things straight and raise a parody and community in the kingdom." Cromwell attacked the Levelers in his speech to parliament in September 1654, quoted by Carlyle in his Cromwell's Letters and Speeches, Speech number 2: "Did not that Leveling principle tend to the reducing of all to an inequality." On the Ranters, see below.
150. Parrington, The Romantic Revolution, pp. 335-36, suggests that the basis for American Perfectionism lies not so much in French Romanticism or German Idealism as in a medieval utopian past that extends to the religious utopianism of the 1650s and to Roger Williams and beyond, and that Noyes and his Perfectionists were at one with the Diggers and Levelers of Commonwealth times.
151. The sociologist Lewis Yablonsky describes a ritual (now called "the funeral of the
hippie movement”) involving San Francisco hippies. Their “explicit idea was to bury the hippie image, as they put it, produced by the mass media, and to signal the birth of The Free Man” (Yablonsky, Hippie Trip, p. 290). The Love Children wanted to be Brethren of the Free Spirit.

152. In the 1520s Lollards and other groups tracing their origin to Wycliffe came together with Lutherans and thus became a sect to be contended with (Ency. Brit. [11th ed.] 8:529).


154. Athanasian Christian Church doctrine claims that the Virgin Mary had no biological part in the making of her baby. In the first half of the ninth century, Theosterikos said the following about the iconoclast emperor Constantine V: “Taking in his hand a purse full of gold and showing it to all he asked, What is it worth? They replied that it had great value. He then emptied out the gold and asked, What is it worth now? They said, Nothing. So, said he, Mary (for the atheist would not call her Theotokos), while she carried Christ within was to be honoured, but after she was delivered she differed in no way from other women” (Vitae Nicetac, in Acta Sanct., Ap. 1, app. 23; cited in Edward Martin, History, p. 62).


156. Regarding the view that Ann Askew may have been one of Catherine Parr’s ladies in waiting, see Writings of Ed[ward] VI, p. 238.


158. See Hartmann’s interrogation at Erfurt by Walter Kerling, recounted in von Dollinger, Sekteneschichte 2, 386.

159. Leff, Heresy 1, 378–79.

160. Leff, Heresy 1, 378–79.

161. “Amye, amez et faites ce que tu vouldez” (Marguerite Porete, Miroir, ed. Guarnieri, Folio 26v).

162. Porete, St. John’s manuscript, Folio 15v–29r.

163. Porete, St. John’s manuscript, Folio 5. The Council of Vienne of 1311–12 condemned this statement in its French version, congé des vertues being treated by the council as licentiat a se virtutes.

164. Porete, St. John’s manuscript, Folio 10r. This statement was also condemned at Vienne.

165. In 1650 in England, Abiezer Coppe, a member of the Ranter sect, promulgated the Brethren’s view that “God dwelt inside them, as an inner light whose authority was above all laws. . . . Sin was thus made to disappear. The consequence was, for some Ranters, sexual license” (Carey, Foreword, in Nigel Smith, ed., Ranters Writings, p. 7). Coppe described the state beyond “good” and “evil” in terms of “the mother Eternity, Almightyness, who is universal love” and to whose child dress and undress, incest and chastity, are alike—he knows no evil (quoted in Cohn, “Cult of the Free Spirit,” p. 68).


169. “Fay ce que voudras” (Gargantua, ii, chap. 57). The liberty of Rabelais’ abbey is often interpreted as mere “Epicurean” (i.e., gluttonous) intemperance or desire for a heaven on earth (see, e.g., Kennard, Friar in Fiction, p. 58), but it also has a serious libertine aspect. Bakhtin, Rabelais, p. 412, compares Thélème to the medieval parody The Rules of Blessed Libertine.


171. Elizabeth, “Glass,” Folio 43r.
172. See the A.D. 1309 charges against Marguerite Porete listed in *Grands Chroniques* 5, 188.

173. English devotional works similarly depict Jesus as a female lover or as both a male lover and a female parent taken together. Among such works are the Middle English translation of Aelred of Rievaulx’s *De vita eremita* (p. 329), Juliana of Norwich’s *Revelaciones* (pp. 58–60), and *Ureisun of Ur Elouen* (Thompson, p. 2). A basic biblical text here, of interest to Marguerite of Navarre and Queen Elizabeth, is St. Paul’s Letter to the Galatians. Paul writes that we become “one [heis] in Christ, neither man nor woman” (Gal 3:28)—though “one” [heis] is here masculine (as in Eph. 2:15, 4:13), not neuter (as in Eph. 2:14). Franciscan theologians often portray maleness and femaleness joined together, not in what we normally assume to be the closest union (marriage), but in roles that would normally be impediments to that union (namely, mother and son, or brother and sister). (Cousins, *Bonaventure*, p. 20.)

174. Porete, St. John’s manuscript Folio 13r–13v. Elizabeth, in her “Glass,” asks, “For what thing is a man (as for his own strength) before he hath received the gift of faith” (Folio 5r). Bale, in his “Epistle Dedicatory,” refers to “the barren doctrine and the works without faith” (Folio 7v). Marguerite of Navarre, in Queen Elizabeth’s translation, writes of the “thing a man cannot understand unless he hath a true faith” (Elizabeth, “Glass,” Folio 14r); “If we have Him through faith then have we a greater treasure than any man can tell” (Elizabeth, “Glass,” Folio 62v).

175. One example of the mockery of “erotic communism” is Jean de Meun’s contribution (ca. 1275) to Guillaume de Lorris’ *The Romance of the Rose*, esp: “Toutes pour touz et touz pour toutes.” Here “the goddess Natura has become the servant of rank promiscuity” (cited in Curtius, *European Literature*, p. 6). Bakhtin discusses *The Rules of Blessed Libertine*, a parody of monastic laws similarly built upon sanctifying that which is forbidden, in Rabelais, p. 412.


177. In his *Articles of Visitation*, Melanchthon claims, for example, that Luther’s doctrine of the “freedom of a Christian” was interpreted by some Protestant reformers as a charter for moral laxity; Melanchthon argues for the preaching of the Ten Commandments as a guide to the good works that are to follow true faith (Franklin Sherman, *Introduction to Luther, Against the Antinomians*). For a study of the relationship between the Brethren of the Free Spirit and French Protestantism, see Frederichs, “Lutherien français,” and for a general discussion of the role of the doctrines of the free spirit in the Reformation, see Guarnieri, “Il movimento del libero spirito dalle origini al secolo xvi” and “Appendici” (in Guarnieri, *Il movimento del libero spirito*, pp. 114–49, 336–58). On the *Miroirs* as Protestant in the reformist tradition of Guillaume Brionnet and Simon du Bois, see Salminen in her edition of the text, pp. 40ff., 62ff., as well as Lefranc, *Les âdées religieuses*; on its Protestant mystical aspects, see Sckommodau, *Die religiösen Dichtungen*.


182. Rogers, *Displaying*, sig. 15r.

183. *The Family of Love*, a comic play probably written by Thomas Middleton and performed by the Children of the Revels, contains a trial scene in which the Family’s sexual freedom is institutionalized in law. See Shepherd’s introduction to his edition of the *Family*, p. iii; Cherry, *Most Unvaluedst Purchase*; and Halley, “English Family of Love.”

184. *Monk* means “alone” (from Greek *monachos*). However, not all monks were *anochoites* living in solitude. Some were *coenobites* (from *koinos*, “common,” and *bios*, “life”).
Coenobites lived in communities with one or another kind of arché, or rule. The archon might be a traditional cenobarch in a universally fraternal and/or sororal community; here all members of the community, including its ruler, were "siblings," and called one another Brother and/or Sister. But, on the other hand, the archon might rule in a community of a strictly patriarchal or matriarchal sort; here one calls the Superior "Father" or "Mother," and all members of the community are Brothers and/or Sisters, except the ruler, who is everyone else's "Parent." There was a parallel struggle in the Elizabethan and Jacobean period as to whether the "monarch," meaning "alone rule" or "one ruling" (from monarchē)—is essentially "parentarchal" or "sibling."

186. Bugge, Virginitatis, p. 73.
188. John Chrysostom, De virginitate; cited in Dumm, Virginity, p. 121.
189. Aristotle, Politics, 1.2.5 is generally the Christian ideologists' locus classicus, but it is a mistake to assume that this view of the ruler is universal. Indeed, it is generally absent in the nonuniversalist—and to Christendom of the period, politically and ideologically threatening—doctrine of Islam, perhaps, as Lewis remarks in The Political Language of Islam (p. 17), on account of its Christian connotation. Only in Turkish does a term meaning "father," ata, acquire a political connotation. The image of the ruler as mother, moreover, seems to have been equally abhorrent. If, however, the Moslem state has no parents, it certainly has children, and terms denoting sons and brothers are in common political use. These may be literal, as for example in indicating membership of a tribe or dynasty, or figurative, indicating a relationship to the state. The term "brother," with its various equivalents, is in common use for members of the same group, by allegiance as well as by kinship. And in Turkish usage "elder brother," ağa, is a common term of respect for holders of authority (see H. Bowen, "Agha," in Ency. Islam). The best-known example is the abna, "sons," of the Abbasid dynasty, an elite group of slaves and freedmen, both soldiers and civilians, who served the state and thus freed it from dependence on Arab tribal support (see K.V. Zettersten, "Abna," in Ency. Islam).
191. For the Elizabethan conjunction of "unrestrained violence and sexual licentiousness," see Saffady, "Fears of Sexual License."
192. Gardiner, Civil War, p. 279.
193. Kelly, Thorn, p. 3.
194. For the executions: Mutschmann and Wentersdorf, Shakespeare and Catholicism, p. 43. For the rebellion: Kaula, Shakespeare and the Archpriest Controversy, esp. p. 71.
195. Locke, Two Treatises, p. 6.
197. Quoted in Staves, Players' Scepters, p. 114.
200. Bale, "Epistle Dedicatory," Folios 3r, 4v, 6v-7r. On this sort of attempt in the sixteenth century to replace the role of blood in the kinship structure with virtue—or "beauty"—Hermann Melville may provide the best commentaries in his Pierre, with its ambiguously illegitimate heroine Isabella/Elizabeth. "A beautiful woman is born Queen of men and women both," writes Melville, "as Mary Stuart was born Queen of Scots, whether men or women. All mankind are her Scots; her leal clan are numbered by the nations." According to the narrator, "a plain-faced Queen of Spain [perhaps Queen Isabella I, called
...la Católica... dwells not in half the glory of a beautiful milliner’s daughter,” and people deserve to be excoriated for worshipping “Mary Queen of Heaven” while, at the same time, “for generations refusing cap and knee to many angel Marys, rightful Queens of France”—including many “immortal flowers of the House of Valois” (Melville, *Pierre*, ed. Murray, pp. 46, 47, 56). Among the Marys that Melville may have had in mind: Mary Stuart, daughter of King Francis, who was a Valois/Angoulemé; Mary, Queen of France, née Tudor, who was daughter to Henry VII and Elizabeth, sister to Henry VIII, and Queen to Louis XII of France, who was Valois/Capetian; and Mary Tudor, called “Bloody Mary,” daughter to Henry VIII and Catherine of Aragon. Melville was apparently an admirer of Robert Melville (1527–1621), who was a representative of Mary Queen of Scots at the English court; among those who begged Elizabeth for Mary’s life, Robert Melville later accompanied James VI to England (1603).

201. Bale, “Epistle Dedicatory,” Folio 7r, 40r, cf. 40v. “Of the most excellent kind of nobility is he sure (most virtuous and learned Lady) which truly believeth and seeketh to do the will of the eternal father, for thereby is he brought forward and promoted to that heavenly kindred, lo. 1. By that means becommeth he the dear brother, sister, and mother of Christ, Mat. 1.2, a citizen of heaven with the apostles and prophets, Ephe. 2. yea the child of adoption and heir together with Christ in the heavenly inheritance, Rom. 8. No such children left Socrates behind him, neither yet Demosthenes, Plato, nor Cicero with all their pleasant eloquence and wisdom. No such heritage could great Alexander the Macedonian leave his posterity, neither yet Charles, Arthur, nor David” (Elizabeth, “Glass,” Folio 6v–7r).


204. See Bradbrook, “Virtue is True Nobility.”

205. In this play Helena, who is of relatively low birth but of virtuous character, and Bertram, who is of relatively high birth but of vicious character, are compared to each other in such way that we might wonder whether he is so far above her station as to make his marriage to her as unbearably painful to him as incestuous marriage would be. Helena is Bertram’s sister-by-adoption, whom Bertram’s mother the Countess would call “daughter” by transforming her into a daughter-in-law (AWW 1.3.141–156). It requires the King of France to emphasize that nobility resides in the soul, not in blood.

206. Tacitus, *Annals* 12.42. It is worth noting that Agrippina’s fourfold kinship arrangement imitates to some extent that of Roman women in general, who were regarded legally “as daughters of their husbands and sisters of their children” (Vico, *New Science*, para. 507). The arrangement was also like that of the old Roman “temple of Ceras, Liber, and Libera, the mother or the spouse, the son, and the daughter, of the Buddhick or Bacchic god” (see Del Mar, *Ancient Britain*, p. 101, citing Livy III.1v.8).

207. On this politically sensitive form of adoption (the technical term is *arrogatio*), see Hunter, *Exposition of Roman Law*, pp. 202–11. Saint Paul, among others, developed the Roman practice of adrogation of sons by their father into a powerful ideology of adoption by Christ, an adoption whose end was not so much “liberation” in the Roman juridical sense of the word as a homogenizing or leveling of all human beings under God the universal Father. The disappearance of the vestal virgins in the fourth century AD (Emperor Constantine), which was a critical moment in the history of Rome, corresponded to the formal Roman institutionalization of Christianity as the official state religion in the same century. That is why Christian nuns have many of the rituals, powers, and obligations of the vestal virgins. In the Roman ceremony by which a novice becomes a vestal, for example, the novice’s hair is shorn and the pontifex or head priest calls the novice *Amata* [loved one] and she promises to be chaste (Aulus Gellius 1.12).


210. *Domina* had been an important legal term in Roman times. It meant not only *regina*, or *rex*, but also something like "female head of the household" (*Oxford Latin Dictionary*, p. 570; on the title *domina*, see esp. Onslow, *Empress Maud*). Eventually *domina* came to mean "the [mother] superior of a nunnery," though it always retained some connotation of property ownership, as in Kersey's 1708 definition (in *Dictionarium*) of *domina* as "a Title formerly given to those honorable Women that held a Barony in their own right of inheritance."

211. "All this [throughout Geoffrey's work, about women ruling] is substantially unparalleled in early history, British or otherwise," writes Tatlock. "In Welsh history there is no hint of it, and in France, as no reader of [Shakespeare's] *Henry V* need be told, the Salic law forbade any woman to reign* (Legendsary History, p. 287).

212. According to tradition, the Salic Law forbade women to inherit in general. Originating with the Salian Franks, it was supposedly invoked in 1316 and 1322 to exclude the daughters of the Capetian Louis X, King of Navarre (1305-16) and King of France (1314-16) and of the Capetian Philip V, King of France (1316-22) from the succession to the throne. Philip VI, 1328-50, who assumed the throne in 1328 after the Capetian Charles IV, King of France (1322-28), died, was the first of the House of the Valois, which ruled France until 1589, when Henry III died and the House of Bourbon assumed power. Marguerite of Navarre was also known as Marguerite de Valois.


214. In 1533, Catherine de Médicis (1519-1589) married Henry, second son of Francis I of France, whose sister was Marguerite of Navarre. Catherine became queen of France in 1547, when Elizabeth wrote the "Glass." She had four sons, three of whom became kings of France. In the tradition of queen mothers ("jointresses"), she ruled as regent with great power during the minority of Charles IX (1560-63) and his later reign (1560-74), and was also influential over Henry III (1574-89). Though she planned the Massacre of St. Bartholomew (1572), she did not always side with the Catholics against the (Protestant) Huguenots.


217. In a letter of December 6, 1559 written to five Catholic bishops deprived of their sees for refusing to accept the new Church of England, Elizabeth refers to a tradition of British Christianity separate and independent from the Romish tradition. She mentions "the ancient monument of Gildas" (probably that sixth century Romano-British historian's *De Excidio et Conquestu Britanniae*) and such quasi-historical events as the visit to Britain of Joseph of Arimathea. Long before Augustine came to Britain, she advises the Catholic bishops, there was Christianity in Britain.
218. For remarks on these and other women listed by Bale, see my "Glossary of Proper Names in Bale," in Elizabeth's Glass.

219. 1.2.9. In the Hamlet legend Gertrude is, like the Virgin Mary and like Agrippina, related fourfold to the ruler, as we will see in chapter 5.

220. "He (she) understood the custom to be rather more fitting for men than for women." Saxo Grammaticus, Historiae Danicae, book 9; cited in Tatlock, Legendary History, p. 286.


222. Blandina's remarkable martyrdom, which took place under the Roman Emperor Marcus Aurelius in A.D. 177, is discussed by Bale in his preface to Askew's Exam., Folio 7v–9r. Askew was the religious and nationalistic model for Bale, who in his autobiographical Vocation of John Bale "casts himself as a Protestant saint" (Fairfield, John Bale, p. 141). See Beilin, "Anne Askew's Self-Portrait," pp. 80, 271 (n. 5).

223. Gwendoline and Martia are called "King" by Bale, "Conclusion," Folio 42v and 43v. Cf. OED 5:704.


225. Elizabeth publicly identified with Saint Elizabeth and other Marian figures, including the Elizabeth who was the niece of Saint Anne (of the Immaculate Conception) and the cousin of Saint Mary (of the Virgin Birth). See Strong, Cult, p. 125, and Wells, Spenser's "Faerie Queene" and the Cult of Elizabeth, p. 18.


228. See Eichmann, Kaiserkrönung 2, 94ff. By the same token, calling a person both father and son, as in the topos of the sponsa Christi, while relatively rare in the early centuries of Christianity, became more common by the twelfth century, thanks partly to the growth of Marian cults. "I am your Father, I am your Son," sang Robert Wace, the Anglo-Norman chronicler of the twelfth century. The material is collected by Mayer, "Mater et filia"; Hahn, Bibliothek der Symbole, p. 176, 81f; and Wels, Theologische Streifzüge 1, 33–51, who considers the father-son antiphrasis a kind of Sabellianism. (See Kantorowicz, King's Two Bodies, pp. 99–100.) Some critics have noted that Elizabeth Tudor was sometimes seen as the bride of Canticles and even as a sponsa Christi—Edmund Spenser, say some, linked "England's Eliza to the Spouse of Christ" (King, Tudor Royal Iconography, pp. 195, 207, 261; cf. Norbrook, Poetry, p. 84, L.S. Johnson, "Elizabeth, Bride and Queen," pp. 81–83, and R.H. Wells, Spenser's "Faerie Queene")—but none has remarked on the complete fourfold incestuous aspect of this spousehood.

229. Charles de Grassaille, Regalium Franciae 1, ius 20, 217.

230. Coquille, Oeuvres 1.3232; cited in Church, Constitutional Thought, p. 278, n.16.

231. Kantorowicz, King's Two Bodies, p. 212.


233. Godefroy, Cérémonial, p. 348; for earlier such coronations, see Dewick, ed., Coronation Book of Charles V, pp. 33, 83.


235. Fortescue, De laudibus legum Angliae, c.xiii, 30,17. Cf. Cardinal Pole's letter to Henry VIII, in which he says "Your whole reasoning comes to this conclusion that you consider the Church a corpus politicum" (Pole, Ad Henricum VIII, in Rocaberti, Bibliotheca, xviii,204, cited in Kantorowicz, King's Two Bodies, p. 229n.

236. The spouse is intragenerational insofar as he/she is, like oneself, the daughter/son of one's parents (in-law), which suggests that marriage is so egalitarian as to be incestuous.
In *The Elementary Structures of Kinship*, Lévi-Strauss writes, "Marriage is an arbitration between two loves, parental and conjugal. [The two] are both forms of love, and the instant the marriage takes place, considered in isolation, the two meet and merge; love has filled the ocean. Their meeting is doubtless merely a prelude to their substitution for one another, the performance of a sort of chassé-croisé. But to intersect they must at least momentarily be joined, and it is this which in all social thought makes marriage a sacred mystery. At this moment, all marriage verges on incest" (Lévi-Strauss, *Elementary Structures*, p. 489).

By *chassé-croisé*, Lévi-Strauss suggests a chiasmatic situation of reciprocal and simultaneous exchanges having for their end no result.


238. Elizabeth, "Glass," Folio 19r–v: "Alas, yea, for Thou hast broken the kindred of my old father, calling me daughter of adoption."

239. *Letters*, p. 47. Sir Henry Sidney had married Mary Dudley (sister of Queen Elizabeth's favorite, the Earl of Leicester) and fathered Philip (the poet, statesman, and soldier who later fell out of the Queen's favor when he remonstrated against her proposed marriage with the Duc d'Alençon).

240. Sometimes entitled "On Monsieur's Departure" (in *Poems*, p. 5), this poem was probably written about Francis, Duc d'Alençon in 1582, after marriage negotiations had ended. See Pringle, *Portrait*, p. 44.


242. It is a commonplace in the current literature that "the Reformation had terminated the cult of Mary in England; to a significant extent the 'cult of Elizabeth' replaced it" (Jardine, "Still Harping," p. 177). But the real issue here involves the extent itself and the precise mode of transformation. On the cult of Elizabeth as the virgin queen, though without reference to fourfold kinship, see Montrose, "'Shaping Fantasies,'" and Schleiner, "Divina virago." On visual representations and icons of Elizabeth as the Virgin Mary, see Strong, *Cult of Elizabeth*, esp. p. 66 (on the "Sieve Portrait" of Elizabeth).

243. For the text of John Dowland, the Elizabethan lutenist, see Yates, *Astraea*, p. 78.

244. Chamberlain, *Sayings of Queen Elizabeth*, pp. 61, 68.


247. Cited in Paul Johnson, *Elizabeth*. In response to the House of Commons' urging her in 1559 to marry—because "nothing can be more repugnant to the common good, than to see a Princess... lead a single life, like a Vestal Nunne"—Elizabeth said: "I have made choyce of this kinde of life, which is moste free, and agreeable for such humane affaires as may tend to his [God's] service.... To conclude, I am already bound unto an Husband, which is the Kingdome of England... (And therewithall, stretching out her hand, shee shewed them the Ring with which she was given in marriage, and inaugurated to her Kingdome, in expresse and solemne terms.) And reproach mee so no more, (quoth shee) that I have no children: for every one of you, and as many are English, are my Children" (Camden, *Annales*, bk. 1, 26). John King points out that the association of the ring with Elizabeth's marriage to England was important as late as Elizabeth's approach to death, when the coronation ring had to be cut off her finger; this was interpreted as a sign of "the coming dissolution of her 'marriage with her kingdome'" (John King, "Queen Elizabeth I," pp. 33–34).

248. *Letters*, pp. 27, 188.

249. *Letters*, p. 223. Compare how, on receipt of the news of the death of Anjou, one of her so-called suitors, Elizabeth wrote to his mother, Catherine de Médicis, Queen Mother of
France, that "you will find me the faithfulest daughter and sister that ever Princes had" (letter of July 1584, in Letters).


253. With Bale's view compare that of Pope Nicholas I, who argues that "one ought to treat a godparent like a parent, even though the relationship is spiritual and not one of blood. That there cannot be marriage in these relationships is for the same reason that the Roman law does not allow marriage between those one adopts and one's own children" (Nicholas, *Responses to the Questions of the Bulgars*, sec. 2, in Mansi, *Sacrorum 15*, 402).

254. *King Henry the Eighth*, 5.4.9. Elishabet, from the name of the priest Aaron's wife (Exod. 6:23) and of the woman in Luke, has been interpreted as "God is fullness," "God of the oath," "God's oath," "God is an oath" (by which one swears), and "consecrated to God." Cf. Gesenius, *Hebrew and English Lexicon*, p. 45, and Bale, "Epistle Dedicatory," Folio 9r: "Elizabeth in the Hebrew is as much to say in the Latin as, Dei mei requies; in English, 'The rest of my God.'"


256. The last scene of *Henry VIII* shows the Duchess of Norfolk and the Marchioness Dorset (the baby princess' two godmothers) substituting for her biological mother (the absent Queen Anne Bullen) who is barely mentioned (5.5.7). And it shows King Henry VIII, presumably the biological father, asking the princess' godfather, Cranmer (5.3.162), "What is [the infant's] name?" (5.5.10). Elizabeth's verifiable gossipred has replaced her consanguineous family; as Bale would have it, Elizabeth is one of "many noble women, not rising of flesh and blood . . . but of that mighty living spirit of His which vanquisheth death, hell, and the devil" (Bale, "Conclusion," Folio 46v).

257. Bale, "Epistle Dedicatory," Folio 9v: "The spirit of the eternal son of God, Jesus Christ, be always to your excellent grace assistant that ye may send forth more such wholesome fruits of soul and become a nourishing mother." In the *Monument of Matrones*, which includes Elizabeth's *Godly Medytacyon*, Bentley praises Elizabeth for styling herself "like a loving mother, and a tender nurse, giving my foster-milke, the foode of thy [God's] word and Gospell abundantly to all" (Bentley, *Monument*, 284v; King, *Tudor Royal Iconography*, p. 255).

258. "Have I conceived all this people? have I begotten them, that thou shouldest say unto me. Carry them in thy bosom, as a nursing father beareth the sucking child, unto the land which thou swarest unto their fathers?" (Num. 11:12).

259. Jardine would insist, to the contrary, that "Elizabeth I failed to make other than the impact of a token woman on the patriarchal attitudes of the early modern period" (Daughters, p. 195). I should argue, however, that the parentarchy under Elizabeth did not remain as patriarchal as it had been, that it took on and afterwards kept certain aspects of matriarchy. But the question as to whether Elizabeth's parentarchy was essentially patriarchal or matriarchal is really a red herring. The more important issue here concerns the fate of the old parentarchy itself: Whether male or female, during the Elizabethan period its definite undoing began. The result was the modern English nation state, which laid the basis for an eventual "liberation" of males and females alike.

263. See Perrens, *Libertins*. 
Notes to pages 95–97 : 241

264. James Otis; quoted in Morison, American People, p. 205.
265. Cf. “Therefore shall a man leave his father and his mother” (Gen 2:24). So sang
The Animals in San Francisco’s spectacular Cow Palace in 1966.

Chapter 5

1. “Tragedy,” writes Cavell, “is the result, and the study, of a burden of knowledge, of
an attempt to deny the all but undeniable, that your imagination has elicited the desire of a beautiful young woman, that however exceptional you may be you are a member of a human society, that your children are yours” (Cavell, “Hamlet’s Burden”).
2. 2.5.2.
3. 1.2.205–6.
4. Francisco Sánchez, a distant cousin of Montaigne, wrote Quod Nihil Scitur [Why Nothing Can Be Known], in 1576 and published it in 1581.
5. For Montaigne, the so-called certainty of consanguinity boils down to mere chance
masquerading as natural inclination or likeness. In “Of the Affection of Fathers for Their Children,” for example, Montaigne writes about the kinship of fathers, specifically, to their children: “Herodotus relates of a certain district of Libya that intercourse with women is promiscuous, but that the child, when he has the strength to walk, finds to be his father the one toward whom in the crowd natural inclination bears his first step. I believe that this must lead to frequent mistakes [mescontes, or false accounts].” The reason we usually give for fathers loving their children—“that we begot them [pour les avoir engendrez], wherefore we call them our other selves”—may pass in the case of those “children of the mind [enfantes de nostre esprit]” that are essays in fiction or philosophy. But in the case of human children, that reason is insufficient and is based in fictional tales only, or contes (Montaigne, Essais, in Oeuvres, ed. Thibaudet and Rat, bk. 2, chap. 8, pp. 379–80). Montaigne refers here to Herodotus, Hist. 4:180: “These people enjoy their women in common. They do not live in couples at all but fuck in the mass, like cattle. When a woman’s child is rather older, in three months’ space the men come together, and whichever of the men the child most resembles, his the child is regarded as being” (Herodotus, History, trans. Grene, p. 347). “Like father, like son” is the measure of legitimacy.
6. 1.2.107–8. Unless otherwise indicated, citations in this chapter are from the Jenkins
edition. Abbreviations for other editions I will cite are as follows: Q1, the first, or “bad,” quarto (1603, printed by Valentine Simmes); Q2, the second, or “good” quarto (1604/05), printed by James Roberts; F, or first Folio (1623). See J. Dover Wilson, Manuscript of Shakespeare’s “Hamlet”; and Werstine, “Textual Mystery of Hamlet.”
7. See, for example, D’Anglure, Esquimaux, and cf. the various spiritual kinships
endorsed by the Catholic church, including monachism (where the status of Brother supersedes that of brother) and the gossipred. On the gossipred as such, see Gratian, Decretum, 30; Rolandus, Summa, 144–45; Stephan of Tournai, Summa, p. 241; Feije, De impedimentis, chap. 16; Council of Trullo (a.d. 692), in Coleccion de canones; and C. E. Smith, Papal Enforcement, pp. 48–51. For the anthropological view of gossipred, see Pitt-Rivers, “Spiritual Kinship,” p. 55, and “Pseudo-Kinship,” p. 408; Gudeman, “Compadrazago”; Mintz and Wolf, “Ritual Co-Godparentage”; and Anderson, “Comparaggio.”
8. Montaigne, who was himself put out to nurse with a peasant woman and had sponsors from the same class, is skeptical about the preeminent importance and authority of the consanguineous bond between human parent and human child, i.e., of the “literal” bond between a genitor or genetrix and offspring (see his essay “Of the Affection of Fathers for Their Children” [1578–80]). He refers to instances where nurse mothers even develop for